Marie Curie

EU High Level Scientific Conference Series

MULTIDIMENSIONAL TRANSLATION

Audiovisual Translation Scenarios

Copenhagen 1-5 May 2006

Proceedings

edited by
Mary Carroll (Berlin)
Heidrun Gerzymisch-Arbogast (Saarbrücken)
Sandra Nauert (Saarbrücken)

Advanced Translation Research Center (ATRC)
Saarland University
Germany
Proceedings
EU High Level Scientific Conferences, Marie Curie Euroconferences
*MuTra*: Audiovisual Translation Scenarios
Copenhagen 1-5 May 2006
The Faculty of Humanities, University of Copenhagen

Editors
Mary Carroll (Berlin)
Heidrun Gerzymisch-Arbogast (Saarbrücken)
Sandra Nauert (Saarbrücken)

Organization
MuTra 2005 was organized by the Advanced Translation Research Center (ATRC), Saarland University/Germany
(https://www.euroconferences.info)

Scientific Committee
Gerhard Budin
Mary Carroll
Jan Engerg
Heidrun Gerzymisch-Arbogast
Henrik Gottlieb
Valda Rudzisa
Jörg Scherer
Klaus Schubert
Kristina Szabari

ISBN 978-3-00-022141-5

© Copyright 2006-2007 by MuTra
Permission to make digital or hard copies of part or all of the papers in these proceedings for personal or classroom use is granted without fee provided that copies are not made or distributed for profit or commercial advantage and that copies refer to this copyright and cite the original publication in the MuTra Conference Proceedings. Abstracting with credit is permitted. Authors may reuse any portion of their work, without fee, in future works of the Author's own, including books, lectures and presentations in all media, or to post author-prepared versions of the work covered by this copyright in a personal collection on their own Home Page and on a publicly accessible server provided the MuTra copyright and publication are cited.
All other rights, including those of translation into foreign languages, are reserved.
# Table of Contents

## Part I: Multilingual Subtitling Scenarios

Stephen Armstrong & Colm Caffrey & Marian Flanagan (Dublin)  
*Translating DVD subtitles from English-German and English-Japanese using Example-Based Machine Translation*  
1

Eduard Bartoll (Barcelona)  
*Subtitling multilingual films*  
14

Marcella de Marco (Roehampton)  
*Multiple portrayals of gender in cinematographic and audiovisual translation discourse*  
19

Lena Hamaidia (Sheffield)  
*Read my Lips: Gaps in meaning between spoken and subtitled dialog.*  
34

Jenny Mattson (Göteborg)  
*Linguistic variation in subtitling. The subtitling of swearwords and discourse makers on public television, commercial television and DVD*  
47

Sara Ramos Pinto (Lisbon)  
*Theoretical Texts vs Subtitling. Linguistic variation in a polymedial context.*  
57

Stavroula Sokoli (Athens)  
*Learning via Subtitling (LvS): A tool for the creation of foreign language learning activities based on film subtitling*  
66

## Part II: Multidimensional Translation Contexts

Mario de Bortoli (Roehampton) & Fabio Minazzi (Milan)  
*Localization of rich-media interactive ads*  
74

Yves Gambier (Turku)  
*Multimodality and Audiovisual Translation*  
91

Minako O’Hagan  
*TeletranslationRevisited: Futurama for Screen Translators?*  
99

Christopher Taylor (Trieste)  
*“I knew he’d say that!” A consideration of the predictability of language use in film*  
111

Francisco Utray Delegado (Madrid)  
*Universal Design for digital television in Spain*  
122

Juan Antonio Prieto Velasco & María Isabel Tercedor Sánchez & Clara Inés Lopez Rodriguez (Granada)  
*Using Multimedia Materials in the Teaching of Scientific and Technical Translators*  
133

Juan Francisco Lòpez Vera (Barcelona)  
*Translating Audio description Scripts: The Way Forward?*  
148

## Part III: Multidimensional Interpreting Contexts Beyond

Sabine Braun (Surrey)  
*Multimedia communication technologies and their impact on interpreting*  
158

Pilar Orero (Barcelona)  
*Voice-over: A case of Hyper reality*  
173
Stephen Armstrong & Colm Caffrey & Marian Flanagan (Dublin)

Translating DVD subtitles from English-German and English-Japanese using Example-Based Machine Translation

Abstract

Due to limited budgets and an ever-diminishing time-frame for the production of subtitles for movies released in cinema and DVD, there is a compelling case for a technology-based translation solution for subtitles (O’Hagan, 2003; Carroll, 2004; Gambier, 2005). In this paper we describe how an Example-Based Machine Translation (EBMT) approach to the translation of English DVD subtitles into German and Japanese can aid the subtitler. Our research focuses on an EBMT tool that produces fully automated translations, which in turn can be edited if required. We have chosen these language pairs as both are commercially significant.¹ We will seed the EBMT system with a corpus consisting of existing human translations from DVD to automatically produce high quality subtitles for audio-visual content. To our knowledge this is the first time that any EBMT approach has been used with DVD subtitle translation. Schäler et al. (2003: 88) propose that “the time is ripe for the transformation of EBMT into demonstrators, and eventually viable products”. We attempt to answer their call with an EBMT approach to the translation of subtitles.

1 Introduction

One widely publicized example of poorly received subtitles is the translation of the Japanese subtitles of the film Lord of the Rings: The Fellowship of the Ring. Complaints about the quality of the subtitles from fans led to petitions being sent to the film’s Japanese distributor and the director, Peter Jackson. The reason for this dip in translation quality was put down to time pressures imposed on the subtitler, as well as a lack of background knowledge needed to fully appreciate the film and its language (O’Hagan, 2003). This example clearly highlights how film subtitling is often dictated by the more lucrative market-driven component of the entertainment business. In this paper we firstly look at the background surrounding the need for research into the domain of DVD subtitle translation. Section 3 looks in detail at the reasons why we have introduced EBMT into this research, and also focuses on how EBMT compares to other translation technology. Section 4 describes the architecture of our EBMT

¹ Germany is traditionally a dubbing country unlike Japan, but DVD releases require subtitles in German.
system, including the make-up of our purpose-built corpus. Focusing on evaluation methods employed to test our system and current work-in-progress, Section 5 discusses our chosen evaluation method for this stage of research and presents system output, together with comments on the quality. Following on from this, Section 6 outlines future developments and the next stage of evaluation.

2 Motivation for Research

2.1 Research Background

Our research focuses on the feasibility of using EBMT to translate subtitles from English into a different target language. This research has come about due to our awareness of the pressures subtitlers are put under on a day-to-day basis, given the huge increase in DVD production since their introduction in 1997, and the work required to produce the required multilingual subtitle translations. Over one billion DVDs are produced per annum in the United States alone. The demand on subtitlers to produce good-quality subtitles is at a record high, and carrying out research into how technology may assist the subtitler can only be advantageous to all concerned. Anecdotal evidence from the European and East-Asian markets suggests that subtitler rates, particularly for the DVD market, are continuing to drop across the board, driving experienced subtitlers out of the market while opening opportunities to those new to the profession; this has implications for quality.

Our aims are: to produce good quality DVD subtitles in German and Japanese translated from English; this will in turn assist the subtitler with the translation process, thus speeding up the process. The subtitles produced will be of a high standard, which means saving time and costs for the subtitling company, and relieving the pressures put on subtitlers to produce subtitles given the unreasonable time-frame and budget available.3

2.2 Languages

The two languages chosen for the first stage of research are German and Japanese. Both of these countries display extremely healthy economies in relation to DVD sales. In 2004, sales of DVDs in Germany grew by 63%, with 464 million units in total sold in Europe alone.4 In 2003, DVD revenues exceeded cinema ticket sales in Japan.5 These are also important languages in the field of subtitling. Japan is classified as a subtitling country, meaning all audiovisual releases will contain subtitles. In contrast, Germany is primarily a dubbing country. However, all DVD releases in Germany are required to have German subtitles. A further rationale for using these two languages is their dissimilarity, which therefore allows us to fully test the applicability of EBMT for translating subtitles, as well as the robustness and the scalability of the system. Both languages have been the focus of previous MT research

---

3 There were heated discussions on the unreasonable time-frame and budget available for DVD subtitling at the International Conference on Audiovisual Translation: In So Many Words, held at the University of London from 6–7 February 2004. These were echoed also in the Languages and the Media conference held in Berlin, 3–5 November, 2004.
(Carl & Way, 2003), however, neither have previously been used in the combined area of EBMT (which is itself a relatively new research area of MT) and subtitle translation.

3 Why EBMT?

First off, it might be better to address the question: “why Machine Translation (MT)?” Subtitles can be said to inherit some of the traits of what we call in the MT world a ‘controlled language’. Usually a controlled language is characterized by simplified grammar and style rules, and a simplified and controlled vocabulary set. Certain constraints are imposed on the subtitler, such as the number of characters allowed per line, which may result in the subtitler choosing a more simplistic syntactic structure, while still conveying the original meaning. In addition to this, subtitles can be seen as a kind of transcription of spoken dialog (sometimes complete with obvious interjections such as ums and ahs). Both these factors infer that we should know a good deal about what kind of text is to be expected in subtitling, and that can only be positive for any translation task, including MT, as the more linguistic knowledge we have about the source language, the better the translation should be.

3.1 RBMT vs. EBMT

Some research has previously been carried out using Rule-Based MT (RBMT) for the translation of both closed captions (Popowich et al., 2000) and subtitles (MUsIST Project) to varying degrees of success. However, recent research and development in MT show there is widespread belief that rule-based systems will never be good enough to warrant serious consideration in the domain of a controlled language. This is mainly due to lack of robustness and lack of coverage. With regards to subtitling and the similarities it shares with a controlled language, simpler syntactic structures (canonical forms) are often preferred as they tend to make sentences shorter, and thus more easily and quickly understood. Punctuation also differs greatly, and the subtitler must follow a number of rules which are not necessarily the same in natural language use. Some of these rules include the addition of ‘sequence dots’ at the end of a line, indicating the sentence is incomplete, italics are used to indicate foreign words, and subtitles only typed in uppercase are usually used when transferring a display, such as a written signpost. RBMT assumes that the input sentence will be grammatically correct, however, subtitles will vary greatly from grammatically correct structures to sentences ridden with ellipses. They will also contain plenty of slang words which may not exist in the hand-coded RBMT dictionary. As EBMT relies on previously translated examples, it should be able to cope with both problems mentioned above.

3.2 TM vs. EBMT

Translation memory (TM) systems have become ubiquitous in making the translation process more efficient, and have been adopted by many of the big players in the localization industry. However, there is still an unwarranted tendency for Joe-Freelancer to be wary of said systems: it should be noted that these systems do not translate, they propose previously suggested human-translated ‘examples’ from a database, and it is up to the human to either accept or reject the suggested match. In other words, TM can basically be considered as a sophisticated search-and-replace engine (Schäler et al., 2003), and needs a human presence at all times during the translation process.

Drawing some parallels with TM but with some distinct differences is the notion of EBMT which goes back as far as the 1980s (Nagao, 1984). Here, like with TM systems, we
rely on a bilingual corpus, aligned at sentential level. In addition to this, EBMT goes a step further and goes beneath sentence level, ‘chunking’ each sentence pair and producing an alignment of sub-sentential chunks. Going beyond the sentence means we should have more scope for capturing useful matches which may be missed otherwise. EBMT is based on the principle of recombining these chunks to produce an automatic translation.

4 Our System

Our first step was to gather together a suitable corpus (described in section 4.1). We clean the data, split it into sentences, storing these sentences for later use. Our alignment program is run on these files, which results in a sententially-aligned bilingual corpus. The next step is to split sentences up into smaller units. For this we implement the Marker Hypothesis, which states that ‘all natural languages are marked for complex syntactic structure at surface form by a closed set of specific lexemes and morphemes which appear in a limited set of grammatical contexts and which signal that context’ (Green, 1979). Closed-class sets of words can predict or indicate what word classification will appear next. This is the basis for our system, and how we break up sentences and recombine them to generate new output, for example:

**German subtitle:**

EN: Did <PRON> you ever consult <PRON> that private detective?
DE: Waren <PRON> sie <ADV> eigentlich <PRON> bei <PRON> diesem Privatdetektiv?

The resulting sub-sentential chunks would be the following, as chunks must contain at least one non-marker word. When a marker word is followed by another marker word, these two words are combined into one segment.

<PRON> that private detective? ⇔ <PRON> bei diesem Privatdetektiv?

These smaller units are stored in the corpus as aligned segments, so if an input sentence cannot be matched against a complete sentence stored in the parallel corpus, the input sentence is then broken up into smaller segments or chunks, and the system then checks if these input chunks are already stored in the corpus. If so, the corresponding segment is retrieved and recombined with other segments or words to produce suitable output in a different language.

We use a number of statistically and linguistically motivated methods to find the most probable matches and recombine them to produce a successful translation. We also use a modular architecture, which means it should be easy to adapt the system to new language pairs. All that has to be changed is the bilingual corpus, along with a new set of marker words for that particular language pair. Figure 1 is a diagram to explain what happens when an English sentence is entered into the EBMT system.
4.1 Corpus

We concluded that the best way to do this was to build up a collection of DVDs which contain both English-German and English-Japanese subtitles. We extract these subtitles to text files using the freely available software SubRip, which gives us the subtitle text, along with their respective TC-in / TC-out (the time code at which the subtitle begins and ends).

So far we have extracted subtitles from almost 50 full-length features for the language pair English/German, which amounts to 64,996 sentences for English, and 61,292 sentences for German. Using the set of corpus linguistic tools, WordSmith, we were able to extract some interesting statistics from our own corpus. We calculated the average sentence length for both languages to be a little less than 6 words. Contrast this with the average length of sentences in for example the Europarl\(^6\) corpus, which we calculated to be 24 words per sentence, and we can clearly see that our presuppositions about the language-constraints imposed on subtitler hold true. We plan to conduct a number of experiments on our corpus in an attempt to prove that the majority of language in the domain of film dialogs is in fact

---

\(^6\) The Europarl corpus consists of thousands of sentences from proceedings in the European Parliament, and has been used in many EBMT research projects.
repetitive; from this we can deduce that there are plenty of reusable pre-translated chunks stored in memory that are available to the subtitler at the touch of a button.

Corpus collection for Japanese is moving along a little slower due to a number of factors. In Europe, DVDs with Japanese subtitles are a lot more difficult to come by as they are usually only sold in Japan (even Amazon.co.jp does not deliver these region-protected DVDs outside of Japan). Moreover, the OCR component of SubRip is not optimized to recognize Japanese characters. This means a lot of the work usually done automatically has to be done by hand, and takes hours rather than minutes to extract the subtitles for one movie. To date our English-Japanese corpus contains in excess of 10,000 sentence pairs, and will be analysed in a similar fashion to the English-German corpus.

4.2 System Requirements

In order to achieve these aims the system needs to meet particular criteria associated with any type of automated translation technology.

4.2.1 Acceptability

The system must produce subtitles, which are considered acceptable by the target-language audience. This acceptability level will be evaluated in the real-user evaluation pilot-study outlined in 6.1.

4.2.2 Readability

We will measure how readable the subtitles are by conducting some readability tests and also asking the opinion of participants of the pilot-study.

4.2.3 Grammaticality

The grammaticality of the target language is related to the acceptable level of subtitles. It is an important factor when evaluating the quality of the output. Given the fact the subtitles tend to be short, this will reduce the grammatical errors, which an MT system might have found difficult to deal with in the past. Short sentences are more likely to contain a less complicated grammatical structure than a longer sentence containing more than one clause. Thus this makes it much easier for a system to parse a short sentence correctly. It can also be the case that subtitles are not full sentences, leaving out the subject for example. This may be of benefit to the EBMT system, given the fact EBMT works on aligned sentences and segments of sentences previously translated by humans. These segments or ‘chunks’ could prove to be repetitive.

4.2.4 Efficiency

We aim to design a system that is efficient both in terms of speed and quality. The system is being used to translate DVD subtitles, so it is not real-time translation. That said, time is of essence when translating numerous DVDs, and therefore is still a high priority. Our EBMT system is programmed in Java, which is very efficient on memory.
5 Evaluation

5.1 Evaluation Methods

Real-user evaluation methods are the only reliable way of testing whether our system is working at a level, which would be suitable to produce subtitles for commercial markets, and accepted by the target audience. We are aware of previous evaluation studies involving web-based surveys by users of subtitles, for example the BBC ‘Click Online’ trials, but to our knowledge no real-user evaluations have been carried out before in the domain of EBMT automated subtitles, and within a home-entertainment setting.

User evaluation is essentially split into two types – formative and summative. Formative evaluation takes place during the development process, and is used to detect potential problems before the system is actually implemented (Preece, 1993). In contrast to this, summative evaluation is carried out when the system is finished (ibid.). This type of evaluation ensures the final system design is up to standard and is not used “to shape the design and development processes” (Landauer, 1997). In this paper we present formative evaluation results, which give us important input for improving the system. Other types of evaluation for our system include a pilot study within an audio-visual setting and the use of summative evaluation techniques, which will be carried out at a later stage of this study.

It is important to point out that the evaluation carried out at this stage of the research is preliminary work and at this stage no generalizations regarding the quality of our machine-translated subtitles can be made. These results aim to highlight what we need to do in order to improve the system. The evaluation presented here involved generating 2000 German sentences from our EBMT system. The Japanese system is not yet fully up and running, but will be included in our next stage of evaluation. From this German test set, we then randomly chose 200 sentences, and split these up into four groups of 50. The aim was to evaluate the intelligibility and accuracy of the automated German subtitles, by simply reading the MT produced subtitles printed on paper, and in no particular order. These automatic subtitles were from a selection of 30 DVD films. This type of formative evaluation, by simply reading the text and giving it a score is following Machine Translation evaluation protocol. It is a harsh way of evaluating subtitles, given the fact they are usually presented on a screen with the added influence of a picture and sound. However, it is also a very good method of highlighting areas we need to concentrate on in order to improve our system and the quality of the output. We would predict that the next stage of evaluation will benefit from this stage, with the introduction of audio-visual elements. It is often the case with a subtitled film that only a certain percentage of the understanding of a film is based on an understanding of the text alone (Gottlieb, forthcoming). There are times when a viewer may miss a subtitle for reasons relating to, for example, the image, reading speed or lack of understanding. However, the overall understanding of the film is not generally affected.

The intelligibility and accuracy scales were based on work by van Slype (1980: 7) and by Nagao as described in Jordan et al. (1993: 55), taken from Wagner (1998: 94). We approached intelligibility and accuracy in the following ways. According to Kenny (personal communication), “it should be possible to evaluate intelligibility without any reference whatsoever to the source text, so accuracy should not come into it”; a text can be completely intelligible but bear little resemblance to the source text. This sometimes happens in human translation, and we call it ‘translation by invention’. She also made a point regarding measuring the accuracy of our output (ibid.) “accuracy, on the other hand, should be

ascertained independently from intelligibility.” Tables 1 & 2 explain the scales and the range of scores possible.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Intelligibility Scale*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 gut verständlich</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 ziemlich verständlich</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 schwer verständlich</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 unverständlich</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*English translation of the German given in Appendix A

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Accuracy Scale**</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Satz übermittelt die Bedeutung des englischen Satzes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Satz übermittelt im großen und ganzen die Bedeutung des englischen Satzes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Satz übermittelt die Bedeutung des englischen Satzes nicht angemessen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Satz übermittelt die Bedeutung des englischen Satzes nicht</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tab. 1: Intelligibility Scale

Tab. 2: Accuracy Scale

Therefore, when measuring the intelligibility of our automated output sentences, the participants were told to only refer to the German output, and when evaluating accuracy, they used both the original English source text (DVD intralingual subtitles) and the EBMT-generated German subtitles. We wanted German native speakers to carry out the evaluation, therefore ensuring that the EBMT subtitles were evaluated to a high standard. We emailed the evaluation sheet to 13 participants and received back 8 responses. All participants are above the age of 20, their mother tongue is German, and they have all completed a third-level education course. Table 3 shows the distribution of the sentence test sets among the 8 subjects. This shows that not all sentences were evaluated by all subjects, but it is possible to compare some responses between pairs of subjects for sets 1 – 3.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Test Set Number</th>
<th>Number of Subjects</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tab. 3: Distribution of test sets among the subjects

The idea behind this type of evaluation is to judge the quality of the subtitles purely based on the text. There are no audio-visual elements included, allowing the results from this type of evaluation to help feed into the system development.
5.2 Results

The sample size of our volunteers has led us to present the results of the evaluation in a qualitative and interpretive framework rather than quantitatively, showing positive aspects of EBMT subtitles, and where improvements are required. These focus on different areas, including creativity of the system within the recombination stage, as well as some errors, efficient areas of chunking in the system, along with mismatched chunks.

Table 4 presents an example where the system has given suitable output notably different to the human created subtitles.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English Original Subtitle</th>
<th>Shh, shh, shh! Alright children, now quiet.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>German Original Subtitle</td>
<td>Okay, Kinder, nun seid ruhig.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German EBMT Subtitle</td>
<td>Scht, scht, scht! Gut Kinder, mehr Ruhe!</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Tab. 4: Sentence 9, Set 1**

We can see that the system has suitably translated the “shh” utterance as “scht” and instead of the adjectival form of “quiet”, as chosen by the human subtitler, the system opted for the nominal form. Both German sentences make sense when read alone, although the EBMT sentence may benefit more from the contextualization that would be offered by the extra semiotic channels which would be present in an audiovisual evaluation. The sentence also provides proof towards the subjective nature of the evaluation process, as can be seen from Table 5. One plausible reason for Subject B’s low scores could be the lack of context mentioned above.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EBMT Output Subtitle</th>
<th>Intelligibility</th>
<th>Accuracy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Subject A</td>
<td>Subject B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>scht, scht, scht!</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>gut kinder, mehr ruhe! (Set 1 Sentence 9)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Tab. 5: Evaluation scores for Sentence 9 Set 1**

The system’s creativity can also be seen in the following translation of the English subtitle “That’s the last one”, which in the human subtitle reads “Aber es war das letzte Mal” and the system translated as “Das ist das Letzte”. In this instance, the EBMT output may seem like a more accurate translation, though it should be made clear that the lack of context also works against the original subtitles when seen in a vacuum as they are now.

An interesting example of the results we can get from the system is the translation of “I got the suitcase” (Sentence 40 Set 4), which in the original German subtitle is translated as “Ich habe den Koffer”. The EBMT translation gives a more colloquial “Ich hab den Koffer”, which could be seen as a more ‘equivalent’ translation of the colloquial “I got” we find in the
English subtitle. Table 6 shows examples of how the system correctly translates short subtitles, demonstrating the system’s ability to segment sentences correctly and to reuse the chunks for different input.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English Original Subtitle</th>
<th>What’s the matter, baby?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>German Original Subtitle</td>
<td>Was ist los, Baby?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German EBMT Subtitle</td>
<td>Was ist los, Baby?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English Original Subtitle</td>
<td>I don’t know</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German Original Subtitle</td>
<td>Ich weiß nicht.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German EBMT Subtitle</td>
<td>Ich weiß nicht.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English Original Subtitle</td>
<td>I was grateful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German Original Subtitle</td>
<td>Ich war dankbar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German EBMT Subtitle</td>
<td>Ich war dankbar</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Tab. 6: short segments translated correctly*

Given the fact we are in the first stages of evaluation, we are aware of some problems that exist with the chunking algorithm, the recombination stage and the dictionary generated during runtime. The evaluation has helped us address lexical errors in the system, such as missing words and mistranslations, both of which can be seen in Table 7 below. We see that some words, like “dig” and “wide”, are apparently not being found in the dictionary, where “as” in mistranslated as “ace”.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English Original Subtitle</th>
<th>to dig it twice as wide.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>German Original Subtitle</td>
<td>Doppelt so groß graben.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German EBMT Subtitle</td>
<td>An dig sie zweimal ace wide.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Tab. 7: Sentence 43, Set 2*

Problems with the chunking phase of the system have also become evident, where a chunk from the English subtitle is mismatched with a chunk from the German sentence, as in the example given in Table 8.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English Original Subtitle</th>
<th>Now, Mr. Ewell, can you...</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>German Original Subtitle</td>
<td>Nun, Mr. Ewell, können sie...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German EBMT Subtitle</td>
<td>Nun, ich habe, können sie...</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Tab. 8: sentence 44, Set 1*
Here we see that “Mr. Ewell” has been falsely aligned with the chunk “ich habe”, which has wrongly replaced Mr. Ewell in the EBMT output. This sentence scored a 3 for intelligibility (see Table 1) from both subjects and a 3 from one and a 4 from the other for accuracy (see Tab. 2).

6 Future Work

6.1 Pilot Study

Our next stage of evaluation will involve a pilot study into the acceptance of EBMT subtitles. A selection of short clips, subtitled in German, will be shown to native German speakers. The clips will consist of segments from English and Japanese language films, helping us ascertain whether source language knowledge has an effect on the acceptability levels of EBMT subtitles.

The subtitled clips will be shown to participants and they will be asked to evaluate the subtitles. Some clips will present a random mixture of EBMT subtitles and human output, while others will be subtitled entirely with EBMT output and others with only human output. The random mixture will allow us, but not the viewer, to know which subtitles are human produced and which are not. It will enable us to note any major differences in their acceptability. Questionnaires and retrospective interviews will be carried out with participants to garner their opinions on the subtitle quality and acceptability. A screen capture button will enable participants to take a freeze-frame still of any sections of a clip they find surprising or of poor quality and will be a useful reminder for the interview stage.

6.2 Corpus selection and Correlation with Automatic MT Metrics

We intend to carry out an investigation into the effects the corpus used to train our EBMT system has on the quality of the subtitles produced. To do this, our system will be trained on a variety of corpora, including subtitles only, bonus material only, a combination of the two, as well as the use of heterogeneous material (Armstrong, et al., forthcoming). This will help to clarify whether it is more effective to train the system on a smaller amount of specific data, or a large amount of heterogeneous data not specific to subtitles. Within the EBMT community there is a divided opinion about the effectiveness of using either heterogeneous or homogeneous source material (cf. Denoual, 2005). The output will be evaluated using both human evaluators and MT metrics. One commonly used MT metric we will employ is BLEU (Papineni et al., 2002), which is based on the idea of measuring the translation closeness between a candidate translation and a set of reference translations with a numerical metric. A BLEU score is given between 0 and 1, with a score of 1 indicating a perfect match between the output translation and (parts of) the reference translation(s). MT experts treat the notion of a “gold standard” translation as normal practice, comparing the system output against this reference translation. The benefit of comparing both sets of results will show the real need for human evaluation of MT output in the audio-visual domain.

6.3 Showcase

We plan to showcase a working demo of our system at a conference in October of this year. This will allow people to see for themselves the quality of the EBMT subtitles and envisage ways in which the technology could be applied to the field of audio-visual translation.
7 Conclusion

In this paper we outlined the context in which the research direction was taken and our procedure for developing a tool to be used within the domain of subtitle translation. We also outlined how we intend to build a robust system incorporating the user evaluation results as an insight into how to improve the overall system, and thereby producing better quality subtitles. Our research is well motivated, given the current difficulties the subtitling industry is facing in relation to unrealistic time frames and decreasing budgets, leading to increased difficulties in attracting highly-trained staff. Our approach to this research is novel, as there are currently no available commercial EBMT systems. This could open up a new direction between audiovisual translation and technology.

8 References


Appendix A

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Intelligibility Scale*</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Easily comprehensible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Comprehensible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Difficult to comprehend</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Incomprehensible</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Accuracy Scale**       |  |  |
|------------------------|------------------|
| 1                      | German sentence fully conveys the meaning of the English sentence |
| 2                      | On the whole, the German sentence conveys the meaning of the English sentence |
| 3                      | German sentences does not adequately convey the meaning of the English sentence |
| 4                      | German sentence does not convey the meaning of the English sentence |
Subtitling multilingual films

Contents

1 The translation of films with more than one language
2 Subtitling dialects and sociolects
3 Subtitling speech impediments
4 Conclusions
5 References

Abstract

How to translate films in which more than one language appears is an interesting question to a translator who may not have the full range of possible solutions at hand. Although many approaches to this problem have been advanced, not all offer clear solutions. Of interest are problems relating to the analysis of what the translators have done, and with what quality to decide whether their solutions are satisfactory and what could be done if they are not. It is also interesting to explore if there could be a general solution applicable to more than one case. In this article I will deal not only with these possible solutions for translation when faced with more than one language in the source, but also with what might be done with the use of different dialects or idiolects or sociolects. My proposal will be the use of some features taken from subtitling for the hard of hearing (SHD), such as the use of different colors or the paratextual information within brackets.

1 The translation of films with more than one language

In his book *Subtitles, Translation & Idioms*, (Gottlieb 1997: 114-115) and in his more recent article "Language-political implications of subtitling" (Gottlieb 2004: 84), Henrik Gottlieb talks about the case of the American film *Dances with Wolves*, by Kevin Costner in 1990, subtitled in Danish. According to Gottlieb, in the sequence where the protagonist first encounters the Native Americans, the parts in Lakota are also subtitled, so the Danish audience can read the translation of the Lakota words, while the American audience in the theatres could not. Apparently, as Gottlieb says, the deciding factor may have been that the American movie version for DVD had the Lakota speech subtitled into English for the domestic audience.

Next, we could consider the case of the Iranian film *The Vote is Secret* (*Raye Makhfi*, 2001, directed by Babak Payami) subtitled in Spanish, as it was released for the cinemas in 2001. A woman has to collect all the votes for a political election in a remote island and in one part of the film the inhabitants of this island speak among each other in a language different than Farsi, and this part is not subtitled. Only when the dialogs are translated into Farsi, these are subtitled.

What should the approach be to that question? It would seem reasonable that one should translate what has already been translated in the original version. Or, we may add, when we are sure that the audience of the source text will understand all the different languages used in the original. This could be the case in films produced in Catalonia, where both Catalan and Spanish are used for Catalan audiences; a situation that seems to be more and more frequent in recent times. This is the case of *Anita no perd el tren*, (*Anita doesn't take chances*) by Ventura Pons, released in 2002. In this film, the characters use Catalan...
mainly, but one of them, played by the Spanish actress María Barranco always speaks in Spanish. The entire Catalan audience can understand both languages, due to Catalonia's political situation. But, how should we translate this into another language? I think we should translate both languages, since both were supposed to be understood by the audience of the source text. But the question one could ask is: should we somehow mark the presence of two different languages?

If we look at the English version of this film, included in the DVD for Spain, nothing marks this difference, so some English speaking viewers who don't know either Catalan or Spanish may not be able to feel the difference between both languages, if we think of what Europeans know about Spain, and specially about Catalonia, where even university students who go there on the Erasmus exchange programme ignore that most of the lessons at a Catalan university will be in this "strange", “unknown” language.

Is it always like that? Is there another possibility? Let's take another example: the Indian film *Monsoon Wedding*, by Mira Nair, released in 2002. The film is mostly spoken in English, since it portrays the upper classes in Delhi, and this class supposedly uses English, although they do use some words and even sentences in Hindi. In fact, the contrary is closer to the reality of India, where more than 1,600 languages (15 official) are spoken, with a strong presence of English as a *lingua franca*, so most people speak their own language with a lot of expressions and words in English.

In this film, in the Spanish subtitled version for the DVD, normal letter types are used for the English dialogs, but italics are used for the parts originally spoken in Hindi.

This seems to be a good solution to me, for the spectators to become aware that the characters are using different languages. But, should the occasionally spoken language be translated or kept in the original language and merely transcribed? An example to this can be found in the case of Fassbinder's film *Die Ehe der Maria Braun* (1979). The film is about the economic wonder in Germany, after WW II. Maria Braun lost her husband during the war, and she is looking for him once the war is over. Meanwhile, she gets to know an American officer who was sent to Germany. Maria Braun takes advantage of the situation, and starts learning English with him, apart from becoming his fiancee. In the subtitled French version released by Video Arte, La Sept, the parts where English is spoken are simply not translated, not even transcribed. Some of these parts correspond to a trial, where the English parts are immediately translated into German. But there are other parts where they just speak English, and the translator or the distributor decided not to translate them into French. Maybe they considered that most of German people didn't understand English at the time the film was released, in the late 70s.

On his point, I would like to add that there is a trend right now in Germany to use a lot of English words and expressions, for instance, advertising is mostly in English, specially the logos and slogans. Well, according to the article “Die Sense stimuliert” by Thomas Tuma which appeared in the German magazine *Der Spiegel* (2003:87) a survey was done in this field to find out if most of the people understood these slogans, and the results showed that most of them didn't. Slogans like “Come in and find out”, for the Douglas, a German company, was mostly understood as “Come in and find the way out”. Or the slogan “Be inspired”, for the also German company Siemens, was mostly understood as “The inspired bee (insect)”. All this is just to illustrate that one could say that English was not a common language in Germany in the late 70s, as it is right now.

Going back to the question above, could we just transcribe the English words, instead of leaving the subtitles out? This was done in the Spanish subtitles for a DVD released by the Spanish FNAC1. The parts spoken in English were transcribed. It is very likely that the same

---

1 “Fédération nationale d'achats des cadres”, lateron "Fédération nationale d'achats", a chain of stores selling products of the entertainment industry (music, literature, video games etc).
translator who did the French parts knew enough English to transcribe the English parts; but what if it had been Russian? Imagine she gets to know a Russian officer instead of an American one, would the translator simply transcribe the Russian parts?

It’s like the situation of the Icelandic singer Björk. She sings mostly in English, but she often uses some words in her own language, Icelandic, as in the song *Bachelorette*, which appeared in the concert *Live at Shepherds Bush* (1997). When this happens, should these Icelandic words be translated? Should they be left in Icelandic? Well, since I could assume that most people don't speak Icelandic, what would that bring? As I already stated in the introduction, I think that a possible and reasonable solution would be the addition of this information (Icelandic) within brackets, or the use of different colors.

But what happens when more than two languages are used? Should we mark this difference, and if we do so, how? Maybe we could use italics for all the secondary languages, if this is the case. There is another German film which uses more than one language: *Der Himmel über Berlin* (Wim Wenders, 1987). In this film, we find German, English and French mostly, but also Turkish and other languages. An angel is sent to the Earth, to Berlin, to help other people, but would like to stay there and become human. The two angels appearing in the film are played by the German actors Otto Sander and Bruno Ganz, and they speak in German; the French circus actress (played by Solveig Dommartin) speaks in French, and Peter Falk, playing himself, speaks in English. The Spanish subtitled version release in DVD only uses one type of letter, and they use no alternative way to show these different languages.

Another film where we find more than two different languages is *L'auberge espagnole* (Cédric Klapisch, 2002). In this film, we find more than one language besides French, the main language: Spanish, Catalan and English. In the French subtitles, as they appear in the DVD, this difference is not marked, so the audience cannot distinguish between Catalan, French or English, and the same is the case in the Spanish DVD: nothing marks the different languages in the Spanish subtitles.

### 2 Subtitling dialects and sociolects

Another case which could be related to this one, even if it is slightly different, is the use of dialects or sociolects. All translators know how difficult it is to render these differences in subtitles or dubbing. There is a good example in the subtitled translation of *My Fair Lady* (1964), directed by George Cukor. As is well known, this film is the cinema adaptation of Bernard Shaw's play *Pygmalion*. Although the subject of the film (and the play) is the power of language, and how to change your social and financial standing due to the use of language, it is interesting to see that even the intralinguistic subtitles in English only display a very poor rendering of this special use of cockney. This may be of interest at the beginning of the film, to get an idea of the character, but neither in the Spanish subtitled version nor in the Spanish dubbed one can we find any marks.

There is a chapter, where Professor Higgins tries to teach Miss Doolittle how to pronounce; but she cannot do it. The famous translation into Spanish, I would even dare to say that almost everybody knows it, is when he says “The rain in Spain stays mainly in the plain”, and she repeats by pronouncing: “The rine i Spine stays mostly in the pline” (in the English intralinguistic caption).

In the same chapter, later on, there is a passage where she tries to learn how to pronounce ‘h’, because a silent ‘h’ is a typical characteristic for cockney; and they use a mirror with a flame, so that if she pronounces the ‘h’ correctly, the flame wavers and this is shown in the mirror. The sentence she has to pronounce is: “In Hartford, Hereford and
Hampshire hurricanes hardly ever happen”, which is transcribed as “In ’artford, ’ereford and ’ampshire ’urricanes ’ardly hever ’appen”.

In the Italian subtitles, in both cases, “The rain in Spain...” and “In Hartford, Hereford...” the sentences are simply neither translated nor transcribed, when pronounced incorrectly. I really think that it could be a good solution, since the audience is always aware that she speaks in English, in this English sociolect, and that she is trying to learn to pronounce differently, and that they are in London. So, maybe this is more honest, and a good solution. Again, maybe the use of brackets, as is used with the SDH could be useful, just as a warning to the viewers that someone is using a dialect or a sociolect, when this is relevant.

3 Subtitling speech impediments

A final question related to the other questions mentioned above is the use of particular words, for instance, when some actor is speaking in a special manner. Here are two examples: the film *The life of Brian* (1979), by Monty Python, and *Star Wars I, The Phantom Menace* (1999), by George Lukas. In both films a variety of language is used, although this use differs from one film to the other, because in one, *Life of Brian*, it is a speech impediment, and in the other it is the use of an invented language, the language of Jar Jar Binks and his people. The question one should ask is: should we maintain these effects or speech impediments in the subtitles? Maybe one could ask, why not? But, since subtitles are written, as opposed to the oral nature of the original, or the dubbed version, it is easy to imagine that it could be difficult to render these differences in the written version, in the subtitles. Well, if we take a look at these subtitles, we can see that the differences were maintained. In the first example, Pilate utters the English ‘r’ as if it were a ‘w’. The first thing we observe is that the Spanish subtitles change the standard Spanish ‘r’ into a ‘d’. So, not always, but often, when there should be an ‘r’ in the English word, they write it with a ‘d’, or sometimes, even with two. However, it is not very common to use misspellings in subtitles. The question now is: should we write them in italics or just in normal letters? We could relate this to *My Fair Lady*. Should we use italics to show when she speaks improperly? Well, in the case of the Spanish subtitles, these words are written in normal letters, not in italics. The other person in the film who speaks with an impediment is Biggus Maximus. But he speaks with the ‘th’ sound instead of ‘s’. It is also interesting to see how to represent that in languages that do not have this pronunciation problem, like Catalan, French or Italian. It would be interesting to see how it is transcribed.

What happens with *Star Wars*? Well, they use this strange artificial language, actually based on English. In the Spanish subtitles, we find these words translated, but also misspelled; and they are not in italics; and are not easy to follow; so that maybe one could use them, but not as often as they are used in the original, and better present them in italics to better mark them.

4 Conclusions

To sum up, we have seen many different instances of the use of a different language in a given film, or even the use of several languages in the same film. We have also seen examples of the use of a special dialect or sociolect in a film, a matter that appears as a very difficult one to solve. We observed which solutions were found in these cases, and we discussed the difficulty of translating those instances. Problems like this often represent a challenge for translators, since they are not always aware of the range of possibilities that exist when rendering such diversity.
The solutions we observed are the following: not to mark the use of a different language; to mark it by not translating it, to mark it by transcribing it, or to translate it. If we chose the last solution, we can use either normal letters or italics; and it seems advisable to use italics, since it is a way to show this special use, but not to translate all of the “special” words, since it could become difficult for the viewers to follow.

A similar problem arises when dealing with more than two languages. As we have seen, most of the cases referred to here were not marked, leaving the audience unaware of the existence of different language levels. One possible solution could be the use of different colors, as we know is done in subtitling for the hard of hearing.

Another possible solution, also taken from SDH could be the “note” within brackets, as in the Icelandic in Björk's songs, just to warn the audience that what they are hearing is not English, and that the non-appearance of the subtitles is not due to the translator's incompetence.

Another question is the problem of the use of dialects or sociolects and even “invented” languages as well as speech impediments. Because of the special nature of subtitles, it seems advisable not to use misspellings. And maybe it would be advisable to use italics, when doing so. Again, another possible solution to these problems could be the addition of information in brackets, as in the Subtitles for the Hard of Hearing to warn the audience of something irregular in the language used.

As already pointed out at the Conference Media for all, held at the Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona in June 2005, I really think we should reconsider the traditional gap between intralingual subtitles for the hard of hearing and subtitles for the hearing, and try to take advantage of the possibilities offered there to solve traditionally “difficult” problems.

5 References

Tuma, Thomas (2003): “Die Sense stimuliert”. In Der Spiegel 38, p. 87

Films

Costner, Kevin (1990): Dances with Wolves
Cukor, George (1964): My Fair Lady
Fassbinder, Rainer Werner (1979): Die Ehe der Maria Braun
Gudmundsdottir, Björk (1997): Live at Shepherds Bush
Jones, Terry (1979): The life of Brian
Klapisch, Cédric (2002): L'auberge espagnole
Lukas, George (1999): Star Wars I. The Phantom Menace
Nair, Mira (2002): Monsoon Wedding
Payami, Babak (2001) Raye Makhfi (The Vote is Secret)
Pons, Ventura (2002): Anita no perd el tren (Anita doesn't take chances)
Wenders, Wim (1987): Der Himmel über Berlin
Multiple portrayals of gender in cinematographic and audiovisual translation discourse

Contents

1 The non-verbal dimension of language
2 The verbal dimension of language
3 Conclusions
4 References

Abstract

The present paper is the follow-up of previous research (De Marco, 2004; 2006) in which a first attempt has been made to interrelate two scholarly fields – Gender Studies and Audiovisual Translation. Many factors have contributed to keep on studying audiovisual translation from a wider sociolinguistic perspective: the fact that both Gender Studies and Audiovisual Translation have been at the core of academic debates in the past decades; that the study of gender issues has already been positioned within cinematographic discourse as well as in (literary) translation; that there are scholars (Danan, 1991; Díaz-Cintas, 1997; Ballester, 2001) who have recently approached the processes of dubbing and subtitling beyond mere technical aspects; and that, under the influence of the so-called ‘cultural turn’ translation has been interpreted as a realm where different languages and different identities meet.

The aim of the present study is to examine how gender is portrayed in British cinema and to show how translation for dubbing may contribute to transmitting clichés and assumptions about women and other social groups from one culture to another. More specifically, the present study will focus, on the one hand, on the visual and acoustic representation of gender in some British films. It is paying particular attention to the sociological implications that these representations may have on the way in which the audience of different languages and cultures may interpret what they see and hear. On the other hand, the study will discuss the dubbed translations in Spanish and Italian of some relevant exchanges of original British films where sexuality-related issues come to the fore.1 The corpus of films analyzed here is constituted by: East is East (1999, Damien O’Donnell), Bridget Jones’s Diary (2001, Sharon Maguire), Bend it like Beckham (2002, Gurinder Chadha) and Calendar Girls (2003, Nigel Cole).2


1 The following abbreviations will be used to refer to the films: EE (East is East), BJD (Bridget Jones’s Diary), BB (Bend it like Beckham) and CG (Calendar Girls).

1 Throughout the paper the word “Spanish” is used to refer to the Spanish versions released in Spain, not in Latin America.

2 The following abbreviations will be used to refer to the films: EE (East is East), BJD (Bridget Jones’s Diary), BB (Bend it like Beckham) and CG (Calendar Girls).
Verbal language is the place where social stereotypes are more easily reflected, but they can also be perceived in individuals’ behaviors, in their ways of thinking and in the roles that they are expected to fulfil. Mass media are one of the tools through which these behaviors and roles are filtered and made socially visible. In so doing, they are primarily responsible for the reproduction and perpetuation of stereotypes and common places.

As stated by Talbot (2003: 26), since “people are perceived through a ‘lens’ of gender polarization […] there is a strong tendency for gender stereotyping”. By ‘lenses of gender’ – a notion she takes on from Bem (1993) – she means the main beliefs concerning men and women in Western societies. Talbot explains that stereotypes are practiced in order to maintain the existing social order. For this reason, they “tend to be directed to subordinate groups (e.g. ethnic minorities, women)” (ibid.: 29). Expressed in other words, stereotypes arise from the assumption that one group or one culture represents the ‘normal’ and is, therefore, assumed to be superior to other groups or cultures. In particular, gender stereotypes stem from the presupposition that men and women are two opposing categories: since men represent the norm, women are doomed to be the exception to this norm. Such tendency to categorize both genders results in the stereotyping of the labels used to refer to men and women, and of the roles they are allotted. This way of casting men and women in fixed roles ends by affecting not only women in general, but also all those social and sexual categories who seem to deviate from the established norms: black and Hispanic people, religious minorities, gays and lesbians, etc.

The reason for the association between stereotypes and the portrayal of gender in cinema is that mass media tend to be closely linked with the dominant ideologies which, in turn, tend to overwhelmingly support binary gender constructions. In particular, the cinema industry holds on to strong economic interests that often determine what kind of films are made and under which conditions they are shot. The holders of such interests have long been men who, in order to generate considerable incomes, keep on proposing the same subjects and clichés which have always worked, and which, in the end, are the expression of a predominantly patriarchal logic. Furthermore, the sound and visual effects that cinema resorts to, the selection of the characters and the choice of the roles they are asked to perform, all contribute to creating a setting that the mainstream audiences find amusing and attractive. Cinema, therefore, has a strong power to shape people’s views according to the norms and clichés that the dominant social groups impose.

There are many strategies that cinema implements in order to meet the audience’s expectations, thereby instilling certain ideas and habits that in a more or less subtle way contribute to making social relationships more and more linked to gender-related prescriptions. One of the most persuasive means which cinema uses is the visual representation of characters. Later on the acoustic dimension of films will also be discussed, in particular the way in which the characters’ portrayal may be affected by the use of their voices in the original versions and by the choice of voices in the dubs.

1.1 Visual representation

The impact that images may have on the audience’s perception of reality has been one of the most discussed topics in the past thirty years among Film Studies scholars. Under the urges of feminist criticism, this cultural current has become more and more concerned with the issue of the stereotypical assumptions that may stem from the mechanisms through which (male) directors, producers and distributors construct and control the representation of characters in general, and of the female characters in particular.

Mulvey (1975), Kuhn (1982) and De Lauretis (1984) are some of the most influential scholars who have investigated questions as to the way in which certain images are built up,
the relationship between the actresses’ portrayal on the screen and the social context in which they live, and how their roles have changed (if they have) over the years.

These scholars arrived at the conclusion that the subtle sexist strategies that rule cinematographic logic end by objectifying the female characters, since they mostly act as erotic objects despite the more or less active roles they may play. This is expressed in particularly straightforward terms by Mills (1995: 162) when she states that “with the female characters the descriptions are concerned with establishing a degree of sexual attractiveness and sexual availability and there is a concentration on their supposed sexual characteristics”. Although her remarks refer to women’s representation in literature and advertising, they can easily be fit into the case of cinematographic representations. She dwells on the technique of fragmenting the female body – which occurs more frequently than in representations of the male body – stressing the estranging effects of such emphasis on the anatomical elements.

It is worth pointing out that most of the critiques raised by these scholars are targeted to Hollywood cinema. Their argumentations have found an application in the study mentioned above (De Marco, 2004) which deals with the portrayal of gender in some Hollywood films. In this essay the presence of elements that produce a certain degree of voyeuristic pleasure (in Mulvey’s 1975): the choice of actresses already attractive in themselves (Julia Roberts, Melanie Griffith), the persistent framing on their sensual breasts and legs, the shots on their naked bodies when less expected, the focus on their seductive clothes, and so forth.

As regards British films, which constitute the basis for the present study, almost none of them seems to put great emphasis on these anatomical aspects. Most of the actresses playing in these films are not always internationally famous, although they are well known in the UK (Linda Bassett, Keira Knightly, Juliet Stevenson). They look ‘normally’ beautiful, that is, they do not conform to the prevalent canon of attractiveness which still seems to be a preferential requirement within Hollywood cinema. The common ground of these films is that the female characters (both the main and the supporting ones) are women of all ages, of all ethnic groups and of all sizes. In other words, they look like any of us in contemporary multiethnic and heterogeneous societies. Moreover, the camera does not dwell upon the female characters’ physical appearance.

The only film which seems to indulge in some Hollywood-style shots is *BJD*. On the one hand, there are some elements which make it an unconventional film: the main character, Bridget (Renée Zellweger), is a somewhat plump woman prone to put her foot in; male characters, too, are often presented in funny situations, and there is a good deal of feminist remarks throughout the film. Nonetheless, sometimes the camera excessively focuses on Bridget’s body. Her figure, too, is often subject to the above-mentioned fragmentation. In particular, in the scene in which she presents the book of Mr Fitzherbert (Paul Brook), a colleague of hers, her lips in front of the microphone are widely shot before the camera frames her entirely. In another scene, her buttocks are repeatedly shot while she falls down from the top of a stake. It can be argued that in these and other scenes it is not clear where the borderline between ridicule and humor, between the stereotype and the questioning of the stereotype is. On the one hand, this film seems to mock the cliché of the slender actress and of the romantic girl in quest of true love; on the other, it ends by perpetuating these very stereotypes. Bridget and her body are held up for ridicule too many times, and the insistence of the camera on some details of her figure contribute to making her character clumsy and subject to male (both characters’ and audience’s) derision. Moreover, the engagement of this film with Hollywood policy finds further confirmation in the intense fattening diet Zellweger has gone through. The USA has been one of the first countries in introducing cosmetic surgery or body shaping treatments for cinematographic purposes, and most American stars have been subjected to openly manipulative practices making their bodies thinner or fatter depending on whether their characters had to fit the mainstream culture’s female body ideal or not.
Further to the ways in which the female characters’ bodies are shot throughout the action, sexist overtones may be perceived in the comments on the covers of the DVDs of some of these films in the three countries and in the translations of some titles. Covers are the visiting card of a film and in order to be distributed commercially, DVD covers have to show images or words that whet people’s appetite and curiosity or some other inner feeling of potential viewers who are thus led to buy the product. In most cases the images used in the DVD or video covers are the same as the posters distributed when the films were first launched for cinema release. Sometimes they differ partially or completely. In this transposition from a type of public to domestic consumption and from one language to another some things may be added or removed in order to meet the anticipated expectations of audiences which, however, may vary from one culture to another.

This discussion of a pronounced sexist, or simply derogatory, burden contained in some marketing strategies devised to sell audiovisual products were incorporated in Toury’s (1978) notion of ‘preliminary’ norms. These norms concern the policy establishing what texts are selected for translation and how they are translated. One of the merits of this approach is its raising important sociological issues such as the question under which historical circumstances norms are established according to which criteria and above all as to the question of who is allowed to establish or change such norms.

Although Toury’s statements were not conceived with audiovisual translation in mind, it is not difficult to establish a relationship between this form of translation and his theories. Among the preliminary norms ruling the audiovisual world there is a policy which determines how the product is presented: through covers, titles, comments, etc. Coming back to our remarks about the visual dimension of female characters, we often find images which highlight some physical details of the female actresses even though their bodies are not the point of the action. Images thus ‘manipulate’ the audience’s expectations and their final response. These visual innuendos look even more striking when the emphasis on sexual/sexist aspects is placed on the cover of the DVD designed for one country and not on the one designed for another country. In other words, these differences may provide some clues about the way in which different cultures conceive womanhood or, in more specific terms, face up to gender issues. I have not noticed any sexist interventions in the way images were transposed in the covers of the different DVDs under analysis. Either the covers distributed in Spain and Italy are the same as the original British (as in the case of CG), or they differ only slightly. In both cases, the images focus on the characters, providing us with some insights about who the main characters are and what the situations which they are involved in might be.

This can be questioned with respect to the cover of CG. Here we see Chris (Helen Mirren), one of the main characters, with her shoulders bare. She holds a calendar showing herself (in the same position) and the faces of her friends smiling with large colored hats. No exploitive intentions are perceived in this portrayal, although it could be seen as titillating since the calendar is held to conceal her implied nakedness. In some way, it seems to defy the audience’s conjectures when seeing the uncovered shoulders while, at the same time, it fosters fantasies which will never be satisfied since the characters will never appear completely bare. The audience’s expectations, then, can be said to go beyond what is shown throughout the film.

More than in the images that portray the characters, the words that go with the images on the covers of BJD give us some interesting clues. In the DVD distributed in the UK, under the portrait of the three main characters Bridget, Daniel (Hugh Grant) and Mark (Colin Firth), we read: ‘Two thumbs up! Terrific fun!’ . This advertising sign suggests that there will be great fun in viewing the film. In the DVD distributed in Italy the same sign has been rendered as Per tutte quelle che sono state corteggiate, illuse … e poi mollate [For all those (women) who have been courted, deceived … and eventually jilted]. The Spanish one is Para todos los que
han sido alguna vez engañados, plantados o magreados [For all those who have at some point been cheated, jilted or groped]. Although this is not a translation, it is worth arguing that the marketing strategies used in Spain and Italy are very different from the ones devised in the UK: the Spanish and the Italian advertising seems to deliver a judgment about the characters and the possible audience. What is striking here, however, is the value that the pronouns quelle (in Italian) and los que (in Spanish) – both meaning ‘those’ – take on. In the Spanish note the generic masculine pronoun los is used, whereas the feminine quelle is preferred in Italian. This subtle difference may disclose a more offensive intention on the part of the Italian distributors that is worth being emphasized here. While the Spanish advertising addresses an indefinite audience, thus including both men and women, the Italian ad only addresses women. In doing so it presupposes that it is women – and not men – who get caught, deceived or left. The Italian version thereby contributes to strengthening the idea that men can take the initiative, whereas women are passive and cannot but wait and be confident in men’s good purposes. This is an illuminating example of the dilemma of perceiving, in these words, a male chauvinist strategy or just a reflection of the target culture’s way of thinking. Some might claim that there is not a manipulating intention in this note because it simply mirrors the traditional – although still vivid – conviction that (Italian) males are never left, they take the initiative, they leave. In other words, the audience may find this comment natural because these are the terms in which most people still think. As a consequence, this is what distributors have to say in order to meet the audience’s expectations, i.e. in order to sell their product.

Nonetheless, the commercial factor should not provide a good reason to justify a case of outright sexism. It is generally accepted that films do not only reflect reality, but they have the power to create assumptions and prejudices which may not be directly perceivable. Such assumptions and prejudices are then reinforced through subtle codes conveying the illusion of seeing real facts. By addressing only a female audience, this cover seems to invite women to see themselves in the passive role that this misleading note displays. In so doing the traditional subordination of women is never challenged. It is, instead, revived. On the other hand, the Spanish los que may be interpreted as a more aggressive marketing strategy since, by encapsulating and including the whole audience in the sentence, a sort of empathy may be created between the character and the audience. The point which is most important here, however, is that there is such a huge contrast between the original version and the dubbed one. In both Spanish and Italian the words imply a film aimed at people who have suffered, while the British cover is aimed at an audience who wants a laugh.

Concerning the covers of the other films, only BB gives cause for reflection and comments, although these must be directed to the way in which the original British title has been rendered in Spanish and Italian, rather than to the comments added on the DVD covers. Even the choice of the titles and of their translation is motivated in most cases, by commercial and marketing reasons. In general terms, in order to sell a product, cinematographic distributors look for a title which exploits a previous box-office success, which reminds us of a famous person or event, or which simply arouses the audience’s curiosity. As stated by Shochat and Stam (1985: 43) “titles promise, prefigure, orient” and it often happens that “when original titles seem insufficiently indexical, translators are sometimes tempted to ‘improve’ them”. In this process of ‘improvement’ many things can arbitrarily change and subtle innuendoes may be added as is evident in some cases of “gratuitous eroticization of [some] titles” (ibid: 44). With respect to the present corpus, a good example can be found in the Italian translation of BB.

This title was rendered as Sognando Beckham [Dreaming of Beckham]. It completely departs from the original which just makes reference to the main character’s ability to play football like her hero (Beckham). The verb ‘to bend’ with its meaning related to football, in the Italian version is replaced by a verb with a far more romantic/erotic connotation which
could turn the Italian audience’s expectations of the film in the wrong direction. The Spanish translation *Quiero ser como Beckham* [I want to be like Beckham] diverges from the original as well, but it does not give any direct indication of a possible sexual desire or fantasy on the part of the protagonists, Jess (Parminder Nagra) and Jules (Keira Knightley). In a way it only suggests what will be disclosed later on.

1.2 Acoustic representation

Let us now turn to another element which deserves consideration for it may have implications on the filmic characterization of gender: the choice of the characters’ voices. The audience’s response to the film and the view of the world that they infer from it may be affected not only by what they see, but also by what they hear. Considering, furthermore, that dubbing is a translation mode in which the original soundtrack is completely erased to be replaced by a new one, the role that the actors’ and actresses’ voices play in dubbing appear relevant to understand the reasons behind why the dubbed versions may sound remarkably different from the ones in the original.

The study of voice as a factor of gender discrimination has been approached by many linguists and feminist scholars, e.g. Cameron (1992) who argues that there is a false belief that women’s voices are too shrill and tiny compared to men’s. As a consequence, women have often been excluded from many professional fields. It is believed, in fact, that the female voice does not convey security or authority, qualities that have long been attributed to the low tone of the male voice. Of course shrillness and lowness depend on physiological characteristics of human beings. It is thanks to these factors that we can distinguish a man from a woman or a child from an elderly person, but as stated by Calsamiglia Blancafort & Valls Tusón (2002: 54) “voice can also be moulded in order to achieve certain effects and to show certain intentions” and “every social group attributes different values to a voice” (translation by the author of this article). That the increase or decrease in pitch is culturally constructed is confirmed by by research on language acquisition. Although the process of language acquisition and the ways in which it develops may vary according to culture and social class, several scholars have tested that children lower the tone of their voice when they turn to their fathers and raise it when they address their mothers (Lieberman, 1967; Lee et al., 1995). In other words, depending on the gender of the adults with whom children interact, they unconsciously learn to speak in a way which perpetuates the binary gender opposition that may then be overused as a means by which social order is preserved.\(^3\)

Since the birth of sound film, voice has become an object of study among cinema scholars as a consequence of the awareness of the great impact that it may have on an image’s meaning and on the characterization of actors. Chion (1999) is one of the leading theorists who has investigated the function of cinematographic sound.\(^4\) One of his principal ideas is that it is the voice rather than the image that counts most in cinema. In other terms, it is not the image in itself that is the most meaningful element in films, but the range of information that the image conveys through sound, and through the characters’ voice in particular. In Chion’s words *(ibid.: 5)* “if a human voice is part of it [a space], the ear is inevitably carried toward it, picking it out, and structuring the perception of the whole around it”.

Chion’s focus on the power of voice to structure and impact on the meaning of the action led to the hypothesis that there are gender innuendoes in the dubbed voices of some characters

---

\(^3\) Coates (2004: 147-170) investigates the studies dealing with gender differences in early language acquisition.

\(^4\) Some of the most interesting concepts that he introduced are those of ‘vococentrism’, i.e. the process through which “the presence of a human voice structures the sonic space that contains it” (Chion, 1999: 5); of ‘acousmatic sound’, that is “a sound that is heard without its cause or source being seen” *(ibid.: 18)* and of the opposite category of ‘visualized listening’.

24
of the films analysed here. Within the field of audiovisual translation, voice has been studied mainly from a technical point of view, since it is one of the most difficult aspects to consider in dubbing. The way voices are dubbed, and their synchronization with the characters’ movements and gestures, provides the audience with many clues about aspects such as the age of the characters, the role they play and especially certain nuances that the director wants to convey and that are to be maintained in the dubbed versions.

The dubbing which is of interest here is not the voice quality of the main characters – which have been rendered faithfully in both the Spanish and Italian versions – but the lexical register. The English of most of the characters in EE has a marked Northern accent. There is a tendency both in Spanish and in Italian not to reproduce this regional variety. Furthermore, in the Spanish versions of EE and BB, the slight foreign accent of some of the non-English characters which can be well perceived in the original (and the Italian) is neutralized. We could draw on Venuti’s term (1995) of ‘domesticated translation’ to interpret the deletion of the foreign accent of some characters in the Spanish version. On the other hand, the fact that the original version foregrounds this non-British pronunciation can be associated with a general tendency in the UK to perceive negatively, or to consider imperfect, the linguistic varieties that sound different from standard British. As Armstrong (2004: 98) points out “the higher the speaker’s social class (level of education, etc.), the more attenuated the regional accent, to the extent that most prestigious accent, […] is sometimes characterized as ‘regionless’”. Although in the films discussed here it is not the characters’ social class or their education level that is noticed, but rather their ethnic origin. The centrality of their accent is the ‘imperfect’ element which conveys their uneasiness in the British environment.

Of particular relevance are the dubbed voices of some supporting characters who shape the setting while not assuming a relevant role of their own, e.g. the voice of some gay characters in the British and the translated versions. In EE, Nazir (Ian Aspinall) the eldest son of a seven-children family of Pakistani origin runs away at the beginning of the action to avoid an arranged marriage. He is later discovered to be gay by two of his brothers and sister who go and look for him at his new work place. In this scene we see him going downstairs while talking to a customer in quite a camp tone. When he sees his brothers and retires to another room to speak to them in private, he takes on a lower pitch, the same he had at the beginning of the action when he had not yet come out. The Italian version reproduces this contrast between, whereas the Spanish does not. Along the same lines the dubbing of the voice of Etienne (Thierry Harcourt), his boss and partner is interesting. There is just an quick exchange of words between them, but it is enough to note that in the original version the pitch of Etienne’s voice is slightly higher. However, in the Spanish and, especially, in the Italian version, this tone sounds far more effeminate. We could interpret this emphasis as a compensation for – as was noted previously - the Spanish and the Italian deletion of the characters’ regional accent. Furthermore, the Spanish completely deleted Etienne’s French intonation: Ignoring this inflexion, which is the striking aspect for a British audience, the dubs may have chosen to compensate this lack of foreign lilt by stressing another element of ‘strangeness’ which, in this case, is given by the character’s affected manners.

In BJD there is another gay character, Tom (James Callis), one of Bridget’s closest friends. In the original version, his tone of voice is slightly camp (especially in the scene of the fight between Daniel and Mark). The foreign versions, in this case, do not sound particularly altered. As was previously analyzed (De Marco, 2004), other gay characters’ voices tend to be also manipulated in the Italian and Spanish dub, and this manipulation manifesting itself by either overemphasizing or neutralizing the camp pitch. Of course camp

---

5 Ávila (1997) describes in detail the types of voice and the exercises that a dubbing actor has to do in order to mould it according to different needs.

6 After Nazir begins a new life far from home, he also changes his name to Nigel.
talk is used within gay communities, but as stated by Harvey (2001: 8-9) it is “more a stylistic device which can be used in certain contexts variably to signal special meanings, solidarities and identities, rather than a ‘type’ to which they belong […] a marker of identity/community to be used against the stream”. It seems that in filmic representations it is rather used for caricatural purposes which lead to promoting stereotypes and prejudices about the manners and the talk of gay people. This idea is supported in Millwood Hargrave’s study Sex and Sexuality in Broadcasting (1992) in which he states that gay characters are usually placed in stereotypical roles in TV programs. He then suggests that their roles should be established before their sexual orientation becomes apparent, that is, programs should “not place the homosexual’s sexuality in the foreground as if it was the most significant feature of their personality” (ibid.: 90). The fact that the voice of gay characters has been remarkably emphasized in the Italian versions, or made neutral in some Spanish dubs, may suggest that these countries have a more discriminatory or distrustful attitude towards the gay community. This interpretation of voices falls under cinematographic policy which establishes that this kind of character behaves and talks in a certain way in order to meet the heteronormative expectations of the mainstream audience. The characteristics defining gay people in cinema tend to be either stressed – in order to stereotype their image – or made invisible – since homosexuality may not be perceived by some producers or distributors as commercially interesting yet, neglecting the presence of gay spectators who might find that kind of representation unnatural and unflattering.

The only film in which a gay character plays a role where his sexual orientation is unimportant in terms of the plot is BB. Here we only realize that Tony (Ameet Chana) is gay at the end of the action when he discloses this secret to Jess. Until that moment, however, he plays his role as a friend of the main character and does not draw the other characters’ and audience’s attention to it. His manners and voice are never emphasized neither in the original version nor in the Spanish and Italian ones. There may be a normative-cinematographic reason behind these different treatments. When a character is asked to play the role of a gay and the directors, producers and distributors want his sexuality apparent from the very beginning, then his representation tends to be exaggerated (emphasizing either his gestures or his voice). When, on the other hand, they want to keep it from being known until the end of the action, the gay character’s sexuality is not disclosed and, consequently, he is asked to perform like any other (heterosexual) character. This reinforces Toury’s concept of norms and policy, i.e. that there is a policy behind any social behavior. In our case, there is a policy behind any cinematographic strategy, choice or performance.

2 The verbal dimension of language

The previous sections have shown that social and sexual stereotypes may easily be moulded and exported through images and sounds. The way in which they may be intentionally constructed in cinema has a strong impact on the audience’s perception of reality, on their demands for future releases and, in general, on their interpersonal behavior and the relationships they establish in the social environment. Nonetheless, verbal language is where stereotypes tend to be most apparently reflected as stated by Hudson (1980: 193) who argues that “language is one of the most important factors

---

7 The present study refers mainly to voice pitch but camp talk is a way of speaking and therefore includes a particular usage of lexical and syntactical structures as evident from Harvey’s analysis (2001)

8 ‘Demands’ here do not refer to people consciously demanding future releases. Rather, they are created by big studios, distributors and producers who keep on providing a certain kind of film, end up persuading people that this is the kind of release that they want to see.
by which social inequality is perpetuated from generation to generation”. There has always been a subtle, widespread belief that the appearance, the behavior and the linguistic features of some social group have a higher social standing than those of others. When people interact they consciously or unconsciously tend to evaluate each other. Their way of speaking – in terms of both content and form – may help building a favorable image of some groups and a less favorable one of others which contributes to making language an expression for stereotypes, prejudices and inequalities.9

This section will focus on the way in which gender stereotypes come to the surface through the language used by female characters. Particular attention is paid to whether the kind of language they use discloses any traces of homophobic remarks. Also considered are the translations of these exchanges which are investigated as to whether they disclose any similarities and/or differences. The differences are then analyzed as to their kind in terms of the type of allusions they make.

It is assumed that that not only attitudes but also the way in which an individual speaks can be related to gender construction. They are linked to social etiquette and labels that stipulate how men and women are expected to behave.

**Exchange 1 (BB)**

Towards the end of the film, Jules, Jess’s best friend and team-mate, joins her at the wedding party of Jess’s sister, Pinky (Archie Panjabi). Paula (Juliet Stevenson), Jules’s mother, decides to give her a lift to the ceremony. As soon as she notices that Jess is wearing the shoes that Jules had lent her without her mother’s knowing, she bursts out saying: ‘Get your lesbian feet out of my shoes’. This reaction is the result of some assumptions that Paula had previously formed because she has misunderstood the girls’ words during an out-of-context conversation that she happened to overhear. Paula’s suspicion seems to be evidenced in this meeting in which she interprets the fact that Jess is wearing her shoes as a clear sign of an intimate relationship between her daughter and Jess. Furthermore, before driving Jules to Pinky’s ceremony, Paula notices that Jules has dressed smartly, something unusual for her daughter - another reasons to believe that there is more than a friendship between the two girls. She then pours out her anger by making evidently homophobic remark which, shortly afterwards, takes on far stronger shades. In the subsequent scene, in fact, when Jules tells her mother that just because she plays football does not make her a lesbian, and that being a lesbian is not anything to be ashamed of anyway, her mother hypocritically replies:

| Pinky: Oh, no, sweetheart, of course it isn’t. No, no! I mean, I’ve got nothing against it. I was cheering for Martina Navratilova as much as the next person. |

9 Stereotype is here used in the sense of Calefato (1997: 69-73) who defines it as “a verbal expression, an image that somehow sticks to a person, a social group, as well as to a behavior, a feeling, a value, without being filtered through logical reasoning. The stereotype lives on unchanged, leaving some implicit presuppositions that end up being unconsciously taken for granted by the great majority. Because of the implicit messages conveyed by language, stereotypes take root so strongly in our minds that it seems that there are no other words or images that could be used to define an object or action, or to refer to a person” (translation by the author of this article).
Paula’s attitude openly discloses her strong prejudice about lesbian relationships, but even more interesting is the offensive way in which her words were rendered in the Italian dub. The original sentence ‘I was cheering for Martina Navratilova as much as the next person’ is already offensive, since it sounds like a judgement about Martina Navratilova in comparison to someone else who better meets Paula’s idea of the ‘right’ sexuality. The Italian translation for this sentence is Tifavo per Martina Navratilova come se fosse una normale [I used to cheer for Martina Navratilova as if she were a normal (person)] which sounds far more derogatory than the English original. This is a case of outright homophobia since it implies that Martina Navratilova is not a normal person. She turns out to be stigmatized as less feminine or less ladylike, just because she does not follow the moral guidelines which define proper sexuality. Here we are faced with a clear example of linguistic construction of identity. Gender boundaries are built up not only through the binary opposition between femininity and masculinity, but also through the opposition between femininity and unfemininity, or between masculinity and unmasculinity. The Spanish version, on the other hand, is far more literal since como la que más back translates as ‘as much as anyone else’. It is also interesting to notice that both in the Spanish and, above all, in the Italian version, there is a repetition of the negative adverb ‘no’ in Paula’s answer – in the original version there are just three cases of ‘no’, whereas in the Spanish there are five and in the Italian six. This emphasis makes her words sound even more hypocritical.

There is a very similar misunderstanding about Jess and Jules in a previous scene in which they are seen hugging at a bus stop by Pinky’s future parents-in-law. In reality, whom they see is Jules from behind and they think she is an English boy but, as Indian women are supposed to go around only with Indian men, they express their disapproval for Jess’s attitude by cancelling the wedding between Pinky and their son. Pinky outbursts in anger by telling her parents that Jess keeps on playing football behind their back and adds:

**Exchange 2 (BB)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pinky:</th>
<th>Spa Dub</th>
<th>Pinky:</th>
<th>Ita Dub</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No mum. It’s not their fault. I bet she was with some dykey girl from her football team!</td>
<td>No, mamá. Ella tiene la culpa. Apuesto a que estaba con una tortillera de su equipo.</td>
<td>No, mamma. È tutta colpa sua. Scommetto che stava con qualche lesbica della sua squadra.</td>
<td>No, mamá. È tutta colpa sua. Scommetto che stava con qualche lesbica della sua squadra.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[Pinky: No, mum. It’s her fault. I bet she was with a dyke of her team.]</td>
<td>[Pinky: No, mum. It’s her fault. I bet she was with a dyke of her team.]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is strange that we see here a case of women criticizing other women. Women – especially if they are close friends or sisters – are prone to compliment and manifest mutual support for each other in most situations which can be interpreted as an unconscious sign of solidarity of gender affinity, as if there were a natural understanding urging closeness under any circumstance. It is also true, however, that from being the best friends, women can also turn out to be the worst enemies, and this U-turn often shows in unexpected betrayals. Here, Pinky’s remark shows prejudices about women who do not conform to the established
heterosexual canon, but in this case it is in the original version, as well as in the Spanish one, that Pinky’s words take on a more discriminatory connotation. ‘Dykey’ is a slang term for a female homosexual, usually used to refer to the stereotypical image of a mannish lesbian. The Spanish tortillera conveys the same negative allusion, thus emphasizing Pinky’s prejudice and sense of superiority. In Italian, the more neutral lesbica [lesbian] was preferred.

Similar exchanges can be observed with gay men. As discussed in the previous section, when gay characters are part of the storyline, their sexual orientation is brought to the foreground as if it were the most representative feature of their performance. But they are hardly ever addressed or described in general terms as ‘gay’. They are rather stigmatized through unflattering and offensive synonyms such as ‘poof’, ‘faggot’, and ‘queer’. A good example can again be found in BJD. There is a scene at the beginning of the film in which Bridget, speaking in the third person, introduces her friends Shazzer (Sally Phillips), Jude (Shirley Henderson), and Tom (James Callis) to the audience without them hearing her. When Tom’s turn comes she says:

**Exchange 3 (BJD)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bridget: Tom, ‘80s pop icon who only wrote one hit record. Then retired because he found that one record was quite enough to get him laid for the whole of the ’90s. Total poof, of course!</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Spa Dub: Tom, un símbolo pop de los ochenta. Solo compuso un disco de éxito y luego se retiró porque descubrió que con un disco bastaba para tirarse a quienquisiera durante los noventa. Maricón perdido, ¡por supuesto!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[Bridget: Tom, pop symbol of the 80s. He only composed one hit record and then retired because he found that one record was enough to screw anybody during 90s. Completely poof, of course!]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ita Dub: Tom, idolo pop degli anni ottanta che ha scritto un’unica canzone e che si è ritirato dopo aver scoperto che bastava un disco per rimorchiare per tutti gli anni novanta. Completamente finocchio, chiaro!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[Bridget: Tom, pop idol of the 80s who only wrote one record and then retired after finding that one record was enough to pick up for the whole of the 90s. Completely poof, of course!]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From a merely lexical point of view, we can see that in the three languages stereotypical terms (‘poof’, ‘maricón’, and ‘finocchio’) were used. They are followed by determiners (‘total’, perdido and completamente [completely]) whose presence stresses the most derogatory connotations of these words. Moreover, the emphasis on the final adverbial locution ‘of course’, literally translated in both Spanish (por supuesto) and Italian (chiaro), has the effect of shifting the attention to what Bridget says about Tom’s main vocation in the past years, i.e., to have sex, thus establishing an easy albeit superficial equation: Tom – sex - homosexuality. Before this presentation, we do not have any clue about who Tom is and what his role is supposed to be. Consequently, the words that were to introduce him and the presence and prominent syntactical placement of this adverb at the end of the sentence together with the presentation, may have a misleading effect upon the audience’s opinion of him. It may reinforce the already widespread association of homosexuality with sexual intercourse, unfaithfulness and promiscuity, since it seems to suggest that it is typical of gay men to have casual and irregular sexual relationships. It is worth pointing out, however, that the presence of these unflattering attributes in this exchange should not lead to false conclusions about the offensive potential of Bridget’s words. Of importance is also the way in which the information is provided when the text interacts with the image. These comments are given through an offstage voice and come after we see Tom asking Bridget if her boss is still ‘as cute as ever’, and assuming a tender look when a man approaches him to ask his autograph. The audience, therefore, is provided with clear clues about Tom’s sexual orientation and, in a certain way, Bridget’s words anticipate what they expect to hear. Moreover, we have to consider that sometimes people may speak using demeaning
expressions without really intending them to be taken literally. This happens especially in conversations between intimate friends who often address each other through four-letter words or phrases containing sexual innuendoes. In this case, the offensiveness of such words can be conceived as a token of humoristic tenderness, or as a proof of solidarity which make the interlocutors feel as part of the same group. This peculiar use of vocabulary falls under what Kuiper (1998: 291) calls ‘the dark side of politeness’. He draws on Brown and Levinson’s theory of politeness (1978, 1987) to examine the ways in which adult males in New Zealand create group solidarity. One of these ways is through demeaning formulae suggesting that a man is no more than a sexual organ, ‘wanker’, ‘cunt’ and ‘great penis’ being three prime examples. Kuiper argues that these forms of address are very common in the circle of football locker rooms where footballers resort to them just to threaten their fear of sexual humiliation (equating male masculinity with female organs or with penis).

In the light of these considerations, Bridget’s words could be interpreted in more positive terms since, as the film goes on, we see that Tom and Bridget are very close friends and that the apparently offensive exchanges between them are, in fact, friendly jokes. What makes them slightly homophobic, however, is the fact that – as was mentioned before – Bridget’s words are not spoken directly as part of a dialog between her and Tom. The use of an offstage voice creates a distance between the affectionate way in which Bridget (the character) interacts with her friend, on the one hand, and the way in which Renée Zellweger (the actress) is asked to speak, on the other, as if she were the spokesperson for an essentially heteronormative audience. Furthermore, it is interesting to stress that the effect of Bridget’s words on a gay audience may vary by culture. It is possible that a gay British or American spectator would not attach much importance to this kind of presentation since, due to the better acceptance of same-sex relationships in Anglo-American society, and due to the well-known sense of humor circulating within the gay community, gay people would think that Bridget – as a friend – is allowed to refer to Tom as a poof. The same cannot be said for gay audiences in Spain or Italy where there has always been less tolerance towards homosexuality. The first thing that a gay spectator may think when seeing this scene, is that the choice to introduce a gay character by making reference to his sexuality, rather than to other aspects of his daily life, is a strategy intentionally devised to perpetuate commonplace prejudices about homosexuality. This appears even more obvious if we pay attention to the way in which Tom is introduced compared to the other friends. Bridget presents Shazzer saying: ‘Shazzer, journalist. Likes to say “fuck” a lot!’ In this scene she does not say anything about Jude because she had previously introduced her to the audience as follows: ‘Daily call from Jude. Best friend. Head of investment at Brightlings Bank who spends most of her time trapped in the ladies’ toilet crying over fuckwit boyfriend’. In this case too we are not faced with very flattering comments: we are automatically pushed to think of Shazzer as a not very “ladylike” speaker, and of Jude as a woman who is not able to make herself liked by men. However, in neither of these cases the emphasis is put on Shazzer’s or Jude’s sexuality. By contrast, the first thing that is given prominence is their high-level profession.

3 Conclusions

The present study provided some insights into the different perspectives from which gender may be analyzed in cinematographic representations and in audiovisual translation discourse. The aim of this analysis was to see in which ways audiovisual translation may contribute to perpetuating and exporting gender stereotypes from one culture to another.

The analysis of the visual and acoustic dimensions of the analyzed films, together with the analysis of some dialog exchanges, has shown that language – both verbal and non-verbal – may contain innuendoes whose side effects pass often unnoticed to most language users and,
because of this very “imperceptibility”, they risk becoming the means through which unpleasant clichés and assumptions about some social groups become rooted in our psyche.

It was noticed that when it is gay men or supposed lesbians who are being addressed, the presence of offensive overtones results in the use of vocabulary either charged with heavy allusions (dykey, poof) which were rendered by equivalent synonyms in the two target languages or of circumstances disclosing strong prejudices (Exchange 1, Italian version), or overemphasizing the effeminate tone of the players’ voices. In particular, in the Italian versions this aspect is more perceptible and recurrent, as was seen in the case of the Italian dub of Nigel’s and Ethienne’s voices in *East is East*.

It could be argued that the representation of womanhood and homosexuality in this study meet the expectations of most Western countries audiences, because this representation seems to be in line with the way of thinking and communicating of British, Spanish and Italian people. Of course, these manners can be ‘justified’ or tolerated in spoken language because when we speak we are less reflective, but the act of writing or translating implies personal commitment to the text and reflection upon what is being done. Writers or translators, therefore, should be more ‘careful’ when selecting the right words and phrases and be aware of them potentially conveying messages which may have important social implications. Of course, in the context of cinema and screen translation, it is far more difficult to fill the gap between the wish to meet the audiences’ expectations and the need not to provide the seeds which would contribute to making stereotypes and prejudices stable or grow. To meet the audiences’ expectations means that films must present situations in which the characters speak and behave like real people do. Hence, viewers should be led to identify themselves with the characters as they appear in films. As stated by González Vera (forthcoming):

> The desire to be relevant to modern society compels the film to present expressions and ways of talking used in our daily life. Among these expressions, we come across marks of expressiveness, colloquial references and swearwords. Their use adds natural manners and spontaneity to the film. In short, they transform artificial situations into credible ones.

The risk of such interdependence of spontaneity and credibility, however, is that the borders between fiction and real life are blurred to the point that it becomes difficult to understand if it is cinema – and media in general – which instills false assumptions and clichés in the audience or the opposite. Audiovisual products are openly exposed to commercial dictates reflecting in what direction the economic and ideological interests of a society go, namely the interests of what sectors of society tend to be favored to the detriment of others. In this way, cinema, and screen translation, may have the power to monopolize the audience’s conscience and subtly contribute to implanting and perpetuating unpleasant assumptions, patriarchal stereotypes and discriminatory attitudes that may become to difficult to erase from the psyche.

We live in an era of great social change which have been taking place as a direct consequence of the feminist movement. In this ever-changing time, we should try to foster changes in language as well, taking into account that the meanings of words may have changed, and so have people’s connotations of the social values that these meanings assume. In other words, expressions and nuances that some years ago sounded neutral or proper in a particular historical context, may today have taken on different meanings and be perceived in a different way. From this point of view, when texts are translated – or when films are dubbed – the changes which occur in the new social context should be reflected in language too.

Why is it so difficult, then, to promote changes and restrain the perpetuation and diffusion of linguistic stereotypes which reinforce the inequalities between genders? It is easy to think that it happens because language mirrors everyday society as if this were a taken-for-granted and unchanging reality. I do not think that language simply reflects facts. Facts are the result of conscious, human actions. Language is socially constructed, it is not independent of its
users. If we use language it is because we need a means to establish social relationships, and if we consciously interact we are also aware of the use we make of language. Saying that speakers are aware of their linguistic framework means that they know the positive and the negative connotations that words can take on and that they are responsible if their interlocutors feel offended. Placing these remarks in the context of gender issues, it should theoretically be easy to speak without charging the words with sexist, homophobic or racist overtones since we all know that these may result in other dangerous, discriminatory behaviors. If this does not happen, it may well be because people do not really want to dispense with a certain kind of vocabulary. The point is that it is difficult to get rid of something that passes unnoticed to most of the language users because certain expressions are so common, that they have become a familiar, natural and part of our background.

Why to put an end, then, to our points of reference? To stand up against sexism, or against any other form of gender discrimination, would turn out to the disadvantage of those who hold the economic and political power and who control the mass media which have always had a strong power of persuasion on the masses. Mass media, the tools through which their products are made intelligible worldwide (e.g. audiovisual translation), and the increase of academic research in this field are the keystone of change. The present study is an attempt to trigger the debate and to encourage other researchers to embark on studies aimed at the critique and revision of gender stereotypes and gender prejudices.

4 References


Lena Hamaidia (Sheffield)

Read my Lips: Gaps in meaning between spoken and subtitled dialog.

Contents

1 Introduction
2 Theoretical Background
3 Marked Structures
4 Rigidity of the Structure of English
5 Halliday’s Approach to Theme-Rheme Analysis
6 Firbas’ Approach to Theme-Rheme Analysis
7 Subtitling Marked Structures
8 Read my Lips Analysis
9 Conclusion
10 References

Abstract

The purpose of this study is to examine whether the communicative meaning of the sentence structures used in spoken dialog is altered by the subtitling process. The paper will focus on the way in which emotional and emphatic sentences of spoken dialog are translated into English subtitles. As the structure of the sentences is determined by the communicative intention of the speaker they are defined as pragmatically or communicatively ordered sentences.

1 Introduction

Purpose of this study

Because the sequence of the elements in a pragmatically ordered sentence differs from that in a standard or “unmarked” sentence a pragmatically ordered sentence is known as “marked”. Following Schmid’s observation that marked structures contain “elusive meaning components” (Schmid 1999: 4) which may be lost in the translation process this study will consider whether the translator’s sensitivity to the nuances of meaning conveyed by the use of marked structures in the spoken dialog can be increased by a closer study of the communicative function of the syntactic structure and whether this in turn can be used to inform the translation of the spoken dialog into written subtitles.

This study will begin to explore the hypothesis, which forms part of my ongoing research, that marked structures are particularly important in subtitled dialog as they can be used both as a form of shorthand for communicative meaning and also as a strategy for conveying some of the features of spoken language. It will aim to show that as spoken language has to be condensed in a subtitle the use of a marked structure can provide one method by which meaning can be expressed both succinctly and forcefully and it can also carry some of the emphasis of intonation in spoken dialog.

In order to place this topic within a theoretical framework the discussion will begin with a theoretical investigation of the connection between sentence structure and meaning in
language and in translation. The nature of the interaction between spoken and written language in the subtitle will also be briefly considered.

The paper will conclude with a case study of the French film *Read my Lips* where the structures used in selected sentences of spoken French dialog and their translation into English subtitles will be analyzed in detail and the communicative impact of both the spoken and the written forms of the dialog will be compared. The theories of Halliday and Firbas will inform the interpretation of the sentences examined in this analysis, which will examine the translation of spoken dialog into subtitles in the light of Schmid’s claim that: “If the source text deviates from the unmarked canonical word order, sentences carry an additional meaning potential that has to be explored and carried over into the target language.” (Schmid 1999: 1).

It is a feature of both spoken and written communication that the verbal messages, which we convey are organized into structured segments or sentences. Whilst there are by definition differences between the types of sentences formulated in spoken and written communication there is in both cases a requirement to convey information in structured segments so that they can be processed by the recipient of the message. It is therefore instructive to begin by considering the link between sentence structure and meaning from a general perspective.

**Syntax, sentence structure and meaning in translation.**

Scholars, including Givón (1993), Finegan (1994) Schmid (1999) and more recently many others, have noted how syntactic structure generates meaning in sentences. We will here limit ourselves to a discussion of these three authors. Finegan states that: “In all languages one principal function of syntax is to encode pragmatic information. What differs from language to language is the way in which pragmatic structure maps onto syntax.” (Finegan 1994: 199). This has implications for the transfer of meaning when translating between languages with different syntactical rules for the structure of sentences.

### 2 Theoretical Background

Givón’s analysis of the connection between grammar and language in *English Grammar A Function-Based Introduction* (1993) is particularly relevant to the communicative focus of this research, as it identifies the link between grammatical structure and communication in language in a general sense. Givón (1993: 2) describes the rules of syntax as the means by which “coherent communication”, in the form of grammatically correct sentences, is produced. Givón uses the analogy of a biological organism or an instrument to convey his view of the integral connection between the grammatical form and the function of language. For example, he stresses the interdependence of grammatical structure and language by comparing it with the interdependence of the structure and function of a biological organism (ibid.).

Givón’s recognition that syntax and meaning are inextricably related within one language leads to the logical question that if form and meaning are connected within a language, how then is meaning affected when translating between languages with different structures? Finegan (1994) categorizes three types of meaning in sentences: “referential” (what is actually described); “social” (the social content of what is described) and “affective” (the emotional connotation of what is said) (Finegan 1994: 127). This paper will be principally concerned with the translation of affective meaning as defined above by Finegan. Like Givón, Finegan describes syntax as “encoding” meaning in sentences (Finegan 1994: 218) and he recognises that word order can affect meaning in sentences in all languages (Finegan 1994: 127).
2.1 Word order: contrastive linguistics’ different ways in which languages express meaning through structure

This study, will concentrate on how sentence structure, in the sense of word order, can affect affective meaning in the translation of spoken dialog into subtitles.

Sentences are composed of different elements, which can be combined in different ways to create different meanings. The organization of words in a sentence produces its meaning. The three basic elements in the structure of a sentence are the subject, the object and the verb and there are variations across languages in the way in which these elements are ordered.

In her study of linguistic typology, Jae Jung Song observes that there are two methods of ordering sentence constituents in languages; “Basic word order” and “flexible or free word order” (Song 2001: 1,2). Jung Song’s categories correspond to Johnson’s distinction between “syntactic” and “pragmatic” word order (Johnson 1998: 172) or Bally’s distinction between “ordre grammatical” and “ordre psychologique” (Bally 1944: 106).

In syntactically ordered sentences, the sequence of the sentence elements is determined purely by grammatical function whereas in pragmatically ordered sentences the sequence of the sentence elements is determined by the communicative intention of the speaker.

(a) Example of syntactically ordered sentence:
Subject  Verb  Object
She kept the weekends open for me.

(b) Example of pragmatically ordered sentence:
Object  Subject  Verb
The weekends she kept open for me. (Cornwall’s example cited in Schmid 1999: 118)

Thus whilst syntactic or basic word order is characterized by rigidity and focused on the information content of the message, pragmatic or communicative word order is characterized by flexibility and focused on the impact of the words, which goes beyond the factual content of the message. By altering the order of the sentence elements from the syntactic SVO (subject, verb, object) order in sentence (a) above to a pragmatic object subject verb order in sentence (b) the writer has introduced a new focus and emphasis on “the weekends”, which is not present in the syntactically ordered sentence.

This study will concentrate on the translation of pragmatically ordered sentences. It could be argued that pragmatically ordered sentences are particularly associated with spoken communication where emphasis and emotion tend to be expressed spontaneously by the speaker, which in itself has implications for the subtitling process.

2.2 Word Order and Information Structure

As Schmid observes, word order plays an important role in the information flow of the message: „information is predominantly coded by word order in most languages” (Schmid 1999: 27)

As Finegan explains, in contrast with syntactic structure, which is language-specific, categories of information structure are not language-dependent. As the encoding of pragmatic information is one of the main functions of syntax, the way in which this information is conveyed varies in accordance with the syntactic structures of different languages. (Finegan 1989: 199) The translator therefore needs to develop sensitivity to the pragmatic function of the word order which is determined by the syntactic constraints of the Source Language in order to be able to transfer it into the Target Language.
Similarly, the subtitler needs to be aware of the nuances of pragmatic meaning expressed by the word order in the spoken dialog as they may contribute to the characterization and plot development of the film. As the viewer has to assimilate the written information in a subtitle in the 5–7 seconds that the subtitle is on the screen, the subtitler needs to aim to retain the impact of the spoken word within the constraints of this medium.

Scholars including Doherty (2002), Schmid (1999) and Chafe (1979) argue that there is a universal tendency for information to be structured in accordance with the functioning of the cognitive processes. Chafe, for example, describes sentences as “especially crucial ways of organising cognitive material” (Chafe 1979:164) and suggests that language is structured in sequences of sentences, centered on “foci” or units of stored information (Chafe 1979: 180) which reflect the thought process.

In this sense, the movement from given to new information, which is described by Schmid (1999:44) as a common principle across languages, could be seen as a way of both reflecting the thought process and also of facilitating language processing. The structural division of a sentence into theme (given information) followed by a rheme (new information), proposed by certain theorists including Firbas (1972) and Halliday (1985) can also be explained in terms of the facilitation of cognitive processing.

As Downing (1992) notes, certain theorists justify the theme-rheme sentence structure on the grounds that it corresponds to a cognitive tendency to proceed from known to unknown information. Gernsbacher and Hargreaves (1988), for example, consider this sequence to be a logical strategy for presenting old information as an “anchor” in the theme section of the sentence to which new thematic material can then be attached in the rheme (1988). Whilst Fox and Thompson suggest that the theme-rheme sequence enables the speaker to begin a sentence by “grounding” new information in the theme before going on to present it in the rheme (Downing 1992:15). Indeed, as Downing explains, Jarvella (1979) has demonstrated that the final element in a sentence tends to be the most memorable, which also supports the notion that the theme-rheme sequence facilitates cognitive processing (Downing 1995:16).

However, as Mithun explains, the theme-rheme sentence structure is not universal across languages (Mithun 1995: 388) and the reversal of this sequence can also be shown to be linked to the way in which information is processed by the recipient. For example, the speaker may choose to give prominence to new information or rhematic material by placing it in the initial position of a sentence and this corresponds to the tendency for intonation in a spoken sentence to decrease progressively from the beginning to the end of the sentence (Mithun 1995: 412). In this sense, the translation of the sentence-initial element from the spoken dialog into a subtitle could be said to be of particular importance in the subtitling process.

Thus, as mentioned above, the information conveyed by speakers is not purely propositional and different types of speaker-based, non-propositional meaning can be created through variations in the word order of a sentence. For example, the speaker may wish to; establish social position; express emotion or emphasis; or simply to convey information in a way, which corresponds to the receiver’s capacity to process information (Downing 1992: 9, Schmid 1999: 7, 43). These different types of pragmatic meaning could be said to correspond broadly to Cowan’s distinction between “cognitive” and “rhetorical” discourse principles to determine word order (Cowan 1995: 29), the rhetorical principle being applicable to the expression of emotion or emphasis.

As both theme-rheme and rheme-theme types of sentence structure can be shown to be related to the creation of pragmatic meaning in a sentence, the subtitler arguably needs to be able to interpret the pragmatic significance of the ordering of theme and rheme elements in sentences in the spoken dialog in order to be able to translate this into the written subtitle where possible. When analysing sentences in the discourse of a film it is therefore particularly instructive to be able to differentiate between marked and unmarked structures.
3  Marked Structures

The definition of a “marked” sentence or clause implies that it has features, which distinguish it from an “unmarked” type of sentence and indeed that the unmarked is the preferred or standard form (Schmid 1999:45). This also implies that the same sentence elements could be presented in either the marked or the unmarked order however the marked sentence stands out as unusual in implicit comparison with the conventionally ordered unmarked sentence. Although the “unmarked” sentence could be described as standard or conventional this does not mean that it is used more often than the “marked” sentence. Indeed, Dryer argues that unmarked word order is not necessarily used more frequently than marked word order and considers the term “default word order” to be a more accurate definition of pragmatically unmarked word order (Dryer 1995:105).

As the purpose of a marked sentence is to express the communicative intention of the speaker it is “cognitively more complex” than the unmarked version. The information content of both marked and unmarked versions of the same sentence may be the same but the use of a marked structure generally communicates a different shade of meaning (Haiman 1980:517)

For example, by changing the SVO sequence to OSV in the following sentence the object “you” is brought into sharp focus in comparison with the same word in the same sentence with the elements arranged in the standard SVO sequence:

Marked word order:

“Bua<\textit{you} we’ll miss said Cai regretfully.” (Peters 1977:238 cited in Schmid 1999:49)

Unmarked word order:

“But we’ll miss you said Cai regretfully” (ibid.).

This sentence also illustrates Schmid’s observation that variations on the basic structure can be used to perform different functions in the discourse including the expression of emphasis or emotion (ibid.).

The use of the marked structure in this example can be interpreted as suggesting both emphasis and emotion.

4  Rigidity of the Structure of English

The English language has a rigid word order system: the normal or unmarked order of elements in an English sentence is SVO (subject, verb, object) and the information structure of a standard sentence proceeds from given to new information (ibid.). The sentence elements can be manipulated to express pragmatic meaning in English and the effect of changing the standard sequence of elements is particularly noticeable in comparison with the rigidity of the unmarked standard sentence structure

Creider identifies English as a language which manipulates the linear order of the sentence for discourse purposes (Creider 1979:15). However, whilst Firbas argues that the inherent inflexibility of the elements in an English sentence limits the capacity of the English language as a means of expressing emotion (Firbas 1992:135) this is surely dependant on the degree of skill with which the writer or speaker can manipulate the language within the constraints of the syntax.
Schmid identifies clefting as a structural device, which can be used to express the perspective of the speaker. In a clefted sentence the order of the sentence elements is altered in order to give prominence to one or more of the elements. For example:

**Unmarked word order:**
The cat chased the mouse. (my example)

**Marked word** order using cleft construction:
What the cat chased was the mouse.
It was the mouse that the cat chased.

Whilst the propositional content of both the marked and the unmarked sentences is the same there is a difference in perspective and focus. In the two clefted sentences the direct object, the mouse, is brought into focus by being shifted to the sentence initial position whereas in the unmarked sentence the subject, the cat, is the main focus of the sentence.

A clefted sentence illustrates the way in which the rigid English sentence structure can be manipulated to convey emphasis or emotion. It also demonstrates the fact that the use of a marked sentence in English stands out in implicit contrast with the standard unmarked sentence, which makes it a particularly effective method of conveying the speaker’s communicative intention.

As the focus of this study is the translation of emotionally and emphatically ordered utterances into English subtitles it is important to understand the nature of the structural constraints as outlined above, which restrict the way emotion and emphasis can be expressed in written English. It is also important to be aware of the type of strategies strategies like clefting, which can be used to manipulate the structural constraints of the language in order to express communicative meaning more effectively.

The contrasting theories of Halliday and Firbas will now be briefly examined to provide insight into the theoretical significance of the analysis of the structure of both spoken and written sentences.

### 5 Halliday’s Approach to Theme-Rheme Analysis

The systemic theory of language on which Halliday’s analysis of sentence structure is based, echoes the communicative focus of my research, for it is a theory which examines the notion that meaning in linguistic expression is determined by the speaker (Halliday 1985). By examining the role of choice in the generation of meaning through language Halliday’s approach tends to focus on the communicative intention of the speaker.

In Halliday’s view every sentence contains a theme and a rheme, which combine to form a message (Halliday 1985:38). Halliday interprets the significance of the linear structure of the sentence in the light of systemic theory and divides the sentence into two sections: the Theme and the Rheme, which correspond roughly to the grammatical categories of subject and predicate: “the Theme is that with which the clause is concerned. The remainder of the message, the part in which the Theme is developed, is called…the Rheme” (Halliday 1985:38).

According to Halliday the linear sequence of the Theme and the Rheme is fixed in that the theme must always occupy the initial position in the sentence. However, Halliday’s adherence to systemic theory is demonstrated by his observation that the speaker is free to choose which elements of the sentence fulfil these roles and that they can be manipulated according to his/her communicative intention.
Halliday equates the thematic structure of the sentence to its information structure and remarks that the Theme section includes the old or the given information, whilst the Rheme contains the new information and is consequently the most important part of the message (Halliday 1985: 56, 60). Halliday identifies certain variations on this sequence and demonstrates how they can affect the meaning of the sentence.

As noted earlier in this study any change to the normal word order is described as “marked” and can alter the perspective of the sentence. Halliday identifies a number of marked structures in English including the clefted construction. Any element in an English sentence can be shifted to the sentence’s initial position by means of a construction, which Halliday calls the “predicated theme” (ibid.). For instance, by using the “it cleft” construction as in: “It was the queen who sent my uncle that hat-stand” (ibid.). Or in the more colloquial statement:

**Spoken dialog:**

“It’s them, they’re making fun of me.”

Halliday explains that: “The predicated Theme structure is frequently associated with an explicit formulation of contrast: it was…it was not…who…” (Halliday 1985:60).

Halliday thus suggests a linear method for the analysis of the significance of sentence structure. However, whilst Halliday’s study demonstrates that the order of elements in a sentence can affect the meaning it is important to note that his arguments and analysis are based solely on the English language and do not take account of languages with different types of sentence structure. Therefore in this research Halliday’s analytical method is relevant to the analysis of the structures in the subtitles in English, the Target Language but less relevant to the analysis of the dialog spoken in French, the Source Language.

### 6 Firbas’ Approach to Theme-Rheme Analysis

In contrast, the theories of Firbas are based on his study of several languages (Schmid 1999: 31), which could account for the difference in his approach. Firbas’ Theory of Functional Sentence Perspective and the related concept of Communicative Dynamism assess the distribution of information elements within a sentence according to their communicative value as well as their linear sequence. According to Firbas, what he terms the Functional Perspective of a sentence is determined by the communicative content or the Communicative Dynamism of the sentence elements rather than by their linear position. (Firbas 1999:130).

Firbas’ emphasis on the communicative meaning of sentence structure is particularly relevant to the analysis of pragmatically ordered sentences in languages with a less rigid structure than English.

Moreover, Firbas’ recognition that Communicative Dynamism can only be measured in a relative sense means that it “remains a rather intuitive way of classifying elements” (Schmid 1999: 30), which echoes my own perception that the analysis and translation of the emotional component of meaning in sentences may also require a degree of intuition.
7 Subtitling Marked Structures

Subtitle a “crossover” genre
Due to the nature of the medium the subtitle like the dramatic text represents a shift between the oral and the written genres: it intersects both genres and the transfer from the spoken to the written mode is not straightforward. When subtitling the translator begins with both an oral Source Text and its transcript and produces a written Target Text, which is suitable for silent reading although it may include some features, which suggest “the oral origins of the Source Text.” This complex interplay between the spoken and written modes has led Hervey and Higgins to describe the subtitle as a “crossover genre” (Hervey and Higgins 1992:158)

Subtitling Spoken Dialog
The subtitling of a film is principally concerned with the translation of spoken dialog into the constrained written form of the subtitle. The information content, the momentum and the emotional impact of the structures used in the spoken dialog need to be translated into a condensed text in a language with a different grammatical system and therefore a different potential for ordering the elements in a sentence.

In addition to the grammatical rules of the language concerned word order in discourse is also determined by the pragmatic role of the utterance in the context of the dialog. It is this combination of the syntactic and the pragmatic functions of the information structure of the dialog, which is of particular relevance to the subtitling process.

Whilst the words in written dialog in written texts need to suggest the shades of meaning conveyed by non-verbal communication in spoken dialog in subtitled dialog meaning can also be conveyed by non-verbal signs and visual images on the screen. In order to analyze subtitled discourse it is therefore necessary to understand the tension between written and spoken language and visual images, which is peculiar to the audiovisual medium.

The notion of the transfer of emphatic meaning into subtitles raises intriguing translation issues. When interpreting the affective meaning in the subtitled text, the communicative function of the sentence structure also needs to be considered with reference to the role of the sentence structure in the spoken dialog. It is also important to be aware of the nuances of meaning in the linguistic expressions, which are not conveyed by the audiovisual elements of the medium.

8 Read my Lips Analysis
The French film Read my Lips (Sur mes Lèvres) directed by Jaques Audiard has been selected as a case study for this analysis as the deafness of the main character is an integral aspect of the theme of the film and it adds an interesting dimension to the subtitles. The main character Carla (Emmanuelle Devos) is deaf and her disability is carefully integrated into the plot and the dialog of the film. From the outset Audiard draws the attention of the viewer to Carla’s impaired hearing, indeed the importance of Carla’s deafness to the plot is suggested by the fact that the opening shot of the film shows her carefully inserting a hearing aid into her ear. As the dialog and sounds in the film are presented primarily from Carla’s perspective the subtitles have the added function of drawing the attention of the viewer to the way in which sound and spoken dialog is perceived by a deaf person.
Scene 2: I know Sign Language

This short scene near the beginning of the film has no subtitles. It reinforces the theme of Carla’s deafness as the entire scene consists of an exchange between Carla and a deaf man who communicate solely through sign language and facial expressions. The lack of subtitles in the scene subtly reminds the viewer of the necessity for subtitles and also gives a brief impression of a deaf person’s experience of silent communication. The man places a key ring in front of Carla and the two characters proceed to communicate in sign language through a series of rapid hand gestures accompanied by facial expressions. Carla’s expression appears to indicate her dissatisfaction with the man’s suggestion.

As the scene is shown without subtitles it demonstrates that total reliance on visual images is insufficient to convey details of a conversation. Despite visual clues including the key ring and the facial expressions of the two characters the precise meaning of the exchange is not clear to a viewer who does not understand sign language.

By placing this scene near the beginning of the film the director also ensures that the ensuing subtitled scenes are framed by the context of sign language.

Scene 3: Starting a new job, Lunch in the work cafeteria

Carla is having lunch with Paul, an ex convict and her new colleague at work. Over lunch Paul discovers that Carla is able to lip read as she is able to understand the conversation of colleagues at a table, which is too far away for the conversation to be overheard. He inquires why Carla appears to be concerned by their conversation.

Paul “What’s up? Did I say something wrong?”

Carla replies:

Spoken dialog: C’est eux, ils se moquent de moi.

Subtitle: They’re making fun of me.

Literal translation: It’s them, they’re making fun of me.

In this exchange Carla’s spoken words emphasize the identity of the men who are speaking about her. The marked it cleft structure “It is them” reinforces the theme that just as her deafness isolates her from the speaking, hearing world Carla is an outsider and a victim in the organization. By omitting the marked structure the subtitle misses this nuance of meaning or “elusive meaning component”, which subtly affects the characterization and the development of the plot.

In this example I would suggest that the literal translation “It’s them…” which includes a cleft construction could be used to succinctly convey the emphasis and to suggest the intonation of the spoken sentence. Moreover the colloquial ring and the imperfect grammar of the phrase “It’s them” is characteristic of spoken language.

A little later in the same scene Paul discovers that Carla needs to wear a hearing aid. He asks:

“You mean you’re deaf?”

Carla replies by pointing to her hearing aids and states:

Spoken dialog: «C’est pour faire quoi ça? C’est pour faire joli?”

Subtitle: What are these? Ear rings?

Literal translation: What is that for? Is it to make me look pretty?
The marked structure “C’est pour…” is repeated twice in the spoken dialog in the Source Language. The rhetorical force of the repetition of the marked structure and the intensity of the pointed questions reinforce the sense of Carla’s indignation as a plain woman who needs to wear a hearing aid.

The subtitle is enhanced by the visual image of Carla pointing at her hearing aids and her indignant facial expression but the questions “What are these? Ear rings?” sound flat and neutral in comparison with the emotive force of the French dialog, which in turn alters the complex characterization of Carla, the central character in the film.

**Spoken dialog:** C’est pour faire quoi ça? C’est pour faire jolie?

**Literal translation:** What is that for? Is it to make me look pretty? (my translation)

**Subtitle:** What are these? Ear rings?

Again I would suggest that a more effective subtitle should attempt to repeat the emotional force and emphasis of the marked structures in the Source Language dialog.

Possible alternative translations would be:

What are these for? For my looks? (my translation)

or

What are these for? For decoration? (translation suggested by Penny Eley)

**Scene 4**

In this scene Carla is dismayed that a male colleague takes over the project, which she has been working on and which is near completion. When she protests the colleague, who is incidentally the same character who had previously mocked her in the restaurant, dismisses her protest contemptuously. Carla returns to her office in a state of hysteria crying and throwing files onto the floor whilst exclaiming.

**Spoken dialog:**

Ça fait 3 ans que je travaille ici…

Ça fait trois ans que je fais la bonne.

Ça fait trois ans que je monte leurs dossiers de A à Z que je mens à leurs femmes.

**Literal translation:**

“That makes three years that I’ve been working here.

That makes three years that I have been the maid.

That makes three years that I have been filing their documents from A to Z, that I have been lying to their wives…” (My translation)

**Subtitle:** For 3 years I’ve slaved for them, doing all their work, lying to their wives…

In the Source Language dialog Carla’s bitter disappointment and frustration are reinforced by the repetition of the marked structure “Ça fait 3 ans que…” In the subtitle the repetition of this phrase is omitted and the rhetorical force of the repetition of three short, sharp pointed sentences is diluted by being condensed into one longer sentence spread over two frames.
This means that the emotional force and the rhetorical effect of Carla’s desperate tirade are diminished in the Target Text.

The marked structure “Ça fait trois ans que” corresponds to Halliday’s concept of the predicated theme, which conveys emphasis or contrast or to use Firbas’ terminology the Communicative Dynamism of this sentence is located in the fronted initial initial element. By placing the marked phrase “Ça fait trois ans que…” at the beginning of three consecutive short sentences in the spoken dialog the amount of time, which Carla has spent working in the company is strongly emphasized and her subsequent anger and frustration is more understandable.

Thus the sentence structure in the Source Language dialog reinforces the emotional impact of Carla’s words and contributes to the characterization and the development of the plot for Carla’s frustration at her contemptuous treatment by her colleagues in the organization leads her to seek revenge. The emphasis of the marked structures in the Source Language dialog is lost in the subtitle, where Carla’s words become a more generalized complaint.

Alternative translations, which attempt to duplicate the rhetorical force of the repeated marked structure in the Source Language dialog could be:

“For 3 whole years I’ve worked here”.
“For three whole years I’ve been their maid”.
“For three whole years I’ve lied to their wives…” (my translation)
or
“Three years I’ve worked here. Three years as their skivvy. Three years doing their filing, lying to their wives.” (translation suggested by Penny Eley)

Moreover, it could be argued that the alliterative repetition of a short sharp phrase as a fronted element in a written subtitle represents a possible strategy for conveying some of the emphatic intonation of the spoken dialog in the written form.

9 Conclusion

This investigation is an initial exploration into how the communicative meaning of marked structures in spoken dialog is affected by the process of being translated into subtitles. Through the detailed examination of a small number of examples a pattern is beginning to emerge, which suggests that an analysis of the function of the marked structure in the Source Language dialog could be used to inform the translation into subtitles and that it could help to prevent the loss of nuances of meaning, which contribute to both characterization and plot development in the film.

Despite the constraints of space and the complex process of transferring spoken language into written text it still appears possible that certain strategies can be used to retain some of the flavour and emotional impact of the spoken dialog in the written form. In this study clefting has been identified as one strategy which may be used to succinctly express the emotional connotations of spoken utterances and also to retain some of the features of spoken language in the written subtitle.

Further research is required in this direction but it appears that an understanding of marked structures in both Source and Target Languages may assist the translator to transfer more “elusive meaning components” from the Source Language dialog into the Target Language subtitle.
10 References

Firbas, Jan (1982): “Has Every Sentence a Theme and a Rheme?” In John Anderson (ed.): *Language Form and Linguistic Variation: Papers dedicated to Angus Mackintosh*. John Benjamins Amsterdam/Philadelphia.
Linguistic Variation in Subtitling
The subtitling of swearwords and discourse markers on public television, commercial television and DVD

Abstract
This article focuses on the Swedish subtitling of two different linguistic features, i.e. swearwords and discourse markers. The material in question consists of one source text, the American film Nurse Betty, and three translations of this film; one was made for the public TV channel SVT1, one for the commercial TV channel TV3, and one for the DVD release of the same film. The subtitling of both swearwords and discourse markers are analysed quantitatively as well as qualitatively in order to see whether any patterns of translation emerge, and how these can possibly be explained. Results show that a high frequency of omission of both features in all three target texts may have its origin in a system of norms governing Swedish original written works and translations, and that the subtitling of swearwords, for various reasons, is more inclined to abide by these norms than is the subtitling of discourse markers, which in turn is governed by additional factors.

1 Introduction
Sweden is one of the countries in the world where subtitling is most extensively used. According to the Swedish Ministry of Culture (2003: 238), people in Sweden spend an average of 1 ½ hours per day reading subtitles and 20 minutes reading other material, a fact which in itself makes research in this area imperative. In the same report the Swedish Ministry of Culture has also stated (2003: 239) that the quality of subtitling in Sweden is of high importance, and that a study of the different TV channels’ methods of subtitling should be performed.

This statement influenced the current and ongoing study from which this article proceeds. The study in its entirety is the basis for my PhD thesis which focuses on the subtitling of American films into Swedish on four different Swedish TV channels (SVT1, SVT2, TV3 and TV4), and DVD-releases. The aim of the thesis is to compare the subtitling from three different sources, i.e. public television (SVT1 and SVT2), commercial television (TV3 and

1 SVT1 and SVT2 are two different channels, but they both belong to Swedish public television and abide by the same system and laws.
TV4) and DVD, and to identify similarities and variations found in the different translations. All channels chosen are easily accessible by most Swedes and are among the most viewed television channels, compared to less accessible channels such as ZTV, TV1000 and Canal+ (Mediamätningar i Skandinavien, MMS 2005). The two SVT channels, being public and state-owned, are considered serious and of high quality with a focus on news, cultural events, documentaries etc. while TV3, being a commercial channel, is not considered very serious or of comparable high quality with a focus on light entertainment. In between these extremes TV4 is positioned, which is a commercial channel with a mixture of more serious programs and lighter entertainment. In my PhD thesis I plan to include different types of television channels in order to identify differences between the channels in question, and investigate reasons as to why these differences occur and can be linked to the type of channel and/or the translating agency which subtitled the film. DVD-versions of the films are also included in the study to provide further insight into the subtitling of films in Sweden today.

This article will show parts of my ongoing study; with the aim to discuss the translation of two different linguistic features, i.e. swearwords and discourse markers within the framework of three different translations of the American film Nurse Betty (Gramercy Pictures 2000). The subtitles investigated are taken from the SVT1, the TV3 and the DVD-versions. The case study focuses on quantitative as well as qualitative aspects of the three target texts. The main focus is on the question of why one feature is treated almost identically in the three different subtitling environments, while the other is not or at least not to the same extent. Swearwords and discourse markers are looked at individually - quantitatively as well as qualitatively, to give a clearer overview of the material. The study will discuss variations between the source text (ST) and the three target texts (TTs) on the one hand, and between the three TTs on the other, and will raise questions concerning the reasons for these variations. One suggested motivation for both the similarities and differences of how swearwords and discourse markers are subtitled in Sweden today are target culture translational norms. In addition to a discussion of possible norms governing the subtitling of swearwords and discourse markers, other factors, such as the varying subtitling standards at each television channel or translating agency, will be considered.

## 2 Method and material

The material used for this case study is the source text, consisting of the complete transcribed soundtrack of the American film Nurse Betty, and the target texts, consisting of three translations of Nurse Betty, also transcribed in their entirety. SVT Undertext AB subtitled the film for SVT and SVT1 aired it on August 12th 2005, SDI Mediagroup subtitled the film for TV3, and it was aired on this channel on November 11th 2005, while Mediatextgruppen subtitled the DVD-version (the subtitles made by SVT Undertext, SDI Mediagroup and Mediatextgruppen will be referred to as ‘the SVT1 subtitles’, ‘the TV3 subtitles’ and ‘the DVD subtitles’, respectively, cf. below). The SVT1 and the DVD subtitles were made by the same subtitler, a fact that obviously influences the analyses made in this study, even though it is one of the intentions of this article to focus not on the individual subtitlers as such, but on the larger system within which they work.

The film Nurse Betty was chosen mainly because it was aired on two channels within a few months in the fall 2005. It was therefore of interest for a synchronic contrastive study of

---

2 Subtitling standards are referred to in this article as the more or less rigid guidelines/rules dictated by authoritative powers at the TV channels or translating agencies.
the subtitling in different channels, as well as on DVD. Furthermore, the quantity of swearwords and discourse markers is quite high in the film, and it is thus a good source for investigating the translation of these particular features.

Swearwords and discourse markers were selected as linguistic features for this case study for various reasons. Both features are common in informal conversation and thus of interest for a study on film dialog. Also, previous studies on these features in subtitling are not numerous (cf. Chen 2004; Chaume 2004) which legitimizes the present research. In addition, swearwords and discourse markers are similar in that they are both considered unnecessary for the progress of a film’s storyline itself; but only add more or less redundant information to the plot. On the other hand, they can both be of quite substantial importance for how a certain character appears on screen; e.g. the writers of the original film script might have added extra swearwords in the lines of a character to make him/her seem more aggressive, and extra discourse markers may have been added in another character’s language to make him/her appear as hesitant. Both features may thus seem less important for the comprehension of a film compared to the importance of e.g. nouns and verbs but the support a viewer gets through the sound and image on the screen helps him/her in establishing sense continuity and can actually be very important when trying to “[establish] a coherent interpretation of discourse” (Aijmer 2002). One clear difference between swearwords and discourse markers is the fact that swearwords are taboo, whereas discourse markers are not. There might thus be a difference between the way the two features are treated, both in the ST and in the TTs.

3 Swearwords and discourse markers in Nurse Betty

Swearwords are defined by Ljung (1984: 22) and Andersson (2004: 78) as, in short, words deriving from subjects of taboo, being used as expressions of anger, surprise etc. A swearword is not any ‘dirty’ word, but a word referring to a subject of taboo in a certain circumstance; the primary function of a word like shit, for instance, is to refer to human or animal excrement. It has, however, through frequent usage as “a concept our culture sees as taboo […] gained a widened meaning and become a dirty word, a swearword” (Karjalaninen 2002: 13).

Discourse markers are defined as “a class of lexical expressions that link the interpretation of a segment …to a prior segment” (Bibliography of pragmatics 2005), and as “[expressing] the speaker’s attitude towards the situation spoken about, his assumptions, his intentions, his emotions” (Aijmer 2002: 12). Examples of discourse markers are well, oh, okay, right, like etc.

3.1 A quantitative and qualitative overview of the material

The total number of swearwords in the Nurse Betty soundtrack is 132, whereas the total number in each of the TTs does not exceed 50; SVT1 includes 49 swearwords in their subtitles while TV3 includes 47, and the DVD subtitles include 50, which, for each translation, is a total of 37 % of the swearwords used in the ST.

The amount of swearwords omitted from the ST (63%) is thus almost identical in the three subtitle versions. Furthermore, the types of swearwords used in all three translations and the quantity of swearwords from each type, match the same categories of swearwords, the division of swearwords here being based on categories suggested by Andersson (2004: 79) and McNerney (2006: 30), i.e. ‘Religion’ (God, Jesus Christ), ‘Sex’ (fuck), ‘Excrements’ (shit), ‘Sexist terms of abuse’ (bitch) and ‘Physical and mental handicaps’ (idiot).
Fig. 1: Total number of swearwords in ST and TTs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Source Text</th>
<th>SVT1</th>
<th>TV3</th>
<th>DVD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Religion</td>
<td>29 (22%)</td>
<td>37 (76%)</td>
<td>29 (62%)</td>
<td>38 (73%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex</td>
<td>56 (42%)</td>
<td>1 (2%)</td>
<td>1 (2%)</td>
<td>1 (2%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Excrements</td>
<td>36 (27%)</td>
<td>6 (12%)</td>
<td>8 (17%)</td>
<td>6 (12%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sexist terms of abuse</td>
<td>7 (5%)</td>
<td>1 (2%)</td>
<td>3 (6%)</td>
<td>1 (2%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Handicaps</td>
<td>4 (3%)</td>
<td>4 (8%)</td>
<td>6 (13%)</td>
<td>4 (8%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>132</strong></td>
<td><strong>49</strong></td>
<td><strong>47</strong></td>
<td><strong>50</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: Total numbers and percentages of different swearword categories in Nurse Betty

As can be seen in table 1 above, the majority of the swearwords in the ST (42%) come from the ‘Sex’ category, whereas most of the TT swearwords originate in the ‘Religion’ category. There is a vast difference between the percentages of the ‘Sex’ category swearwords in the ST and the TTs. Only 2% of the swearwords in either TT originate from the category ‘Sex’, compared to 42% in the ST. There is thus a difference between the ST and the three TTs, but the TTs do not differ significantly when compared to each other.

The discourse markers looked at in the Nurse Betty soundtrack are of 24 different types, where *Oh, Well, So, Okay, Now, You know, Right, Hey, I mean* and *Alright* are the ten most frequent ones. The four most recurrent ones are *Oh*, occurring 62 times, *Well* 42 times, *So* 31 times and *Okay* 25 times. As can be seen in table 2 below, the total number of discourse markers of different kinds in the ST, i.e. the number of tokens, is 273, while the translations differ somewhat in frequency; the SVT1 subtitles include 83 Swedish discourse markers, divided among 24 types; the TV3 subtitles include 48, divided among 14 types; and the DVD subtitles include 95, divided among 26 types.

---

3 The percentages in the tables are whole numbers (no decimals), which sometimes adds up to a total number of less than 100%.
Not all of the TT discourse markers are in complete quantitative agreement with the ST, but sometimes appear when there is no discourse marker in the ST (this is especially common in the DVD-version, which may explain the higher number of discourse markers here). The highest frequency of Swedish discourse markers in the TTs of *Nurse Betty* is found in the DVD subtitles, with the SVT1 subtitles consisting of almost as many types and tokens. Quantitatively, the TV3 subtitles include about half (51%) of the amount of discourse markers in the DVD subtitles, and just over half (58%) of the amount in the SVT1 version.

The types included in the TV3 subtitles are much fewer than those in both the SVT1 and the DVD versions, reducing the variation in the use of discourse markers in the TV3 version. Note, however, that the amount of discourse marker types hardly differs between the ST and the SVT1 and DVD TTs.

The subtitling of discourse markers thus differs quantitatively and qualitatively quite significantly between the ST and the TTs, as well as between the public television channel and DVD-version on the one hand, and between the commercial television channel on the other hand.

### 4 Factors governing the different translations

After this overview of the quantity and quality of both swearwords and discourse markers in the three subtitling versions of *Nurse Betty*, an attempt will be made to answer two questions arising from the previous facts and figures.

The first question concerns the comparison between the ST and the TTs, and is asked relative to the subtitling of both swearwords and discourse markers: (1) why is such a vast amount of either feature omitted in the subtitles, and (2) why are certain types of either feature chosen over other types?

Regarding swearwords, why are only 37% of the ST swearwords translated into Swedish in each TT, and why do Swedish subtitlers choose words from the traditional ‘Religion’ category, when spoken Swedish today - due to influences from other languages (Bokenblom 2005: 29; The Swedish Language Council, 2006: 331) - increasingly uses a great amount and variety of swearwords from the ‘Sex’ category.

As far as discourse markers are concerned, why are not more than 35% of the ST discourse markers translated into either TT (30% in the SVT1, 18% in the TV3 and 35% in the DVD subtitles), and why is there a tendency in subtitling not to include the discourse markers most used by, especially younger, Swedes today (e.g. *liksom* and *typ* [approximate translation: *like*], but to adhere to the more traditional types (e.g. *ju*, *väl* etc.) of discourse markers (The Swedish Language Council 2006: 332).

The second question focuses on the comparison between the three TTs relating to the differences and similarities among the translations. Why is it that there is such a minor difference, both quantitatively and qualitatively, between the various target texts’ way of subtitling American swearwords into Swedish, when there is quite a considerable difference, especially quantitatively, between the subtitling of discourse markers in the same target texts?

The answers below are not meant to be exhaustive in any way, but are intended to list

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tokens/Types</th>
<th>ST</th>
<th>SVT1</th>
<th>TV3</th>
<th>DVD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tokens</td>
<td>273</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Types</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Tab. 2: Number of tokens and types of discourse markers in NB*
some possible reasons behind the subtitling of swearwords and discourse markers from American English into Swedish in the film under investigation. The proposed answers are, however, a starting point for further investigations and applications to additional studies on the subtitling of such features.

4.1 Norms governing the subtitling of swearwords and discourse markers

The fact that subtitling is governed by time and space constraints is a well-known fact and will not be disputed here. However, such constraints are not the only motivations for the final design of a subtitle (Fawcett 2003: 145) some of which will be discussed here.

The model introduced below is influenced by Karamitroglou’s (2000: 70) way of seeing subtitling not in a vacuum, but as a part of a larger system. The framework of Karamitroglou’s model has its origin in the idea that subtitlers are not the only persons influencing the translation. Karamitroglou sees a final translation product as being dependent on “the interaction between the elements [or factors] which constitute the system and the levels at which these elements/factors operate” (2000: 69). His model, which can only be outlined here in a reduced and simplified version, is based on the relationship between, on the one hand, hierarchical levels of what he calls the system, and on the other, free-flowing equal factors. In his model, the hierarchical levels are labelled Upper, Middle and Lower level, and the equal factors are labelled Human agents, Products, Recipients, and Audiovisual Mode. A norm can derive “from a higher level and reflect a more general phenomenon rather than be restricted to the situation where we first discovered it” (2000: 69). A norm detected at the lower level of Human agents, Products, Recipients or Audiovisual mode, might derive from the upper level of the same factor. Karamitroglou’s model is to some extent incorporated into the model in Fig. 2 below to show that norms governing the translation of swearwords and discourse markers in Swedish subtitled material may in fact derive from norms of a ‘higher level’, governing the production of original written work in Sweden, as well as the translation of the same types of words in literature translated into Swedish. The model will not be applied here in its entirety, but merely as a structural orientation for the study.

What follows below (Fig. 2) is a suggestion of the way subtitling of swearwords and discourse markers in Sweden operates: not on their own as individual categories within the system of subtitling only, but in connection with other systems in the target culture.

![Fig. 2: Levels of norms governing the subtitling of swearwords and discourse markers](image-url)
A possible answer as to both why the quantity of swearwords and discourse markers is less in the TTs, and why certain types are chosen over others, is that the subtitling of these particular features, possibly more than other linguistic features such as verbs, nouns etc., is governed by certain norms in the target culture. These norms are strong enough to considerably influence (1) the amount of the features to be translated, and (2) the quality, i.e. the target culture types/categories of the features used in the TTs. The power of the norms is so strong because they are interrelated with each other, and more or less ‘work together’. The guiding principle behind the hierarchical layers above (Fig. 2) is the fact that subtitling norms do not exist in a void, but that they derive directly from norms of literary translation. The norms governing literary translation derive from norms of originals written in the target culture, which in turn derive from norms of written and spoken language. The written language norms applicable to both swearwords and discourse markers originate from norms stating how we traditionally use these features in Sweden. The English Swedish Parallel Corpus (ESPC) consisting of comparable English and Swedish written text samples (both fiction and non-fiction) as well as translations of each text into English/Swedish, was used in order to test the hypotheses of the use of swearwords and discourse markers in both Swedish written originals and translations. The hypotheses proved to be true; both quantitatively and qualitatively the same pattern of usage of swearwords and discourse markers that emerge in the subtitling of these features also appears in the Swedish written originals and translations. The study of the ESPC thus confirms the assumption that the omission of swearwords and discourse markers as well as the use of their types/categories in question are governed by similar patterns as the Swedish written originals and translations in the parallel corpus.

Other studies also verify that subtitling often mirrors Swedish literal translation. Karjalainen (2002) confirms a great omission of swearwords in two Swedish translations of J.D. Salinger’s *Catcher in the Rye*, an omission almost identical in percentages to the omission of swearwords in the subtitling of *Nurse Betty* (see Tab.1). The fact that we rarely find swearwords or discourse markers in Swedish written work, and the fact that there are hardly any swearwords from the ‘Sex’ category, nor certain types of discourse markers (e.g. *typ, liksom*) in Swedish written originals, influence the way these words are treated, both quantitatively and qualitatively in literary translation, and as a consequence, in subtitling.

### 4.2 Additional factors governing the subtitling of discourse markers

A system of norms governing the subtitling of swearwords and discourse markers thus seems to be present in the Swedish target culture. This is, however, as we will see below, not the only interesting factor in our findings on the translations. In an attempt to answer question (2) above, we may find an indication for a somewhat broadened picture to the problem. Why is it that, if the norms governing the subtitling of swearwords and discourse markers are so strong, there are still differences between the three target texts’ way of subtitling discourse markers (but not of subtitling swearwords)? One answer is that there is a difference between swearwords and discourse markers in that the former are words of taboo and thus treated with more care than discourse markers, or indeed any other feature of text. The system of norms described above thus seems to be strong through all layers, from the norms of tradition to the norms of literary translation, when it comes to swearwords, hence powerfully governing the subtitling of these features. The same norms do govern the subtitling of discourse markers, but perhaps not as strongly or directly as they do the subtitling of swearwords. A reason for the difference found in this case study between the subtitling of discourse markers in especially (a) public television and DVD, and (b) commercial television, is the standards of subtitling which the different channels and translation companies have set and/or abide by. These standards are also more or less governed by different types of translational norms. In the case of the translation of swearwords, the norms seem to directly govern the standards of
various translating agencies which explains why the TTs are very similar. Relative to discourse markers, the standards at the different channels and companies seem to be almost as powerful as the norms, thus in themselves dictating quantitative and qualitative subtitling choices. According to an extract from the standards at SVT Undertext, which is subtitling for the public television channels SVT1 and SVT2, SVT has a stated standard to include “little words” such as discourse markers into the subtitles whenever possible and thus to be more viewer-oriented and include viewers of different social and linguistic backgrounds as well, e.g. the deaf and hard of hearing. The aspiration to include little words is, it seems, not as noticeable in the commercial channels’ approach to subtitling, a tendency which is mirrored in the lower numbers of discourse marker tokens in the TV3 subtitle for Nurse Betty (Tab. 2).

Another possible reason for the difference between the subtitling rendered by public television and DVD on the one hand, and commercial television on the other, is the fact that the working conditions vary in these specific subtitling environments. At the public television channels SVT1 and SVT2, all subtitles are made by SVT Undertext AB (see footnote 3 below, however) and the majority of the employed subtitlers have extensive education and experience, as well as a higher income than the subtitlers at the commercial channel TV3, which has no subtitlers employed, but uses various translating agencies. The agencies subtitling DVD films employ full-time subtitlers as well as subtitlers on a freelance basis. How these varying working conditions might influence the choices made by individual subtitlers in Sweden has not yet been investigated. A possible model of the influences of certain norms, standards and working conditions might look like Figure 3 below; in which the norms (of tradition, written language, literary translation etc), the working conditions, and the standards of subtitling all affect the final subtitling product.

![Fig. 3: Factors governing the subtitling of discourse markers](image)

Of course, there are numerous other factors influencing a final subtitling product, such as various technical constraints, individual translator preferences and target culture audience expectations. This model is just a preliminary look at the complex system surrounding and governing the subtitling process in Sweden today.

---

4 SVT Undertext AB has (summer/autumn 2006) decided to reform its subtitling production and let external agencies take over the translation of most material aired on SVT1 and SVT2. If /when this takes place the conditions for the subtitled material at SVT will change (i.e. both subtitling standards and working conditions for the subtitlers will change) and the final subtitle product will possibly become more similar to that of the commercial channels.
5 Conclusion

To summarize and conclude, the system of factors affecting the subtitling process in Sweden decides how features such as swearwords and discourse markers are treated in this mode of translation. We have seen that both of these linguistic features are omitted to a large extent in all three target texts, and that the types/categories of features used are significantly influenced by the traditional way of using these words in Swedish written works and translations. There is, however, a discrepancy between the way swearwords and discourse markers are treated in the TTs; the translation of swearwords are very similar both quantitatively and qualitatively in all three TTs, whereas the translation of discourse markers differs quite considerably between the same TTs. The subtitling of different linguistic features thus seems to be governed by a variety of factors, these factors varying by each feature. As far as the subtitling of swearwords and discourse markers is concerned, this article supports the hypothesis that the former is more inclined to be governed by different sets of translational norms in the target culture than the latter. The subtitling of discourse markers is naturally also governed by translational norms, but this article has argued that these norms, to a larger extent than the swearwords, are co-determined by factors such as the television channels’ varying standards of subtitling, and, possibly, the different working conditions at each channel or translating agency.

6 References

Primary sources

The English Swedish Parallel Corpus (ESPC).

<www. http://www.englund.lu.se/content/view/65/125/>


Nurse Betty subtitles 1. Sveriges television AB, Agneta Malmborg.

Nurse Betty subtitles 2. SDI Mediagroup, Niklas Herrström.


Secondary sources


**Internet sources**


Abstract

This article discusses the problem of translating into Portuguese a sub-standard variety of British English into Portuguese within a polymedial context. The discourse develops its structure according to the channel selected and, since the two main communication channels are written and spoken, it is possible to identify the written and oral modes as two distinct variations. Investigating the way in which the oral mode is represented in the written mode is of particular relevance in subtitling because the two modes appear simultaneously. Different media have different functions requiring different priorities. In the translation process the translator needs to set priorities with different types of discourse imposing different kinds of limitations. So that priorities must be set in different ways.

This article will present a comparative study of three translations rendered for the purpose of theatrical performance and five translations rendered for the purpose of subtitling of Bernard Shaw’s Pygmalion and Alan Jay Lerner’s My Fair Lady. I will try to understand how the variable “medium” influences the translator’s decisions with respect to the kind of linguistic varieties in the translation, ie which limitations were found and which new opportunities opened up.

1 Some specifics of theatrical texts

Following Bassnet's (1990) and Aaltonen's (2003) writings, I will consider theatrical texts as different from dramatitical texts in terms of distribution as well as aesthetics and ideologies. We are faced with two different visions of theater translation, which generate two different kinds of translation in accordance with two distinct notions of performability: one is close to the text itself, another to a specific performance style of a given company (Espasa 2000: 52). In a translation intended for performance the expectations of the audience have a great influence on the translator’s decisions, in a translation meant for publication, the gender conventions will certainly be much more important in the decisions taken by the translator. When translating or analyzing a translation rendered for theatrical performance, therefore, a number of aspects need to be taken into account as is described below.
1.1 Reception differences

Unlike a reader, who decides when, how, and for how long he/she is going to read, the viewer of a play assumes a passive role in the reception of a unique moment of meaning during the production. This makes it more difficult for the translator to opt for source text oriented strategies and limits his ability to use devices which may compromise the immediate understanding of the discourse and plot.

1.2 Discourse: written to be spoken

A translator's written work will experience an oral dimension on stage, making the conventions of the oral discourse a very important fact to take into account. The impact is much more felt on stage than on the printed page - if the discourse is not familiar to the public, the actual understanding of the plot can be seriously compromised.

1.3 The polysemiotic nature of the final product

When translating for the theater, the translation will necessarily have to take into account other elements besides the text. In fact, the singularity of the theatrical text seems to be due to, among other things, the fact that the theatrical event is text + image + action in real time. It presents itself as different from a dramatical text because it goes far beyond the mere text, and it differs from audiovisual products such as films since it is live communication (Marco 2002: 56). Translators create a product which will experience both a verbal and non-verbal dimension on stage. The rhythm becomes something very important: what is said must be accompanied by gestures, i.e., the action determines as well as emphasizes what is said.

2 Some Specifics of Subtitling

Like theater translation, subtitling also has its own specific aspects, which must be taken into account when translating. It was defined by Gottlieb (1992: 162, 163) as written, additive, immediate, synchronous and polymedial translation, implying a change of (Luyken 1991: 153-158; Rosa 2001: 214):

a) **Medium**: from speech and gestures to writing;
b) **Channel**: from mainly vocal-auditive to visual;
c) **Form of signals**: mainly from phonic substances to graphic substance; and
d) **Code**: from spoken verbal language to written verbal language.

Besides, subtitling is a specific kind of translation where other types of limitations must be taken into account:

a) **Space limitation**: two lines from 30 to 35 characters each;
b) **Exposure time**: There is an agreement that 6 to 8 seconds is the optimum exposure time for a two-line subtitle and 4 seconds for a one-line subtitle (dictated by three factors: amount of text, the average reading speed of the viewers, the constant minimum interval between subtitles);
c) **Synchrony with the image** (if a subtitle is retained on screen during a shot or scene change it, will result in an effect known as “overlapping”). Like theatrical texts, subtitles are not an independent product: as audible and visual elements, and
although not translated, they are part of the translation product and influence the translator’s options and decisions. We must see image and subtitling as one whole, since without the image or sound subtitles are reduced in their sense.

3 Linguistic varieties and their rhetorical purpose

Translators have been facing the problem that a target language may not have adequate resources to provide for an equivalent target text, e.g. when the source language reflects the close relationship between the speaker/medium/context in which it is used. The literary use of a dialect raises important questions to the study of translation, not only because it is specific of the source language system, but also because it is always embedded in the source text with a pragmatic and semiotic significance. The creative use of linguistic varieties in literary dialog contributes to inform the reader about who is speaking and under which circumstances he/she is speaking, showing itself as a textual resource which defines the sociocultural outline of the character in addition to his/her position in the sociocultural fictional context. It is also an element which leads to a stratification of the participants in the dialog, since the speakers tend to associate, based on extra-linguistic factors, higher prestige to the standard variety (officially established as the correct language use) and, consequently, tend to downgrade all other varieties which are culturally associated with peripheral geographic spaces and lower sociocultural status. It is important to realize that the literary recreation of a linguistic variety may be based on a previous selection which results from different mediations, leading Olga Brodovich to label it as "scenic dialect" (Brodovich 1997: 26). When analyzing the selection of sub-standard features, we must bear in mind that “intelligibility” and “readability”, i.e. the consciousness that target system speakers have of the linguistic variation and the way the text is displayed are fundamental concepts. The degree of linguistic mimicry is dependent on the aesthetic, narrative, thematic or stylistic objectives, and also on the function that the author has given to his recreation. When recreating linguistic varieties, the author, as well as the translator, resorts to sociolinguistic stereotypes which they know to be part of the public knowledge, i.e., those which are associated to a subcode easily understood by the public. This is why it is important to discuss the translators’ decision to recreate the original, or not, and the way he/she chooses to do so, in view of the fact that this decision can modify, or even subvert, the work’s system.

4 Methodology of the study

The choice of *Pygmalion* and *My Fair Lady* as a corpus to be analyzed in this article was motivated by the fact that the use of a substandard variety of British English is central to the plot. It is therefore vital that the target text portrays the difference in discourse; otherwise the audience will not understand the plot.

For the purposes of this study, a parallel corpus was created with all Eliza's speeches of the first two scenes. Only Eliza's speeches were selected and only as a speaker of 'cockney', since it is not the purpose of this study to analyze idiolect speech markers or the character's evolutionary process. The analysis of the parallel corpus was made semi-automatically, using a computer system available on the market called *Systemic Coder*. The comparative

1 For the purpose of this article it was used the version 4.5 of the computer program Systemic Coder, designed by Michael O’Donnell of WagSoft Linguistics software. The program is available on http://www.wagsoft.com/coder/.
appreciation of all the percentages made it possible to identify the procedures and different translation strategies which are discussed here:

5 Presence and meaning of the sub-standard variety in Bernard Shaw’s Pygmalion and Alan Jay Lerner's My Fair Lady

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Less prestigious varieties</th>
<th>Prestigious varieties</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Substandard</td>
<td>Oral</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social</td>
<td>Regional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pygmalion (1938 film script)</td>
<td>51%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pygmalion (1957 published book)</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My Fair Lady (1956 published book)</td>
<td>51%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My Fair Lady (1964 film script)</td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pygmalion (1938 film script)</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tab. 1: Percentages of the less prestigious and prestigious literary varieties in the non-translated sub-corpus.

Table 1 shows the percentages of the prestigious and less prestigious literary varieties in the non-translated sub-corpus. As we can see, all the source texts show a high percentage regarding the recreation of less prestigious varieties (social sub-standard variety and oral register) as opposed to the lower expression of the standard variety. As was mentioned before, sub-standard features (in this particular case, “cockney”), are representative of a low sociocultural group, denoting the character’s social peripheral status and low educational level. Its presence serves the communicative purpose of indirectly distinguishing the character, showing that she belongs to a lower social class.

Concerning textual-linguistic features, we can easily see by the numbers presented in Table 2 the preference for graphic features instead of lexical or morphosyntactic ones. These regularities seem to confirm Page's research, when he says "[g]rammar and syntax are, apart from the most obvious differences, less readily absorbed by the casual listener, and are used relatively little by writers. Much more extensively used are devices for suggesting non-standard pronunciation" (Page 1988: 57).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Textual-linguistic features</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Morphosyntactic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pygmalion (1938 film script)</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pygmalion (1957 published book)</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My Fair Lady (1956 published book)</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My Fair Lady (1964 film script)</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pygmalion (1938 film script)</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tab. 2: Percentages of the textual-linguistic features in the non-translated sub-corpus

6 The target texts: normalization and innovation

Concerning the target texts, Table 3 shows the percentages of the less prestigious and the prestigious varieties.
If we look to the columns concerning the social and standard varieties, we will realize that they seem to be directly correlated: translations which exhibit high percentages in social variety (subtitles broadcasted in private TV and theater translations) also exhibit the lowest percentages in standard variety; the opposite is always verifiable, for example in the translations broadcasted in public TV. Translations portraying substandard discourse seem to denote a strategy of acceptability and, valuing the public’s expectations, seem to try to be closer to the target culture discourse. On the other hand, the choice for standard discourse allows us to conclude that there was a very strong concern for adequacy towards the written register. As regards the category of regional variety, which is recognizable in one of the translations oriented for performance, it is apparent only by the indistinction between [b] and [v] (a peculiar characteristic of the Portuguese northern dialect). This does not occur very often; because it would introduce a strong regional dimension which absent in the source text.

Let us now look more closely at Table 4 which shows the textual-linguistic features of identified in the target texts.
All translations show high percentages in the graphic features category, which portrays certain characteristics of oral discourse, e.g. ellipsis. This may point to the fact that this is a kind of feature central to the plot, but it is also very characteristic of a lower social class discourse. In translations oriented for performance, the high percentages seem to be justified by the fact that they will be converted into phonetic markers on stage, an important aspect that might explain the fact that percentages are much higher in this case than in subtitling.

There is also a high percentage of features in the lexical category, which is not only characteristic of the lower social class discourse, but also contribute to the comic effect present in the source texts. Lower percentages (in fact the lowest) seem to be in the morphosyntactic category, which shows much higher rates in the source texts. This kind of feature would, in fact, not only contribute to make it more difficult to understand for the viewer and/or spectator, but it also might be interpreted as a result of a lacking mastery of the language by the translator.

Relating to Dimitrova’s suggestion (1997: 63) and its application by Leppihalme (2000: 227), it seems appropriate to organize the literary dialects and pronunciations we intend to analyze in a continuum from minimum to maximum prestige.

This scale presents the standard variety as extremely prestigious and associated with high sociocultural-level speakers as well as formal and written forms of discourse. Gradually decreasing values are related to the oral discourse and substandard varieties, associated with low socio-cultural level speakers. Following Dimitrova, the target texts' deviations will imply a movement to the right on this scale, confirming the law of growing standardization (Toury, 1995: 268) as well as the translation universal of ‘normalization’. Following Cronin (1996), Brisset (1996) and Rosa (2004), in specific historic moments the sociocultural target context can motivate the activation of certain equivalence norms, which will imply an opposite movement on this scale, i.e., from right to left.

Let us now again consider the percentages of all varieties in the translated sub-corpus. With respect to the subtitles broadcasted by public TV it can be shown that some substandard units are recreated as oral or standard units, denoting a normalization strategy. Within the above spectrum, the movement would be from left to right. We are lead to the conclusion that the effort of keeping a high level of standard written Portuguese might be motivated by the conditions of the public channel which defines itself as public service. If we take into account that both translations prefer to use lexical features than grammatical or graphical ones, we can assume that the translators are conscious of the importance of the sub-standard discourse in this play, but want to preserve a high degree of written discourse. This seems to confirm Hickey's remarks (2000: 58) that the stereotypes used in this kind of recreation show the most
detached linguistic characteristics, i.e. features that speakers use more consciously. Also, people are, normally, more conscious of open classes (namely lexis) than of closed classes (grammatical structures, sound systems). This can also be an indication of an awareness for dealing with an audiovisual product. By presenting a graphically less marked subtitle, the audience is expected to note linguistic differences from visual and audible output (e.g. Eliza’s clothing). Public subtitling shows to be aware of the fact that graphic features make subtitling attract the viewer’s attention.

Another extra-textual factor appears to be very important to a TV channel, i.e. that legibility matters to the public. The audiovisual text addresses a very diverse audience with different cultural sensitivities, degrees and reading skills. Hence subtitling which constantly presents graphic features, might not be easily readable to everyone, especially to the younger (10-15) and older (55-80) population, who are the target audience of a film broadcasted at 2 p.m. like Pygmalion and My Fair Lady.

This does not apply to the remaining translations, which seem to portray a movement from right to left, denoting strategies which contradict the growing trends for standardization and the translation universal of normalization. The choice for sub-standard discourse may be interpreted to be an effort for achieving adequacy in oral register of the source text as well as adequacy of the target cultural oral discourse of theater translations.

In private channel subtitling we can identify the use of what is called “eye-dialect”- the orthography is altered so that it can be closer to the oral register of the source text, implying a higher acceptability by the audience. In the case of subtitling, where the source and target texts appear simultaneously, the translators may not escape the fact that someone or today even the majority of viewers understand the source language, thus facing up the risk of what Gottlieb called “feedback effect” (Gottlieb 1994: 105). Although the inclusion of oral or sub-standard features in writing can be interpreted as bad translations (Lefevere 1992: 70), the contrary may today be equally valid – an audience who understands the source text is normally very critical of subtitles which do not represent the specific discourse characteristics of the original. It can therefore be concluded that this may be an attempt to produce an accurate and adequate translation of what is found in the source text. This tendency is more pronounced in public TV than in private channels which may indicate that subtitles aired by a private TV channel may be less motivated to uphold the standard.

The translations commercialized by DVD confirms Schröter’s (2003: 110) conclusions that DVD subtitles are less condensed than those presented on TV, i.e., subtitles on DVD follow the order and content of the original more closely, and consequently the translation can be rendered much faster. Presenting a more normalized text seems to contradict the difference between private and public companies as far as translation strategies are concerned. However, the fact that the translator’s native language was not Portuguese might lead us to conclude that the translator’s poor linguistic knowledge might be reasonable for the extra-linguistic factor determining discourse normalization.

Since choices between using standard or sub-standard discourse need to be made in both media, we may conclude that the medium is not a relevant variable; nonetheless, there is a difference between the two media in the kind of features - as well as in the rate of their recurrence - that are used to distinguish the discourse as sub-standard.

Taking into account all cases were grapho-phonetic features are used to differentiate the discourse as sub-standard shows certain regularities as specific of each medium. In the case of subtitling the apostrophe indicating the fall of a vowel is the primary grapho-phonetic feature used, which confirms that the translator is well aware not only of the strange effect that this kind of feature will have but also of the fact that it will influence the rates of legibility. On the other hand, theater translations use other additional kinds of grapho-phonetic features like the change of the vowel quality, monothongization, metathesis, nasalization of the vowel at the beginning of the word, etc (Fig. 2).
A possible motivation for this may be found in the technical limitations discussed above - all the translators work with stereotypes in their search for formal mimicry; nevertheless, in subtitling, factors like exposure time, legibility and readability become very important. In the cases presented here, it seems that the translators decided for features easy to read and to understand, which would not attract the public’s attention.

This hypothesis seems to be confirmed by the kind of lexical and morphosyntactic features that the translators opted for. However, translations oriented for performance always presented higher percentages in these categories. Different studies (Aaltonen 1997; Mateo 1995) have already shown us that theater translation tend more to the extreme of acceptability than to adequacy. As discussed before, the oral discourse must be acceptable to the target culture’s oral discourse conventions, and since it is ephemeral, it must outlive any resistance to a foreign culture. As expressed by Mateo “complete understanding of a play is possible only if information supplied by the text and knowledge of the audience supplement each other” (Mateo 1995: 23). The moment of communicating is too fast to allow for any 'noise' on the channel like unfamiliar linguistic structures or vocabulary. The fact that the source text is completely erased from stage, i.e., that the public does not have access to the source text (unlike subtitling), can explain the high frequency of substandard features. If in subtitling these can be seen as unnecessary redundancies in relation to the audio output, in theater they will certainly be an important element of the plot and a form of comic in the production – after all both plays are comedies.

7 Concluding remarks

It seems that the initial hypothesis is supported by the results of the study - different media call for different translation strategies not only relative to the constraints they require but also because different functions lead the translator to set different priorities and to realize them in different ways.
8 References


Stavroula Sokoli (Athens)

Learning via Subtitling (LvS): A tool for the creation of foreign language learning activities based on film subtitling

Contents

1 Introduction
2 The use of translation in the FL classroom
3 The audiovisual text
4 The use of subtitled audiovisual material in the FL classroom
5 Subtitling as an activity for translation students
6 The LvS environment
7 Teaching / learning environment
8 Innovative aspects
9 Pedagogical and didactic approaches promoted
10 Future work
11 Note
12 References

Abstract

This article aims to portray LvS (Learning via Subtitling), a tool developed by the Laboratory of Educational Material of the Hellenic Open University, which is based on the simulation of a professional activity, that of film subtitling. LvS has been designed for the creation of active learning task-based activities, where cultural elements are involved in an authentic and motivating way and which expose the FL learners to highly contextualized language input. Multimedia is used as the core of an activity - and not as a "nice" add-on - which even when presented as a learning exercise remains a valid real-world engaging task. The student is asked, after some introductory tasks, to create subtitles or complete unfinished ones for a film scene selected according to the teacher's specific pedagogical goals. The outcome of this activity (the subtitled clip), unlike most FL learning activities, provides a hands-on result: the student's work is tangible, viewable, and can be shared with other students and teachers.

1 Introduction

The aim of this paper is twofold, namely, to describe the rationale for the use of activities involving the creation of subtitles in a foreign language (FL) learning environment; and to portray LvS (Learning via Subtitling), a tool developed by the Hellenic Open University’s Laboratory of Educational Material for the development of such activities.

It is becoming increasingly evident to FL teachers and researchers that there is no one and only guaranteed teaching method and that a variety of technical and methodological resources are needed in the classroom. It is now commonplace to say that audiovisual material with its rich context is a powerful instructional tool known to have a motivational, attentional, and affective impact on viewers, which in turn facilitates auditory processing (Baltova 1994). However, learners need to be trained to develop active viewing strategies for an efficient use of audiovisual material, which very often is not feasible for lack of motivation. Therefore,
tools and methods, such as the ones proposed here, are necessary to counter passivity when working with audiovisual material.

More specifically, this approach aims to cover the need for:

• the creation of active learning, task-based activities where cultural elements are involved in an authentic and motivating way and which expose the learners to highly contextualized language input

• the productive use of multimedia as the core of an activity and not simply as an add-on

• the creation of reusable activities requiring a relatively low level of computer literacy by tutors developing such activities

• the development of a sound methodology and transferability across various languages and educational systems

In the proposed activity the student is asked, after some introductory tasks, to create subtitles or complete unfinished ones for a film scene selected according to the teacher’s specific pedagogical goals. The outcome of this activity (the subtitled clip), unlike most FL learning activities used in the classroom, is practical and concrete given that the student’s work provides an actual product which can be viewed by and shared with other students and teachers.

The use of such a subtitling activity combines three widely-used methods in language learning: a long-standing one, which is considered “out-moded” i.e. the use of translation in the FL classroom; a “modern” one, which has been used for more than 20 years and which concerns the use of audiovisual material (video); and a “fashionable” and quite recent one, which involves the use of Information and Communication Technologies (ICT).

2 The use of translation in the FL classroom

The prevalence of the Communicative Approach since the 1980s (cf. Howatt 1984) led, among other things, to the exclusion of the native language in the classroom. Translation, which was overused in teaching and overvalued in testing foreign languages, came under rightful criticism as a tool for learning foreign languages. For example, Richards & Rogers (1986) maintained that translation as a method may promote focusing on the source text, thus discouraging thinking directly in the language being learned. However, its use has been reconsidered due to the emphasis given to its value as a communicative activity of mediation (cf. Hatim & Mason 1997). Moreover, the inclusion of translation activities in the FL curriculum is bound to be beneficial, since, according to Hurtado (1999), it assists in the development of reading comprehension and written expression, the promotion of linguistic knowledge and the development of cultural competence.

3 The audiovisual text

The text to be translated in the activity proposed here differs from “traditional” written texts normally used in translation exercises by the following features (Sokoli forthcoming):

• Reception through two channels: acoustic and visual

• Significant presence of non-adverbal element

• Synchronization between verbal and non-verbal elements

• Appearance on screen – Reproducible material

• Pre-determined succession of moving images – Recorded material
The combination of the acoustic and the visual channel together with the verbal and the non-verbal elements results in four basic components making up the audiovisual text: the acoustic-verbal (dialog), the acoustic-nonverbal (score, sounds), the visual-nonverbal (image) and the visual-verbal component (subtitles). The spatio-temporal relationships between these four components are portrayed in Figure 1, where the arrows represent the existing relationships in an audiovisual text and the dashed arrows represent the relationships established by the subtitler:

![Figure 1: Relationships between the basic components of the subtitled AV text (ibid)](image)

The requirement for synchrony between these components imposes certain time and space constraints, which make a literal, word-for-word translation impossible. Thus, the student/subtitler is liberated from the “requirement for faithfulness” and forced to focus on the core of the utterances heard. Moreover, in the case of audiovisual translation, the visual context (e.g. facial expressions and movements, intonation) is explicit and needs to be taken into consideration when translating.

4 The use of subtitled audiovisual material in the FL classroom

Various kinds of audiovisual material have been exploited in different ways for many years in order to support student learning. Several authors (e.g. Bates1985) have described particular attributes of video that render it a powerful medium for learning, such as abstracting information, narrative visualization, recognition and identification by the student. More specifically, the use of subtitled audiovisual material has several advantages, such as:

- it provides simultaneous exposure to spoken language, printed text and visual information all conveying the same message (Baltova 1999: 33)
- it promotes content and vocabulary learning even in relatively inexperienced learners (ibid)
- subtitles may bridge the gap between reading and listening skills (Borrás & Lafayette: 1994)

LvS aims to overcome the shortcoming of passivity by engaging learners in an active way: they have to add subtitles to the material, thus creating a new product.

---

1 Delabastita (1989: 101) calls these four basic components “four types of film sign: verbal signs transmitted acoustically (dialog), non-verbal signs transmitted acoustically (background noise, music), verbal signs transmitted visually (credits, letters, documents shown on the screen), non-verbal signs transmitted visually”. 

---
5 Subtitling as an activity for translation students

The benefits of subtitling for translation students have been described by a number of researchers, e.g. Klerkx (1998) and Rundle (2000). According to Neves (2004: 127), students of translation attending subtitling courses gained skills and language awareness that reflected itself in their performance in other courses and activities. It is believed that this is due to the junction of two elements – translation and audiovisuals – that have been accepted as assets to language learning in general; and to the fact that subtitling calls for a variety of skills that can be improved through well staged activities covering the different steps of the subtitling process.

However, up to now the advantages of subtitling in FL learning as an activity have only occasionally been observed and no specific software or material has been designed to promote this kind of language learning. The Information and Communication Technologies offer new tools which allow the projection of audiovisual material with synchronized subtitles, the creation and edition of subtitles, as well as the preparation of the necessary language learning material without the requirement for advanced computer skills on the part of the teacher.

6 The LvS environment

The user interface of the software comprises three areas: i) the video clip (film) area (upper left corner), ii) the instructions/text area (upper right corner), and iii) the subtitle editor area (bottom), as shown in Figure 2 below:

![Screenshot of an LvS learning activity](image)

Fig. 2: Screenshot of an LvS learning activity
The video clip area allows learners to play, pause and stop the clip, to view it both with and without subtitles by clicking on the button [Watch clip with subtitles], and to check the total and the elapsed time. Moreover, they can create new subtitles in the subtitle file below by clicking on the buttons [Start subtitle] and [End subtitle] in order to establish the time when they want the subtitle to appear and disappear respectively. However, this function is not intended to be used in a standard type of activity, since in and out times will normally be provided by the teacher. It is suggested here, that the technicalities of subtitling are reduced as much as possible, since the purpose of the activity is language learning and not the training of professional subtitlers, the technicalities of subtitling should be as reduced as possible. Nevertheless, this function might be useful, for example, if the teacher wants students to practice listening: the students are obliged to listen to the fragments over and again in order to insert the in and out times correctly.

The subtitle editor area allows the students to edit and manage the subtitles: insert text in the 1st or 2nd line, add or delete subtitles, move them up or down and save the subtitle file. If the language used in the subtitles requires a different encoding, e.g. Greek, it can be selected here. The font of the subtitles can also be modified, e.g. Arial, Verdana etc. Moreover, an algorithm calculates the number of characters introduced in each subtitle and if it exceeds the time constraint (established by the developer of the software), the color of the text turns red. This does not affect the appearance of the subtitle on the video player above and the subtitle file can still be used and saved. Also, if the number of the subtitle (first column) is double-clicked, the “current time” of the player will be placed on the equivalent time-point of the clip, thus enabling the learner to view only the fragment where the selected subtitle appears.

The instructions/text area provides guidance and other supporting text, such as the synopsis, information about the film, the script, grammar exercises (e.g. fill-in the blanks) etc.

The files needed for the creation of an activity (input files) are:

a. A video file: any file which can be reproduced by Windows Media Player® (.mpg, .avi, .vob, and others)
b. A hypertext file: any file which can be opened by Internet Explorer® (.html)
c. A subtitle file (.srt, .tts or other text files). This file must contain the timing (in and out times) of the subtitles, and it may contain some subtitle-text to be completed or no subtitle-text at all.

The output of the activity, i.e. the subtitle file created by the student, is in a standard format supported by authoring tools which enable students to create their own subtitled DVD with the help of tools such as Maestro, Scenarist, Adobe Encore, DVDStyler, etc.

Conformance with the latest eLearning standards should be taken into consideration. Activities created with LvS can be adapted to the emerging eLearning standard SCORM, so that issues like interoperability and reusability of learning activities and objects can be successfully addressed. LvS provides the tool for the design and creation of activities whereas SCORM provides an added functionality to the activities as far as their delivery mode is concerned (delivery by any Learning Management System).

A possible self-study LvS activity can be outlined as follows:

a. The learners read the instructions and start the activity. In the “instructions” window they can be involved in pre-viewing activities, such as reading the film’s synopsis and answering relevant open or multiple-choice questions. Exercises, such as cloze tests, can also be included in this area, which is consulted by the learner throughout the activity.

b. The learners watch the clip (pausing, restarting, skipping, etc) any number of times they wish. They add or edit the subtitles and view the clip with their subtitles, save the subtitle file and send it to the teacher.

c. The teacher makes comments and sends feedback.

d. The learners load the subtitles with the teacher’s corrections and watch the film again.
7 Teaching / learning environment

The LvS software environment and the produced activities can be used in existing Foreign Language learning environments. They are designed to promote active and highly motivated learning. Implementing the activity requires a PC. It can be performed in the classroom, at the school/university lab, or at home. The activity outcomes (e.g. subtitle files) are assessed by teachers or by peers, depending on the competences to be evaluated (language correction, style appropriateness, etc.)

As regards the general teaching/learning environment, LvS can be used in intermediate or advanced levels, in any real or virtual classroom and within any curriculum, as it does not imply any change in the methodology used. It needs to be underlined that the products and the pedagogical model proposed here concern the insertion of an activity in the foreign language course and not a modification of the curriculum. These activities may be a minor change in the overall learning environment but their potential for introducing new concepts in foreign language learning is substantial. LvS is also adequate for use in autonomous learning environments, given that its “instructions” component can provide all the necessary steps for self-study.

8 Innovative aspects

The flexibility in the use of LvS is evidenced in that it can be used for live or distance teaching, for any number of students, with unlimited (cultural) choice of video content (film scenes, educational material), for any suitable duration of video segment and adaptation to the level of students (beginners, intermediate, advanced) their age and interests. Moreover, extending the tool for use in any European language is obvious in the light of multilinguality.

From the technical viewpoint the main innovation in this proposal is the fact that no other open-source educational tool has been developed in the past. Up to now, only existing professional subtitling tools have been used, with all the shortcomings originating from the fact that these tools are not specifically designed for the purposes of FL learning. Moreover, existing, common and inexpensive technology is utilized in an innovative integrated manner.

9 Pedagogical and didactic approaches promoted

Giving learners an authentic version of a professional environment, not for the purposes of training a professional but for the side benefits of associated fundamental skills is widely practiced in education. From a pedagogical perspective, the platform works equally well in both the self-learning, distance-learning or self-access format (where the foreign language tutor’s participation is either minimal or unnecessary) as well as the traditional teacher-fronted format. With regard to the language skill-oriented pedagogical approaches implemented, the process of translating the interactions of the viewed film/video sequences involves learners in a series of micro-activities, such as i) taking notes or summarizing parts of entire monologs or interactions, ii) prioritizing information in a way that meets the criteria of subtitling (e.g., viewing space, informational cohesion and coherence), iii) integrating top-down processing (extensive listening, or listening for gist) with bottom-up processing (intensive listening, or listening for detail). Films/videos that belong to different genres can be selected for their genuineness, relevance and inherent complexity. Depending on the teaching situation, the very process of viewing and subtitling can be used for informational, appreciative, critical or empathic listening purposes (Rost 2003: 158). Moreover, through this
process learners become aware of and make decisions about language-specific matters of communication, such as speakers’ delivery style, speed and accent, information and language density and visual support of verbal messages.

10 Future work

For the time being only the learner mode of the software is available, which means that activities can be prepared only with the help of the developers. A teacher mode is planned to be developed to enable teachers with a low level of computer literacy to create their own activities with the use a user-friendly interface, e.g. through a wizard, supported by a tutorial etc.

The creation of a web portal is also considered a necessary step for the promotion and dissemination of outcomes (e.g. presentation of results, links to related initiatives, best practice material). This web portal will include a discussion forum for the dissemination of relevant know-how among LvS users and will also serve as an eLearning platform providing facilities and tools for course management and class management, Computer Supported Collaborative Learning (CSCL), storage, sharing and publishing.

The use of the platform will be enriched with the construction of a library of video clips suitable for subtitling as exercises in various languages and for various levels of language proficiency. The nature of the video clips will depend on the outcome of a report on Intellectual Property Rights concerning the use of film for educational purposes which will be elaborated.

LvS is freely available for use by teachers of foreign languages (for more information, visit http://levis.cti.gr).

11 Note

A proposal related to this work, which was submitted within the framework of the European Community action program Socrates – Lingua 2 (Development of Language Tools and Materials), has been recently selected for funding. The project, called “LeViS: Learning via Subtitling: Software & Processes for Developing Language Learning Material based on Film Subtitling”, is expected to start in October 2006 and be completed by September 2008.

12 References


Localization of media-rich interactive ads

Mario De Bortoli (London)
Fabio Minazzi (Milan)

Abstract

At a time when media convergence has become a reality online advertising agencies are more and more often confronted with problems that used to affect the TV-based advertising agencies. With the spreading of streaming video, podcasts and interactive video technologies, all of a sudden websites and online ads are full of life, but this requires the rethinking of the text-centric localization processes, to move the focus to the audio/visual elements, that introduce an additional parameter to be considered during the localization process: media synchronization in time.

The typical fordistic localization process where the text is translated first and then it is fed in the various media is not suitable for this type of products. Multidimensional translation has to be combined with interactive design and media localization techniques, to provide effective multilingual communication, able to stand the quality of traditional audiovisual products. And it is precisely the issue of changing localization processes within the media-rich and online advertising industry that the authors try to tackle by sharing their day to day experiences and acquired knowledge to work out a model for designing the most appropriate process for the localization of international campaigns and online content in the age of media convergence.

The paper gives a brief overview of how the online communication is localized, illustrating the most common processes used in the industry. The authors move on to explain how the media-rich contents is changing the face of localization in terms of resources, skills and processes needed to be integrated in the workflow, to address the ever-increasing use of interaction, subtitling, video, dubbing and voiceovers.

A theoretical framework is proposed, where media-rich scenes are divided into 5 main components (audio, video, graphics, static and dynamic on screen text, interactive items), which are then weighted by relating them with 4 main types of constraint (space, time, cultural, functional).

Once 3 additional parameters (time, cost, and amounts) are introduced, it is possible to define the driving localization components, that are those components that shape the localization process. Examples of the application of this model are provided.

The aim of this work is to provide a useful theoretical framework to communication designers, localization managers, local marketing managers, and more generally to the people involved in the production and localization of global communication products.

Introduction

In a global communication world, industrialization is a must. An appropriate understanding of the production and localization processes is the key to give the consumer an exciting, consistent and interactive experience, while containing costs for the advertiser.

The paper gives a brief overview of how the online communication is localised, illustrating the most common processes used in the industry. The authors move on to explain how the media-rich contents is changing the face of localization in terms of resources, skills and processes needed to be integrated in the workflow, to address the ever-increasing use of interaction, subtitling, video, dubbing and voiceovers.
A theoretical framework is proposed, where media-rich scenes are divided into 5 main components (audio, video, graphics, static and dynamic on screen text, interactive items), which are then weighted by relating them with 4 main types of constraint (space, time, cultural, functional). Once 3 additional parameters (time, cost, and amounts) are introduced, it is possible to define the driving localization components, that are those components that shape the localization process.

**Multimedia scenes: a combination of 5 text-containing components and 4 constraints**

In principle all multimedia scenes are built with 5 multimedia components which can contain text:

1. Audio: the spoken text
2. Video: subtitles and other overlaid graphic text
3. Raster graphics: the static text contained in the pictures and screen shots
4. Software - on screen text: the text dynamically displayed by the content presentation system
5. Software - interactive elements: the text contained into the elements that are devoted to interacting with the multimedia product, i.e. buttons, menus, dialogues, input fields.

Except for the audio component, all the others form the visual scene on screen.

The localization of each component requires a separate production line, and specific quality controls (QA) defined according to the type of constraints affecting each component.

When localizing each component, the text must be translated taking into account 4 types of constraints

1. Space constraints
2. Time constraints
3. Cultural constraints
4. Functional constraints

The importance of each constraint varies from product to product, according to the combination of components in each scene, and causes the role (weight) of each component to change in the design of the production method.

The table below outlines the influence of each constraint on the translation of the text contained in each component.

**1) Space constraints**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Audio</th>
<th>Video</th>
<th>Graphics</th>
<th>On screen text (software)</th>
<th>Interface elements (software)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Usually not          | Subtitles: very space-constrained (typical: 36 chars on max 3 lines).
| influenced by this   | Graphics: very limited. May need insertion between source lines.
| constraint.          | This is often a critical component. | Static visual elements always have a limited amount of space for displaying. | Dynamic text may be displayed in boxes that allow for expansion or scroll, this influences the strength of the constraint. | Short sets of specific words can become much longer or shorter when translated, and consistency is a must. This is often a critical component. |
2) **Time constraints**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time constraints influence on translation of:</th>
<th>Audio</th>
<th>Video</th>
<th>Graphics</th>
<th>On screen text (software)</th>
<th>Interface elements (software)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sound is usually synchronized with the action on screen: translation should account for total length of presentation and intermediate cue points as well</td>
<td>Amount of text displayed depends on the amount of time available for displaying it</td>
<td>Influenced if the audio or video text refers explicitly to the content of the graphics</td>
<td>Influenced if the audio or video text refers explicitly to the content of the on screen text</td>
<td>These are usually not influenced</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3) **Cultural constraints**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cultural constraints influence on translation of:</th>
<th>Audio</th>
<th>Video</th>
<th>Graphics</th>
<th>On screen text (software)</th>
<th>Interface elements (software)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Influenced in terms of: - speaker's pace - actor's gender - text (may need rewriting) - accents</td>
<td>Subtitles are influenced in terms of: - subtitling style - text (may need rewriting)</td>
<td>terms of: - content layout - screen shoots (for products that contain references to screen action) - fonts - text (may need rewriting)</td>
<td>terms of: - content layout (may need resize and reposition) - text (may need rewriting)</td>
<td>software functions vary from locale to locale</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4) **Functional constraints**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Functional constraint influence on translation of:</th>
<th>Audio text</th>
<th>Video text</th>
<th>Graphics text</th>
<th>On screen text (software)</th>
<th>Interface elements (software)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Influenced only if the text references functional elements</td>
<td>appearing in a video is very limited (typical values 36 chars on max 3 lines)</td>
<td>The text</td>
<td>Influenced if the on screen text refers explicitly to the content of the graphics</td>
<td>text refers to the functions of the software</td>
<td>of text that needs rewriting to account for the localized functions of the software</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In case the video text coincides with part of the on screen text, the on screen text length is affected by the video text</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 1: components, production lines and constraints

Figure 1 describes in a simplified way, the production lines for localizing each component. The influence of the constraints on each component is also displayed.
Component-specific vs. cross-component constraints

Let's now look at the influence of each component on the others. We call *cross-component constraints* the constraints that apply on one component because of another component.

Figure 2 shows the typical result of a localization project carried out without taking into account the cross-component constraints.

![Diagram](image_url)
An example can be useful to better explain the concept of cross-component constraint. In a traditional film the time constraint on the video influences directly the translation of the audio script and subtitles, and that situation is the same for all films.

**Film**

“I wish you were here to see Jane’s wedding, she was absolutely wonderful”

Time constraint of 2.5 seconds on screen, forces to change the translation for the subtitle. Translated

“I wish you were here for the wedding. Jane was wonderful”

**Multimedia ad**

"If you select the new Verify Space for My Account feature scrolling the menu, you check the available space for your messages."

while translating it is not possible to shorten this sentence without causing a loss of part of the original message. Each bolded element has in fact a specific function related to the way the presentation or the object described work.

"If you select the **new Verify Space for My Account** feature **scrolling** the menu, you check the **available space** for your **messages.**"

As often happens in a multimedia products, the sentence refers to elements on the screen, and the message is an instruction built without redundance.

Multimedia products, by their very nature, feature sets of constraints that change from product to product. For example in one product the space constraints on the graphics can turn into a constraint on the audio script, while in another one the translation of the interactive elements affects the translation of the subtitles. This entails that either during the design of the product or campaign, or at the very beginning of the localization, a detailed analysis has to be performed in order to identify the constraints and properly plan the localization process.

Figure 3 shows a case where a good cross-component analysis leads to a successful localization project. The analysis shows that the audio script and the interactive elements influence the translation of other components. The relevant constraints applied during the translation stage, and the result obtained after the product assembly, become suitable for the target locales.
It is to be noticed that these constraints trigger a set of QA activities that are to be performed on the assembled product.

It is to be noticed that the terms multimedia and media-rich contents both used in this paper, refer to the same concept: not a simple assembly of media that are provided to the user, rather, a combination of contents with complex cross-references and functional relationships.

Figure 3. Good cross-component constraint analysis results in successful localization
**The role of costs, time, amount**

In order to complete the picture we need to account for three additional parameters: **cost, time, amounts**. Each one of these parameters strongly influences the localization process:

1. *cost of each working step* in the production line
   
   Some steps much more expensive than others by their very nature, e.g. audio recording, video editing, software engineering. As an example: once the editing of the video is completed, the cost of adding to a video a single string that has been changed/overlooked is much higher than the cost of simply re-translating it.

2. *time* involved in each working step
   
   Some steps are slow to activate. For example the booking of actors for a recording of a single string can take days if the actor is on vacation. Some steps are slow to be performed as a result of lengthy manual operations like the manual insertion of strings in a set of layered pictures.

3. *amount* of content to be processed
   
   The amount is always an important parameter (this has an influence on both cost and time). For example if the translated text is placed in thousands of pictures, the DTP step can become the bottleneck of the entire localization process.

**Defining priorities in the localization process: the driving localization components**

As a result of the constraints analysis and cost/time factors we can now define the **driving localization components**: those components that due to the influence of their constraints, and of the related cost/time/amounts factors, shape the entire localization process.

Traditionally when defining the localization process usually the order of translation is done first and then, with the translated text all the media are populated. This model does not work, in many multimedia localization cases where the order for translation is often driven by the most time-consuming task.

In this example the product to be localized features some interactive elements that generate constraints to the on screen dynamic text and the audio text as well. We analyse two localization plannings that look equivalent, but indeed are not. In the first localization process (see figure 4) before starting and analysis of the contents showed the cross-component constraints.

The interactive elements are outlined to be the **driving localization component** because of the constraints that are generated on other components. Another driving localization component is the audio. In fact, the process for recording the audio is estimated to be longer than the time for integrating the on screen dynamic text so it must start first, so that the other translations can proceed while the audio is being produced. The total project duration following the localization process 1 is 11 days.
If a different localization process is applied (let’s call it process 2), the most time consuming activities (audio and video) are started first, which makes sense in order to minimize the production time. Apparently the project duration “is the same” (see figure 5).

But the cross-component constraints have not been taken into account. Once the audio is integrated with the video and the remaining components in the product, the cross-component constraints become apparent, and this causes a redo of the audio translation and recording after the integration.

The result is that if one selects process 2 in place of process 1, the real project schedule ends up to be 18 days, 50% longer than process 1 (see figure 6), and in additional costs. This effect is especially dangerous when several languages are to be localized in parallel.
The next section describes some practical examples of multimedia products for training and advertising that show the role of the *constraints* and that of the *driving localization components* in the localization process.
Examples

Online tutorial
The main goal of an online tutorial is to explain to the user a set of concepts through the commented visualization of simulated situations. This format is very challenging as in one situation it is the audio script that contains the most important information, in a subsequent situation it is the screen that shows a specific content that can’t be changed (the online services interface). Also, elements that appear on screen repeatedly: various elements (like buttons, menus) need to be represented in a consistent way throughout the presentation.

![Figure 7. components and constraints in an online tutorial](image)

Typical issues encountered with online tutorials are:
1. translated text for speech does not fit the time constraints, so that source code of the interactive tutorial must be modified,
2. screen shots do not fit the original size, so that the graphics layout has to be changed
3. translated text to appear on screen does not match the content of the audio.

It is evident that a process where all the text is translated first and then the rest of the process is adapted around it is not the shortest way to get the required result. The final QA process would outline several compatibility problems.
In order to get an effective localized product, we must:

- study the way the tutorial is built in terms of media and interactive software engine
- identify correlations (potential conflicts) between components
- be prepared to adapt the layout of the visual elements
- study the most efficient way to solve the conflicts by identifying the relevant constraints.
- be prepared to compromise whenever a conflict of constraints arises
- brief the translator about such constraints
- provide the translator the running version of the tutorial for context,
- brief the relevant team members (programmer, actors, sound and DTP engineers) about the constraints

Here is in this case the cross-component analysis:

- The action timing is to be retained at all time, to avoid complex software re-synchronization, different for each language (21 in this example)
- Time is a major constraint, that affects audio
- Audio text depends on examples
- Audio does not depend on error messages
- Audio depends on interface elements
- Audio depends on graphics
- Graphics: large amount of screens to be shot, and edited
- Graphics depends on examples
- Graphics does not depend on the on screen text
- Examples have space constraints, but have space constraint
- Interactive elements are drawn from the actual portal, and are already translated

In this case therefore the *driving localization components* are the graphic text and the audio. We need to translate the audio early so that when record it, the original length is preserved, to ensure that the new audio runs in sync with the rest of the presentation.

At the same time, the graphic production must start early as it is time consuming due to the size of the course. This in turn requires the interactive elements to be accessed on line (the course is about the features of a portal) before translating the other components, to be sure that cross-references are accounted for.

The correct localization process therefore is the one displayed in figure 8.
Web advert: IBM example

We recently worked on the launch of a new page on the IBM On Demand Business website in four European countries: Germany, Italy, France and the UK. The centre piece of the new content was a video about an IBM expert explaining the importance of innovation.

Unlike other pages from the same website, where an article would be the centre piece, here the video was, and this realization led to a series of changes to the design of the original American page for the European markets, as well as to a complete change in the prioritization of work.

On the American page, which was used as a source, there was first a landing page with a big picture of the expert and links leading to a second-level page where the video could be viewed on a video player or, alternatively, the PDF with the transcript could be read.

Since the video was the most important part of the communication, what was decided for Europe was - first of all - to move the video player to the landing page in a prominent position.

By applying the methodology of the constraint tables we then had to consider what the driving components of the localization would be.

At the back of our minds we also had to remember to keep costs down so, at first, led by our old text-led methodology, we wanted to translate the transcript and use the translation to create subtitles. However we soon realized that this was an impractical approach. The speaker was extremely fast and subtitles would have had to run so fast that no one would have been able to read them, especially in languages that are longer than English. Alternatively they would have covered half the screen and given the fact that they were going to be displayed on a computer’s video reader they would have been unreadable anyway.

The other consideration was that in countries such as France, Italy and Germany, consumers are not very accustomed to subtitles, and prefer dubbing or voiceovers.

We decided that the voiceover was the best option as it left some taste of the original in the background, but allowed to communicate directly to the target in their language.

As we are talking about voiceovers, the most significant constraint is time.

Although the translation of the video was very limited in size, the titles appearing before each section and the last frame with the American telephone numbers had to be reworked as well. The
longer texts would have not allowed to recreate the same sort of animation out of readability problems, but also because the animation was embedded in the video and could no longer be replaced in foreign language versions.

Hence we concluded that the driving components of this project were

1. the audio, which was mandatory to translate according to the time constraints in order to be laid on the video.
2. the video, which had to be translated according to the space constraints given by the new font size selected.

The translation of the audio script was organized as follows. Before starting the translation process, we created a table for the translation of the transcript in which we stated the maximum number of characters allowed for each paragraph based on the time needed to read them in each language and taking into account the little delay at the start of each section required by voiceovers. Translators had to adapt the text into their normally longer languages to fit a space actually smaller than the English original.

By doing so, we managed to avoid the need for extra adaptations and re-recordings which often mar work in text-led projects.

The recording was done in each of the target markets, for greater choice and quality of actors, and the post-production was centralized to reduce costs and retain a greater general overview of the project and achieve consistent quality of the audio.

German page: video available on landing page and addition of chapters for easier use.

The text for the video was extracted and inserted into a table in which we stated the maximum number of characters allowed for each frame and briefed the translator that the last frame, with references to phone numbers, had to be filled in with new data provided by IBM.

When we set foot in the video studio the whole chain, from the client to the translator were aware of the relevant constraints, and this enabled us to do the work in a single take, without any need for expensive redos.

The result was indeed very satisfactory and allowed IBM’s European markets to enjoy a well-targeted piece of communication with an equal level of impact in each language.
The only point that could not be rendered as nicely as we would have liked - because the video was made before thinking of its localization - was the fact that the animated titles could not be recreated as they were embedded in the film and could not be removed. The solution was to replace them with a still frame bearing the localized title, a so-called billboard. In this case we were lucky that the animation did not run on top of live footage, otherwise it would have been much more difficult to integrate billboards with the titles.

Title localization: US animated title had to transform into German still frame.

When things go wrong: an example
A real-life example we could make of things going wrong is that of a large corporation, which can’t be named for legal reasons, which recently decided to launch a promotional campaign for a product across several countries, in which the TV campaign, the Direct Marketing activity and the online activity was each led by a different department inside that corporation, none communicating with each other. The client briefed different departments of the advertising agency, and each department had the same content translated separately. This meant that the campaign message was translated three times (loss of money) in three different ways (loss of consistency) and each without taking into account the constraints presented by the other media. What’s more the TV ad and the DM materials were to drive traffic to both Points of Sale and to the website. And the website was to generate traffic to the Point of Sale. The DM was also responsible for setting up the POS. Each element was inextricably linked with the others, and the discrepancies were therefore going to become impossible to miss by the target audience. A few days before the launch of the campaign, by pure chance, a member of the online department noticed the discrepancy in the advertising headline on the TV ad’s superscript, and the one used online in his native language. This prompted other checks, and the realisation of across-the-board inconsistencies in all languages. Urgent editing work had to be carried out at an enormous cost, including some re-work on the TV ad which actually cost less to change than remaking all the POS materials, and even so, in some cases the discrepancies could not be removed.

This case really highlighted how interdependent the various channels of communication were, and how a concerted approach was needed to help prioritize and plan localization activities in today’s multimedia and multi-channel environment.
Conclusion

The attempt by the multimedia localisation industry to find a systematic solution to the challenges posed by multiple constraints can be highly beneficial for global advertisers. The constraint tables help us understand that there is no longer one privileged starting point for the localisation process, and that both commercial communication and its localization have acquired a multidimensional nature. We now need to think in terms of priorities determined by driving components, and in order to do that the localization process of commercial communication has to start at campaign concept level.

For the translator, the challenge is to work on texts that are deployed in a variegated set of components requiring a multi-dimensional approach to translation to fit in the localization process as a whole.
Bibliography

- Szarkowska Agnieszka, "The Power of Film Translation", Translation Journal, Volume 9, No. 2 April 2005
- Savourel Yves, XML Internationalization and Localization, SAMS, 2001, pp. 126-133
- Walsh Aaron E., Bourges-Sevenier Mikaël, MPEG-4 Jump Start, Prentice-Hall PTR, 2000, Chapter 1
- Maroto Jesus, De Bortoli Mario, Localisation and webvertising: conveying the digital communication mix, Proceedings of the eContent Localisation conference, 2002, University College Dublin, Ireland
- De Bortoli Mario, Maroto Jesus, Translating colours in web site localisation, Proceedings of the European Languages and the Implementation of Communication and Information Technologies
- (Elicit) conference, 2001, University of Paisley, UK.
Yves Gambier (Turku)

Multimodality and Audiovisual Translation

Contents

1 Introduction
2 Piecemeal research
3 TS and AVT
4 The challenge of accessibility and reception
5 The socio-cultural relevance of applied research
6 The contribution of multimodality in the study of subtitling
7 To conclude
8 References

Abstract

The current development of audiovisual translation (AVT) is fragmented. However, several challenges must be taken up if we want to better understand the impact and consequences of AVT on our daily habits. Therefore, this paper raises four main issues: the need to revise and rethink certain concepts in Translation Studies, because of digitisation; the urgent need to carry out reception studies in order to provide AV programmes accessible to all; the need to highlight the sociocultural relevance of applied research, in such a way that the field is not any longer considered as a constellation of problems but a valuable asset addressing the demand for multilingual and multicultural communication; and finally, the need to find out a methodology able to deal with multimodality – otherwise the major risk is to focus on language, precluding from comprehending these challenges.

1 Introduction

In the digital era, some people cannot avoid trying to catch a magic glimpse of the future of film: with digitization, it would be far cheaper to shoot, cut, edit, duplicate, distribute, and release films, and even cheaper to write scripts, produce special effects, adjust the lights, dress the set, apply the makeup, find the costume and provide screen translation. For others, the brave new digital world does not help you to tell a better story, will not replace the mystical experience of watching a film in a cinema.

However, for everybody – including the translator – the length of time between films being made and when they are shown (in DVD, on the Internet and the mobile phone) is getting shorter, the commercial and technical convergence between the media, telecommunication and Information and Communication Technology (ICT) is speeding up, and the relationship between the copyright holders and broadcasters is also changing rapidly.

For these reasons, we could dream of digitopia. But here, my intention is not to deal with the implications of technology. Let me only mention that new services such as streaming, video and TV on demand, TV on mobile (with new types of very short films), podcasting, etc., will challenge not only providers but also screen translators. The way we will access and consume audio-video-radio programs will change the whole management and financing of the audiovisual (AV) sector. I also believe the type and size of the programs will give new impetus to dubbing, interpreting and voice-over. That is enough for the technical background of my presentation.
I would like to raise five issues:

- The current development of audiovisual translation (AVT) research; Where are we aiming at?
- The need to revise a certain number of concepts in Translation Studies (TS), thanks to AVT
- The challenge of accessibility and reception
- The sociocultural relevance of applied research; AVT should not be seen as a constellation of problems but as a valuable asset addressing the need for multilingual and multicultural communication in the international arena
- The contribution of multimodality in the study of AVT, especially in subtitling

2 Piecemeal research

Over the last decade, a few systematic studies have examined the production and reception or the cultural and linguistic impact of AVT.

AVT has benefited from the rapid development of research interest and of institutional commitment, especially intralingual subtitling for the deaf and hard of hearing, but the discipline remains essentially European, and too often limited to case studies on the linguistic side only, where no sides are taken in the long-running debate on the respective merits of subtitling or dubbing.

However, the field has gained gradual recognition, but it has not yet definitely established its place, either within TS or in relation to other disciplines such as semiotics, media studies, and discourse/pragmatic studies. That may be why AVT is not yet seen as one solution to internationalization, situating it within the context of power-related, cultural and linguistic issues in today’s societies. More often than not, our studies are limited to professional routines, the production process and quality of the output, while too seldom do they emphasize the decision-making (Why, for instance, are advertisements very often dubbed, even in a so-called subtitling country? Who defines the translation policy in TV broadcasting companies and, in particular, who allocates money for translating? etc).

Our field remains too much on the level of isolated descriptions, incurring the risk of fragmentation, and claiming neutrality through a kind of informative mode of discourse: Catalans tell us about Catalan TV, Danes about Danish TV, Germans about subtitling for the deaf and the hard of hearing-impaired in Germany, Portuguese about the same mode for the same group of people, and so on, as if mediascape were not global, formats were not more and more international, outsourcing and relocation did not exist, there were no multinational networks unrestrained by national legislation. Can AVT be considered a positive solution in a world which is increasingly dependent on multimodal and multimedia products and services?

In the current media scenario, there is an ongoing transfer of power – from the media owners to the distributors and professionals who manipulate (literally speaking) the multiple codes. Translators are part of this new group but do not yet realize what this implies or recognize its full effects. Our field remains fragmented, with a vision limited to certain aspects and short-term goals (Gambier 2005). My point here is to emphasize the fragmentation of our research, basically for one reason: our relative specialization. We tend to be specialist technicians even among ourselves: subtitlers are not dubbers, interpreters do not practise voice-over, and so on, and so forth. Furthermore, no one seems to approach the people who decide translation policies.
3 TS and AVT

Certain concepts in TS should arguably be revised, extended and rethought when they are applied to AVT. I will not give here an exhaustive list but mention only a few concepts.

- The notion of text: screen texts are short-lived and do not fit readily into the traditional dichotomy between source text and target text. They are also distinctive in that they are multimodal. But is this not true of any text? Tourist brochures, press articles, art books, children’s books, instruction leaflets, exhibition catalogs, illustrated books and advertisements all combine writing and illustrations (photos, drawings), with considerable scope for variety in the way printing, punctuation and the arrangement of space on the page are used. Is it appropriate, then, to continue speaking of verbal units? Does text mean the same thing in literary translation, conference interpreting and AVT? The traditional concept of linear and verbal text cannot account for the full range of multi-semiotic textual phenomena. And I do not mention here hypertext, defined as a concept and a new means for structuring and accessing documents in distance communication, with interconnection by means of electronic links. There might be more convergence between screen texts and multimedia texts than between screen texts and traditional texts. Anyway, the constitutive criteria of textuality could be developed and adapted to screen texts, criteria such as coherence, situationality, informativity, and intertextuality.

- AVT researchers also have to think critically about the concept of sense, since this is produced neither in a linear sequence nor with a single system of signs. There is interaction not only between the various figures involved in creating the AV product, but also between them and the viewers - even between different AV productions (references, allusions). The hierarchy of original and subsequent distribution or broadcasting becomes questionable, given that intellectual property rights on a film often offer various versions (one for TV, one for use as an airline feature film, or yet another version in which offensive language has been censored in compliance with the demands of political correctness). Digital technology also allows different users (parents, educators, religious associations, ideological groups, etc.) to have access to their own personalized final cut. And what about the concept of loss so often mentioned when referring to AVT? It cannot be restricted to verbal elements. Is there not a certain loss in the meaning of pictures when one reads subtitles? Can we not talk about language hypertrophy, paying less attention to camera moves, viewing angles, editing, soundtrack, tone of voices, facial expressions, gestures, gazes, body movements, all of which are also meaningful?

- The issue of text and sense entail questions regarding translation units in AVT. These units can be based on the predictability of language use and occurrences, themselves related to scene types, as defined and described in cognitive semantics and when you learn how to write scripts.

- The very concept of translation highlights a lack of consensus, overlapping as it does those of adaptation, manipulation, censorship, transfer and remake.

- It is important to reconsider the links between translation norms, which originate and are passed on against a social background, and technical constraints (Fawcett 1996, 2003). In this respect, it is already possible to speak of “abusive” subtitles, for example, those accompanying Japanese animated cartoons on the Internet, produced by amateurs who ignore accepted subtitling conventions and introduce typographic variations, adding glosses or commentaries or changing the position of lines (Norns 1999, Sinha 2004). We already know that films are less and less often seen in cinemas
and more and more released in DVD form and on the Internet. Therefore changes in norms are to be expected.

- Another relevant issue is the relationship between written and oral, between norms for written texts and the written language of subtitles, between ordinary speech and dubbese. In a broader perspective, this leads on to the long-term effects of written communication based on symbols and abbreviations, as in SMS messages and on-line chats or conversations. Not so long ago, suggesting subtitles with emoticons, pictograms and abbreviations might well have seemed provocative. Changing attitudes to spelling are reflected, for example, in the city of Montreal’s Internet site, which can be accessed in three different ways (www.ville.montreal.qc.ca \(\rightarrow\) click on “accès simple”), including what is called the “ortograf alternativ”, matching letters (graphemes) and sounds (phonemes) to facilitate access for “people with intellectual incapacities” (sic). Examples of such spelling in French are “dan bokou de kartiè”, “lê list dê z’aktivité é dê servis son fêt for le sitouayin” or “alé vouar”. “Simplicity” of this kind is distinct from a simplified version of the text’s content, which is also available. This provides, by the way, an argument for viewing the output of machine translation programs (whether commercialized or shareware) in a different light, in that they satisfy a certain number of users who are far from illiterate but who do not need a polished, finely honed text.

- Finally, reception of AV products is a notion on which there is nothing like consensus, since this broad notion might include the 3 Rs, namely reactions on the cognitive level, responses in behavioral terms, and repercussions of a cultural order (Kovačič 1995, Chesterman 2005).

4 The challenge of accessibility and reception

Accessibility has for a number of years been a legal and technical issue in various countries, with a view to ensuring that handicapped persons can enjoy physical access to transport, facilities and cultural venues (ramps, inclined surfaces, parking, low-floor buses, etc.). Recently, accessibility has also become an important issue in the computer and telecommunications industries, the aim being to optimize the user-friendliness of software, web sites and other applications. Distribution of AV media is also involved in this trend, since it is important to cater for the needs of user groups such as the deaf. The issue of accessibility is, however, not merely a question of providing for special visual, auditory, motor or cognitive needs; such a view of the issue is far too restrictive in the light of the digital divide, income-related differences in Internet use, and the exclusion of certain sectors of society from access to information. Accessibility means that AV or electronic products and services must be available to all users, irrespective of issues such as where they live, their level of experience, their physical and mental capacity, or the configuration of their computer. Accessibility is not just an issue for the disabled: it does not only mean a barrier-free situation; it also means that services are available and that information is provided and easy to understand.

In my opinion, there is a strong relationship between usability as a measure of the effectiveness, efficiency and satisfaction with which specified users can achieve specified goals in a particular environment (as a web site or a software or an AV product) and accessibility as a means to make web content, and film content available to all users, whatever tool they are using (voice browser, mobile phone, etc.) or whatever constraints they may be operating under (noisy surrounding, under-illuminated room, etc.) The goal of usability is a better experience for the user; the goal of accessibility is equality of access – both have implications for design and the use of different semiotic systems as color, font size,
punctuation, intonation, voice pitch, and so on. Both can help us to better understand the effects of screen translation, and to better understand the convergence between AVT and multimedia translation.

What we need now is to discern the needs of different users, to know the viewers’ needs and reception capacity, whatever the modality of AVT being offered: media interpreting, live subtitles (respeaking), audio description, etc. While relatively little academic research has been done (often unpublished), some of the slack has been taken up by other forms of research, e.g. commercial and advertising studies based on Audimat, marketing surveys among distributors, feasibility studies involving electronics and telephone companies. User reactions, demands and expectations are thus not totally unknown.

However, how can producers and screen translators make the most informed decision when there is so little reliable and available research? Audio description for the blind, voice-over for experts or for children watching documentaries could be adapted for different subgroups if we had a better knowledge of their capacities, habits and technological literacy. The challenge goes far beyond the usual discussions among translators, more concerned with problems of linguistic transfer than with the wider effects and functions of their work. Directly or not, clearly or not, the context of reception of an AV product and its genre affect the decisions made by translators. In all cases, the translator selects different strategies and assumes a certain knowledge and cognitive frames in the viewers. Effectiveness, in term of pragmatics, means that the greater the viewers’ processing effort, the lower is the relevance of the translation.

Reception studies can use different methods of investigation (de Linde & Kay 1999), according to the level of reception (cf. section 2, the three Rs: reactions, responses and repercussions):

- Survey methods, eliciting viewers’ responses with questionnaires, interviews
- Experimental methods, providing insights into the effects of particular translation features
- And controlled procedures, designed to record actual motor behavior, for instance to study the different forms of attention (active/passive/selective/global/linear). Here we could use eye-movement monitors/cameras and eye-tracking methodology, already used in studies on reading web sites

5 The socio-cultural relevance of applied research

One of the fundamental convictions in my presentation is that AVT should be seen not as a constellation of problems but as a valuable asset addressing the need for multilingual and multicultural communication.

In Finland today, the two public television channels broadcast over 2 millions subtitles per year (2003). The amount of text equals roughly 120 novels of 300 pages each.

The European Barometer carried out an opinion poll in November-December 2005. The survey shows clearly that using subtitles can encourage and facilitate language learning. But, on average, only 10% of European Union (EU) citizens state that they have used watching films in their original version as a way to learn languages. However, the majority of Europeans (56%) would rather watch foreign films and programs dubbed than hear the original language with subtitles. These figures are not given here to restart the long-running debate subtitling vs. dubbing, but to emphasize the need for more evidence on the use and usefulness of the different modalities of AVT.

The AV media certainly play a major linguistic role today, especially in private homes, just as school and literature did in the past. However, what has been focused on to date has
been mostly the indirect didactic role played by such media. Looking at subtitled programs, it is as if one were reading the television. But there is still no research on the possible correlation between viewing or reading of subtitles and the absence of illiteracy in a given society. Channels like TV5, BBC4 and TV4 nevertheless offer their audiences (intralingual) subtitles, irrespective of the degree of mastery of the language concerned.

Again my concern here is to focus on the social or rather socio-cultural function of translation.

Certainly, if we could demonstrate that programs and films with interlingual or intralingual subtitles help viewers not only to maintain or even reinforce their ability to read but also to learn foreign languages (assimilating foreign sounds, expressions or accents), I am sure certain TV broadcasters and film distributors would pay more attention to subtitling and the working conditions of the subtitlers. The same applies if we could prove the possible role of subtitles in language acquisition by the deaf and hard of hearing. In other words, what are our priorities in our agenda? Will we go on studying the translation of humor while the EU Commission would like to know if subtitling should be promoted as a learning tool?

Another field of applied research is quality, an issue which has been widely debated in recent years in translation generally but which has not yet prompted too much research in AVT (Gambier 1999). Quality goes hand in hand with reciprocal cooperation and trust between service providers and their clients. It is the result of a collective and joint effort, although many translators think that they hold the monopoly on quality. Producers, distributors and viewers are also involved, their expectations and demands not necessarily coinciding with the translators’ since they do not always stem from language considerations, nor are they based on the written language of the subtitlers. The social implications of this are important: between the producer or screen writer who does not give a single thought to translated dialogues and the young SMS or chat enthusiast, the translator will not always have the last word – particularly if s/he fails to explain the role s/he should play in cultural mediation and in the development of subtitle users’ reading and language learning skills.

Quality is thus defined by both external parameters (linked to viewers’ needs and expectations) and intrinsic criteria (linked to such factors as translators’ skills, labor organization, and the specific features of the AVT modality). Localization has quality assurance thanks to LISA (Localization Industry Standards Association), the automobile industry has its SAE J2450 quality norms, but the work done to ensure legibility, information content and precision in subtitling has still not led to an accepted code of best practice for AVT.

I have mentioned above (section 2) the challenge of the norm for written texts and the written language of subtitles. What will be the decision of the translator if a commercial TV broadcasting company requires him or her to use smileys, abbreviations, pictograms while, at the same time, a public channel requires a very standardized written subtitling? The answer cannot be given only from a financial perspective (the translator needs money every day); there is here an ethical challenge, based on the role and function of the translator. Many video games are based on films (e.g. Harry Potter, Star Wars III, Spiderman, King Kong) and many films nowadays are based on video games (e.g. Silent Hill). To what extent does the same translator have to adapt not only different strategies but also different behaviors?

6 The contribution of multimodality in the study of subtitling

No text is, strictly speaking, monomodal. Traditional texts, hypertexts, screen texts combine different semiotic resources. Films and TV programs co-deploy gesture, gaze, movement, visual images, sound, colors, proxemics, oral and written language, and so on. Although many kinds of texts with different types of signs are dealt with in Translation Studies (AV,
advertising, theatre, songs, comics), the focus tends to be limited to their linguistic features. There is a strong paradox: we are ready to acknowledge the interrelations between the verbal and the visual, between language and non-verbal, but the dominant research perspective remains largely linguistic. The multisemiotic blends of many different signs are not ignored but they are usually neglected or not integrated into a framework. Is it not a contradiction to set up a data base or a corpus of film dialogues and their subtitles, with no pictures, and still pretend to study screen translation?

Two factors probably explain this paradox: on the one hand, the linguistic and literary background of most of the researchers; on the other hand, the practical constraints of data collection and annotation (time-consuming and copyright problems), and (printed) publication (in two dimensions). The potential of CD, DVD, and Internet-based technology should gradually change these trends.

A third factor must be added: the lack, until recently, of a relevant methodology to deal with multimodality. I believe, however, that the multimodal discourse analysis will help to develop awareness and analysis of the integration of semiotic resources in AV, such as films, and multimedia products, such as web pages.

This is not the place to lecture about the multimodal transcription technique (Baldry & Taylor 2002; Taylor 2003, 2004) and how it provides an analysis of a video clip, for instance, by breaking it down into individual frames, and how it allows you to identify recurrent patterns in the clip. Multimodal text analysis assumes that the meaning of a film, a TV ad, a web page, a cartoon, a comic book, is the composite process/product of different selected semiotic resources (Baldry & Thibault 2006). Such an analysis which can be long (more than 30 pages for 60 seconds of a TV ad) is very useful for trainee subtitlers, for scholars, but not for professionals (ibid.: 46-51, 165-251). It sheds light on our perception and processing of various AVT modalities: for instance, do images account for less than 50% in the meaning-making in a dubbed version? For more than 50% in the subtitled version? Do the viewers base their interpretation more on the verbal text in the beginning of a film?

Another way to understand multimodality is, in my opinion, through script writing. Screenwriting represents a form of story telling that presents three classes of features (Cattrysse & Gambier forthcoming). Some of these features are common to story-telling in general (for example, oral narration, drama, film etc), irrespective of the medium that is used. A second set of features is typical of drama writing (with a plot, a conflict, a climax, and with characters). The third category includes atmosphere (sound, setting and costumes), camera positions, editing and post-production operations. Knowing these characteristics, and how they are combined may enhance the translation process and increase the skill of the translator. If you know how to visualize love at first sight, the tension between two relatives, you will learn the value of the words.

7 To conclude

According to Eurodata TV Worldwide, television was watched in 2005, in 64 countries, for 3 hours and 4 minutes a day, 28 minutes longer than in 1995. With the new digital technology, this average can only increase (with, in passing, the problem of definition of an AV work which is not only a legal or semantic matter because it has financial implications). In this changing mediascape, the translators have and will have a major role, if they fully realize their socio-cultural function.
8 References


Minako O’Hagan (Dublin)

Teletranslation Revisited: Futurama for Screen Translators?

Contents
1 Background to Teletranslation
2 Localization
3 CAT and Translation Research using Technology
4 Theoretical Considerations for the Impact of Technology
5 Conclusion: Futurama
6 References

Abstract

The progressive expansion of broadband links and the wealth of information accessible on the Internet have significantly influenced the way the translator works today. Similarly, the dynamic development of digital content and rapid changes in people’s communication and entertainment habits are creating a new type of translation content. The shift from print to electronic media is challenging the established translation procedure and provoking new ways of translating, in turn calling for new theoretical frameworks and new research methodologies in translation studies (TS). Given the increasingly indispensable role played by technology in the modern translation practice, the need for technology-oriented translation research has never been greater. Using the concept of teletranslation (O’Hagan 1996) as a starting point, this paper explores the consequences of technology for the translation profession and argues that audiovisual translation will become an essential part of future translation in response to the increasing range of multimedia elements incorporated in new types of content.

1 Background to Teletranslation

The advent of the Internet and the more recent penetration of mobile networks are now something most translators take for granted. Only a decade ago Internet connections were still patchy, with most translators operating with a mixture of telephone (land line), physical mail system, fax machines and the emergent form of Internet services, with slow and costly connections for far less information available. This contrasts with the instant link to a huge variety of information readily accessible to the translator today at a very low cost, albeit with variable quality. Translators are now able to operate at almost any distance from their clients or agencies, as long as they have access to a PC connected to the Internet. The affinity of translation and teleworking has been well recognized, as translation is primarily a location-independent asynchronous practice where the translator does not have to be physically present - apart from certain cases such as sight translation where translation is orally conducted in synchronous mode for the recipient. And yet a comprehensive teleworking mode was not ready for translation 10 years ago, in the absence of backbone technologies. Throughout the 80s, the telecommunications environment for translators left much to be desired, in that there was no speedy and affordable access to information in various specialized subject domains in different languages. There were also limitations to the availability of information in machine-readable form. In the 80s and through to the late 90s, the issue of information accessibility was particularly problematic for translators operating in isolation, away from the target
language country. Today, while out-of-country translators can readily access country-specific information, electronic connectivity has also made it possible to readily organize ‘in-country translation’ whereby translation commissioned elsewhere is specifically undertaken in the target language country, and thus used as a ‘quality label’. In this way, while physical boundaries have become porous, at the same time attention to locality is in some ways highlighted, as in the case of ‘in-country’ translation.

The concept of teletranslation (O’Hagan 1996; O’Hagan & Ashworth 2002) was put forward as more than an extension of the teleworking mode, referring rather to entirely new ways of dealing with translation. As such, it meant a new paradigm of translation. It entailed translation operation based on a global network linking text and translators, as well as translation tools, on the one hand, and the service to the customer on the other. Such changes were seen as affecting the entire process of translation work in the way the text is processed, stored and transmitted, as well as the way in which knowledge is shared among translators and with customers. Today the basic building blocks needed for teletranslation are almost in place; the translator can readily be linked electronically to the customer and to fellow translators, and text in electronic form can be transmitted with relative ease. However, there are still some obstacles to achieving fully-fledged teletranslation. For example, the source text is still not always in machine-readable form, even in large organizations that are high volume translation users (Lommel 2004: 6), which in turn hampers the seamless application of translation tools such as Translation Memory (TM) and Machine Translation (MT) at the translator’s end. While CAT (computer-aided translation) is now generally accepted in the translation industry, the degree of implementation and sophistication in its use varies, as elaborated later. Similarly, the use of MT among translators remains limited. However, an increasing volume of text is being translated using MT directly by the end user, largely because of the availability of free online MT tools such as Babelfish. At the beginning of the 90s the translation output ratio between Human Translation and Machine Translation was estimated at 300M pages: 2.5M pages in Europe and the US combined (Löffler-Laurian 1996), but a decade later Babelfish reportedly receives over a million hits daily (Mckinsay 2001) for various amounts of translation, overtaking the human translation supply purely on the basis of the quantity of text being processed. In this way, the Internet has created a niche for MT as a gisting tool to help the user wade through a vast amount of information. While MT dominance does not mean that all online translation demand is fully met by MT, it has highlighted a specific translation need emerging from the online world. This in turn illustrated how the new communications environment is driving a new translation demand.

With the broad aim of exploring how technological advancement will likely affect translation further, this paper first looks into developments pertinent to teletranslation since 2000 and examines the impact and implications of dealing with new translation text which is primarily in electronic, as opposed to print, form. The paper addresses the need for a new theoretical framework and approach in translation studies (TS) to accommodate the new translation content, taking videogames and DVD film titles as case examples. In view of the increasing use of multimedia in the new form of translation content, the author argues that audiovisual translation will become an integral part of teletranslation practice.
2 Localization

2.1 Rise of Localization

The translation sector that has enjoyed the benefits, and also borne the consequences, of dealing with electronic text read on screen is software localization. As such, it provides a good model for teletranslation. The practice of localization emerged during the 80s in response to the globalization of the personal computer market (Esselink 2000). Software localization entails producing a given language/regional version called a “locale”. Over and above the requirements for translations of packaging and manuals in print form, it requires the body of software itself to be translated, requiring translated text (referred to as “strings”) to be incorporated into the software by means of software engineering. While localization strategies may differ from product to product, the industry has established the core objective of localized products as being to retain the “look and feel” of a locally available equivalent product (Fry 2003), which involves both linguistic and cultural adjustments to the product (Esselink 1998: 2). This clearly indicates the general orientation of the translation to be that of domestication in the Venetian sense, where the text is brought closer to the reader rather than the other way around. The early experience of localizing Microsoft’s multimedia encyclopedia Encarta into Spanish and German in 1995 illustrated how extensive the adaptation process had to be to enable the content for the target market (Kohlmeier 2000).

After its initial beginnings as a sector closely associated with the computer industry, localization has since come to make a widespread impact on the rest of the translation industry (O’Hagan 2004). The localization sector remains dynamic and continues to expand to accommodate new requirements arising from new types of content, primarily in electronic form, that has to be enabled for a target market. From mainly dealing with computer software, localization practices have now extended to include an increasing range of products¹, including videogames, that provide good examples of how this new type of content affects translation. These are discussed below.

2.2 Videogames and Films on DVDs

Since their humble beginnings in the 1960s, videogames have come to form a dynamic digital entertainment industry, and are also gathering momentum as an area of independent academic research after a long period of prejudice (Wolf & Perron 2003). However, despite their global status, due in no small part to localization efforts, videogames have largely been ignored in TS (O’Hagan 2006). Videogames localization shares similar elements with software localization, and also incorporate screen translation techniques for their in-game movie elements called cut-scenes, i.e. scenes used to advance the plot or inserted as a reward for reaching a certain level with the game. In relation to conventional translation text typology, games form a special text type in their own right, calling for technical and literary translation as well as audiovisual translation. This combines a process that is similar to software localization, since the game medium is primarily a piece of software, thus requiring the software functionality to be retained in the user environment, with a different kind of translation for the text in the games, which needs to be translated so as to convey the pleasure of the game. The skopos of games localization is to transfer as closely as possible the overall


101
game play experience as derived in the original game. This makes it imperative that the translator is familiar with the genre of new digital interactive entertainment and understands the nature of the pleasure involved. The overall goal of the game dictates translation strategies whereby the translator is often granted extensive freedom in rendering the text, to the extent that it is described as transcreation (Mangiron & O’Hagan 2006).

Another example of a new type of content requiring translation is films on DVD. When films are released on DVD, they acquire certain features similar to computer software, mainly because of the added interactivity in comparison with films in the cinema. Making a DVD film title available for different markets involves additional translations for packaging, menu system and any other text included in the film’s bonus materials. Furthermore, the fact that a single DVD disk can hold up to 32 sets of subtitles led many DVD releases to include subtitled versions in multiple languages. As a solution to cope with the time pressure, and also to counter piracy, a new translation workflow was developed for the simultaneous production of these subtitles in the required languages, using a master file. This so-called “genesis file” contains the intralingual subtitles in the source language with fixed time codes to which all language versions have to conform. A template-based approach such as this is familiar in the localization industry, where a list of source language strings extracted from different parts of software is replaced by their equivalents in the target language. On a master file, the time codes are fixed across different language subtitles despite the normally varying length of subtitles according to language. The tendency towards standardization such as this is another frequently observed characteristic of localization practice. In this way, the emergence of DVD as a medium for the distribution of audiovisual material seems to have placed screen translation in the broad realm of localization. Anecdotal evidence suggests that some DVD subtitles are produced with the subtitlers having to translate on a master file even without seeing the film. This is also reminiscent of the situation which arises when videogames are localized in the mode of simship (simultaneous shipment) where various locales need to be released at the same time as the original. These new practices are creating concerns for subtitlers, who argue that the new workflow is being devised at the expense of quality. What is needed is an empirical study to investigate the correlation between the new commercial approach and its impact on the translation outcome. Only with such efforts can we gain insight into new forms of translation, and come up with an optimum approach which still meets the commercial demand, while minimizing the degree of compromise in the quality of translation.

Both videogames and DVD film titles raise new translation issues, as they both present new characteristics. For example, videogames localization, which seeks to retain the pleasure derived from playing the original game, requires closer attention to the medium-specific characteristics pertinent to digital interactive games. A functionalist approach to translation will need much more concrete elaboration to specifically address the unique nature of games, such as the ludological dimensions of game play, as they need to be reflected in the translation. This makes it necessary to seek inspiration from games research itself. Games research is gathering pace, incorporating a number of different perspectives such as games design and reception (Raessens & Goldstein 2005: xii). These two dimensions appear to be particularly relevant in the context of translation, for an understanding of the designer’s intention on the one hand, and the individual player’s reception on the game on the other. This in turn has implications for a theoretical framework on which TS scholars can make sense of the translation issues involved in the task. In a similar way, films on DVD create a new form of translation content as a result of the media mix where the elements of multimedia software (e.g. navigation menu) and cinema plus the concept of various bonus features come together to demand a new translation approach. This raises the question of how the new characteristics of translation content can be adequately explained for the purpose of translation. The last section of the paper will return to the issue from a theoretical point of view. In the meantime,
the next section addresses another element in teletranslation: the use of specialized translation tools which are often justified by the new type of content.

3 CAT and Translation Research using Technology

3.1 Actual Use of CAT Tools in the Translation Industry

Localization is the most technology-driven and technology-dependent sector of the translation industry, as it deals with electronic content which is not “translatable” without using technology because of the very nature of the medium (O’Hagan & Ashworth 2002). Technology plays a central role across the entire workflow of localization, ranging from project management to billing. The actual translation process itself is also heavily reliant on the use of computer-based tools to deal with various document tags, for example, and also to leverage previously translated strings through the use of Translation Memory (TM) and terminology management systems. The LISA 2004 Translation Memory Survey (Lommel 2004) conducted by the Localization Industry Standards Association (LISA) showed that 74% of 274 respondents used TM for most of their translation work. The survey also noted that while there were respondents who had only recently implemented TM, there were also some highly experienced users who are making sophisticated use of the technology. This includes further automation of the translation process where Machine Translation (MT) and TM are integrated into the daily translation production process. The influence of translation technology in the translation process seems irrefutable in this sector. However, it has to be said that use of translation technology tools appears to be negligible in the case of videogames localization, and similarly in audiovisual translation (O’Hagan 2003).

While CAT is a widespread presence in most localization areas, the situation is not necessarily the same in the wider sphere of the translation industry, supported by a large contingent of freelance translators. For example, the 2004 survey by Fulford and Granell-Zafra (2004: 7) conducted with nearly 400 freelance translators in the UK revealed a relatively low use of CAT tools, at 28%, with nearly one half of the respondents stating no familiarity with these tools. Similarly, only 24% of the surveyed translators were using a dedicated terminology management system. The use of MT and localization tools was 5% and 2% respectively. This suggests that the majority of the surveyed translators were unlikely to be engaged in localization work. In terms of Internet usage, 68% relied on dial-up connections with 26% using broadband. The area of concentrated use was e-mail (93%), search engines (85%), online dictionaries (79%) and text/document archives (51%), with one third (33%) using translation portals for activities relating to marketing and work procurement. The survey confirmed the widespread use of the Internet as an essential communication tool for translation work via e-mail and also as the most prevalent research source, including specialized sources such as online dictionaries and archive sites. It also showed that the Internet is providing a source of work and also a marketing tool for one third of the surveyed population. By the same token, the survey indicated a relatively low uptake of CAT tools and a very low use of MT among the freelance translators, suggesting that translation is carried out mainly without the aid of any specialized tools beyond basic text processing software (the survey indicated that 99% of the translators use such software). The latter findings are also in keeping with the lack of interest by translators in the use of specialized corpus tools such as

---

2 Given that this survey was conducted on the LISA website, it can be assumed that the majority of the respondents have been engaged in localization work in one way or another, although the profiles of the respondents classified according to job titles do not make this explicit.
Wordsmith tools (Bowker and Barlow 2004) which are useful in understanding the frequency of certain key words, their collocations, etc. In comparison with mostly positive attitudes to ICT (Information and Communication Technology) in general, the study detected much less conviction in the surveyed group about the value of CAT tools (Fulford & Granell-Zafra ibid).

These results suggest that the use of CAT tools prior to 2004 was not widespread among the examined freelance translators, at least those working in the UK. This survey suggests that while the benefit of connectivity by telecommunications is widely exploited, that of specific translation technology applications is limited, perhaps indicating the need for further improvements to the tools to make them directly applicable to translators’ work. Translation tools are considered to be an integral part of teletranslation, and yet the current situation suggests that CAT is far from ubiquitous. This calls for further study into what technology is needed by the translator, where the current technology is failing and how it can be improved. This line of investigation, in turn, requires technology-focused research, as discussed in the following section.

3.2 Technology-focused Research and Translation Research Using Technology

While both industry and academia have come to recognize the increasing influence of technology in the modern commercial translation practice, there has been a paucity of research within TS to systematically address the impact and implications of technology. A few exceptions include the work done earlier by Sager (1994) who examined the significant change in the entire process of translation production as a consequence of technology applications from a language engineering perspective. More recently, Austermühl (2001) examined how individual CAT technologies work in the context of translation tasks, and Bowker (2002) highlighted the advantages and the disadvantages of these applications in various translation scenarios. Empirical research on TM, such as in Bowker and Barlow (2004) and Bowker (2005), provides a further insight into the characteristics of the technology, but publications in this area are few and far between. Somers (ed.) (2003) provides a comprehensive examination of translation technology applications in the translator’s workplace and also in language teaching. It is interesting to note that Somers is a computational linguist, and by definition located outside the TS discipline. Somers’ work is a response to the plea by Gentzler (2003) for interdisciplinary research in TS. However, the prevailing picture is that mainstream TS research has not sought insights directly from computational linguistics or engineering disciplines as a way of shedding light on the shortcomings of the current generation of translation tools as perceived by translators. This lack is also evidenced in the fact that the mainstream translation theories still lack a specific technology orientation facilitating the systematic analysis of the application and impact of technology in the translation process and the profession as a whole. This sentiment is echoed in the recent work by Quah (2006), highlighting the increasingly close relationship developing between translation and technology, with a particular emphasis on MT and its theoretical background. One of the early criticisms of MT research by the TS community included its lack of interest in the translator’s contribution (Quah ibid) and yet the initiative needs to come from the TS community itself, which is best placed to provide the feedback on translation technology as actually used in the day-to-day operation by the translator.

---

3 The 2005 survey (JTF, 2006: 18) conducted by the Japan Translation Federation found that 67 (49%) out of 137 Japan-based translation companies indicated the use of TM or MT. This figure sits somewhere between the freelance survey and the LISA survey.
The other side of the coin in technology-focused translation research is to conduct research using technology which in turn enables new approaches and methodologies to be formulated. The mid-90s saw the advent of corpus-based TS research (Baker 1995), which led to the development and enhancement of a cluster of corpus tools such as Wordsmith Tools, ParaConc, MultiConc etc, which are now widely used by TS researchers (Olohan 2004: 184). Another area of TS which promotes technology-based research methodologies is process-oriented translation studies (Alves 2003). The latter borrows heavily from approaches used in psycholinguistics and cognitive science, often involving actual experimentation using instruments. One early example in this area of research in TS is the use of the keyboard logging device Translog first developed in 1995 by Arnt Jacobsen, which is specifically designed for translation tasks. Other more general-purpose multimodal monitoring products are now becoming available on the market, that can be employed to log the entire process of translation production to obtain empirical data. Another relevant area of development is a new generation of less obtrusive eye-tracking tools which can be used to gather data on eye movements during the human translation process. For example, O’Brien (2006) is exploring the potential of such a tool for analyzing the strategies used by the translator while translating with TM by tracing the translator’s scan path, fixations and pupil dilations in dealing with different types of TM matches. The new EU supported project Eye-to-IT combines Translog with an eye tracker and EEG (electroencephalograph) to develop a human-computer monitoring and feedback system to study cognition and translation. Similar to the area of corpus-based studies in TS, the increasing interest in the area of technology-focused research using technology may see new tools being developed.

Internet-mediated research (IMR) is a technique now widely recognized by researchers working in different disciplines (Hewson et al. 2003) hoping to take advantage of a plethora of tools becoming available on the Internet, which could also be promising as a source of translation research tools. For example, the web-based collaborative authoring environment Wiki, made well-known by Wikipedia, can be used as a platform to study the mode of collaborative translation, as the software allows the researcher to keep track of the history of all changes ever made on a given text by different individuals. This will be useful for studying the nature of collaboration among networked translators working together at a distance, thus contributing to the study of knowledge sharing in teletranslation. The use of new tools and methodologies combined with new theoretical bases will further advance TS research in providing insight into the changing nature of a profession for which technology is becoming an indispensable factor. The next section discusses a theoretical framework for analyzing the role played by technology in the translation process.

4 Theoretical Considerations for the Impact of Technology

In an attempt to provide a framework for analyzing the role of technology in the context of teletranslation, the model of Translation-mediated Communication (TMC) has been proposed (O’Hagan & Ashworth 2002). On the basis of a communication model, TMC treats translation as communication between the sender and the receiver of a given translation, in terms of the message and how it is processed, stored and transmitted. Further, it makes it possible to examine the relationship between the translator on the one side, and the sender and the receiver of the translation on the other, in sharing knowledge in a communication link. TMC was so named by analogy with Computer-mediated Communication (CMC), and therefore focuses on the message primarily in electronic form. For example, the translation

---

4 http://www.dpmi.tu-graz.ac.at/eye2it.html
process via Babelfish can be analyzed in terms of TMC as follows: the sender of the message creates some given content, often a website, and the receiver types in the URL of the website in Babelfish to obtain a translation. After a few seconds the translated website is returned to the receiver. In this case, the whole translation process takes place through activating the MT site, which automatically transmits the source text on the Internet to the MT engine, and transmitting the target text back to the receiver, all in one seamless session. The translation can be stored by the receiver or discarded soon after, depending on its purpose. In this way, the analysis of how the text is processed, transmitted and stored can highlight the role played by technology. This is just one approach to elicit how the message moves between the sender and the receiver mediated by technology.

The area of TS study covering technology aids belongs to the applied branch within the system of TS theories as mapped by Holms (1899/2000). While this map has been useful in presenting the whole spectrum of TS, it may need to allow for the fact that some fundamental premises of translation are changing because of technology, as the concept of teletranslation attempts to illustrate. The impact of technological developments is multi-fold, affecting not only the tools employed for translation and background research, but also the nature of the content for translation. When the situation is considered from this perspective, the changing environments are likely to cause a drastic shift on basic assumptions about translation which were primarily made based on print form. This in turn supports the argument that the treatment of technological impact on translation should not be of a secondary nature. Current translation theories and associated theoretical frameworks do not seem to provide a useful approach to make sense of the changes taking place in the new paradigm of translation due mainly to technological changes. Munday (2001: 190) briefly discusses the significant impact of technology on translation but stops short of suggesting a new approach to account for this new factor. Such shortcomings are reflected in the lack of theorization of practices such as localization, and the time lag between theory and practice is worsened by the continuous development of new products, in turn introducing new translation practices into the industry. This clearly points to the need for translation research to allow for a technology-focus.

In the search for a new approach to translation research, one theoretical tool which looks promising in the area of games localization is affordance theory, originally proposed by Gibson (1979) in the field of human perception, which is now largely applied to examine the nature of human-machine interface and interactivity. The theory focuses on human perception, which recognizes the affordance properties of different objects in the environment which induce an action by a human actor. For example, a door knob affords opening by the human who sees the object, perceives the function of the knob and turns it. Games design builds on such properties to get the player to take certain actions which the game designer wants him/her to perform. Top-selling Japanese videogames are considered to be particularly superior in terms of affordance (Masuyama 2001: 132), providing superior interactive features between the game and the player. Affordance theory can be used to analyze the relationship between the game and the player in different linguistic and cultural contexts. This line of investigation may be useful in examining specific dimensions of translation imposed when localizing Japanese videogames. Theories such as this help to address the significant new characteristic of the three-dimensional game world, which differs from the linear textual world for which the translation practice has traditionally been designed.

As discussed earlier, the overall objective for games localization lies in conveying a sense of the pleasure to be gained from the game. To this end, games localization sometimes involves extensive transformations. Adaptation may involve not only textual elements, such as names of characters, but also non-textual aspects, such as facial features of characters, objects, settings, etc. Affordance theories can then be applied to the overall localization and translation strategies to make the player perform certain intended actions. For example, certain actions on the part of the player can be induced more readily by applying the concept
of affordance which may differ from culture to culture, affecting both the design of the object and textual components. These concepts in turn can be tested to explore how strategies guided by affordance considerations as reflected in translation and localization may impact on the intended user of the localized game. Such experiments may benefit from the use of tools such as an eye tracker to detect the scan path, fixations etc in relation to the object in question. In this way, an approach to games localization from the design and the reception perspectives can be combined with affordance theory considerations. The affordance theory can also be applied to efforts to understand the relationship between the translation tool and the translator such as TM or MT whereby eliciting the role of the tool as an object in the translation process and its outcome. Given the increasing degree of multitasking promoted by certain translation tools such as TM, such a research direction may prove fruitful into identifying shortcomings and advantages of these tools employed in translation tasks.

The emergence of new types of content to be translated, involving new translation tools gives rise to an interdisciplinary approach. The discipline of translation has traditionally borrowed concepts from other fields such as linguistics. Although the recent trend in TS has been to move away from linguistics, the theoretical framework that seems productive in the area of audiovisual translation is Fillmore’s (1977) scenes-and-frames semantics, previously explored in the context of translation by Vermeer (1992). This framework was more recently discussed in O’Hagan & Ashworth (2002: 151) and also in connection with visualization in translation by Kussmaul (2004). It allows consideration of the proximity between the image (scenes) evoked by the translator upon reading the source text and that intended by the originator of the source on the one hand, and how that the difference affects the resultant translation (frames) on the other. The closer the scenes evoked by the originator and the translator, the better the translation outcome can be, although the translator can still get the wrong frame based on the right scenes. In the case of audiovisual translation, the presence of actual scenes on screen fills in the gap between the scenes evoked by the translator and that by the originator, and in fact the scenes and frames could work in a reverse direction for the translator. In a standard workflow, a subtitler will get the visual and audio (textual) cues together, so the scenes can be taken as given. However, with the flexibility provided by the new media such as videogames, unlike screen translation, games localization sometimes involves the manipulation of scenes in the form of screen representations to adapt the images on screen to suit the target market (O’Hagan & Mangiron 2004); in such instances translators’ mental images (scenes) may be used to manipulate the original scenes provided. However, these decisions will be influenced further by the consideration of the game play and the design of the game as a whole. In addressing cases such as above, the application of the scenes-and-frames semantics could facilitate an understanding of the translation decision and an explanation of translation strategies. This approach also may be useful in analyzing the subtitles translated without the film being seen by the translator, as happens in actual practice. Such research may be able to provide useful guidelines in suggesting optimal work procedures when working with new computer tools and under new market conditions. These are just a few preliminary suggestions which require further exploration to determine which line of investigation will point to the fruitful direction in order to address a range of newly emerging translation content types.

5 Conclusion: Futurama

This paper set out to argue that the discipline of TS needs to recognize the significant impact of technology in translation, using the concept of teletranslation as a starting point. The paper presented videogames and film titles on DVDs as instances of emerging translation content. These relatively new practices are in turn introducing new ways of translating and new
translation issues. There are clear signs that the previously separate domains of localization and audiovisual translation are intersecting in the emergence of new types of translation content. In this way, the futurama of translation may see audiovisual translation taking the centre stage on the basis of its expertise in dealing with the multimodal world which evolves on screen. However, the target continues to move and today’s audiovisual translation will be most definitely be different in the future. The underlying developments in ICT, new types of translation content and changing conditions for translation work are driving new modes and models of translation, clearly challenging conventional ways of dealing with and thinking about translation. Teletranslation is still in the making, as seen above, pending the development of more ubiquitous translation tools which are fully integrated into the translator’s daily work routine in the same way as wordprocessing programs are today.

While the industry is leading academia in the practice of many of these new areas, there is a role to be played by academia in preparing the translation profession for the next stage through the innovative use of research tools, and by seeking new theoretical frameworks in an attempt to shed light on these new, and rapidly unfolding, phenomena. The exploration of these areas will enter the territory of what “could be possible”, which according to Edward de Bono is a question not asked enough in research environments today, and yet is vital to breaking new ground (Fahy 2005: 24). The next step forward for TS is to keep pursuing such questions. The continued impact of technology on translation means that exploration of the translation world will in future require a technology-oriented approach, which will make collaboration with other disciplines essential.

6 References


Christopher Taylor (Trieste)

“I knew he’d say that!” A consideration of the predictability of language use in film

Contents

1 Film Language
2 Genre
3 Predictability
4 Concluding remarks
5 References

Abstract

This paper is based on three essential premises, Firstly the language of film must be regarded as an entity in itself that can be shown to differ, often appreciably, from the spontaneous, authentic discourse of everyday talk. Secondly, language can be categorized in terms of genres, subgenres and ‘genrelets’, each of these subdivisions containing a sufficiently recognisable number of compulsory and optional linguistic features (see Halliday & Hasan 1989) as to be identifiable as distinct entities. Thirdly, following logically on the first two premises, it is possible in some circumstances to predict film language use with a reasonable degree of accuracy, even to the extent of being able to propose strategies and techniques based on the work carried out in the field of translation memory. All of this is to be seen in the light of research activity aimed at refining the strategies involved in screen translation.

The methodology proposed is based on the predictability of textual occurrences and frequencies in particular scenarios. Research in Trieste has recently concentrated on the language associated with particular scene types, especially in relation to the multimodal nature of such text. This has firstly involved work on identifying scene types in a range of films by dividing each film into discrete units as they unfold on the screen, for example (1) restaurant scene 04.19 - 04.45 > (2) public row 04.46 - 05.10 > (3) marriage proposal 05.10-06.15 > return to restaurant (Moonstruck, 1987: Reiner). Secondly specific scene types have been isolated and extrapolated from all the films in the sample and studied together. This methodology has enabled us to confirm predictions about language use in particular situations, a concept supported by the theoretical considerations of such linguists as Sinclair (1991) in terms of corpus linguistics and Hoey (2004) in terms of his ‘priming’ hypothesis (see below). Serendipitously, this work has also led us to distinguish the truly original film, that ‘declares its distance’ like any work of art, from the more mundane variety. Indeed, predictability values differ greatly between the extremes of the artistic and the popular. This has important implications for the translator, particularly the subtitler whose need for precision may compete with stylistic, semantic or aesthetic considerations. On the other hand, more ‘run of the mill’ productions could even be candidates for a sophisticated kind of translation memory tool. The paper will report on findings thus far.
1 Film Language

The thesis that film language differs appreciably from ordinary, everyday spontaneous language has been recognized, and little criticized, since the earliest days of the cinema. So what is cinema and what makes it different in this respect? Cinema is “telling stories through the projection of moving images” according to Paul and Wells’ cinema patent of 1895, a concept restated almost a century later by Lotman (1979: 56) - “Cinema is, by its very nature, narrative”. And while every narrative act is based on an act of communication between a sender and a receiver, in the case of the cinema there are two channels of communication, the verbal and the figurative. Both these channels have their lexicogrammar: the verbal has its words and syntax, the figurative has its lexical units in the images of characters and objects and its grammar in the organisation of these images. The innovation that cinema provided is to be seen in this ‘visual grammar’ (see Kress & van Leeuwen, 1996). For the first time, pictures succeeded one another, creating patterns of occurrence and repetition that resembled the linear flow of speech. But the flow of images was (and is) created by film directors, cameramen, set designers and the like in the construction of an artificial situation. Similarly the language (and grammar) of film was a scripted construct created by writers, and altered by directors and actors, in the creation of an “artificially produced situation” (APS).

Going back to the early silent films, it must be pointed out that these were not actually wordless. Intertitles of various types (written on placards or inserted in the film) were used, and were so unspectacle as to seem amusing to the modern reader. The following examples are from ‘Uncle Tom’s Cabin’ (1927):

- Phineas outwits the slave traders
- Eliza escapes across the river on floating ice
- Moonlight bathing the old Kentucky home in radiance – romance in the winged and perfumed breezes of the night.
- Rocky Pass. Reunion of Eliza and Geo. Harris
  (from Pellegrini, 2003)

They basically reinforce what the viewer can already see and are essentially redundant, though the names and places require some indication, and the third adds a pseudo-poetic ring. The last one is actually in note form, but all these titles are produced completely in the written mode. An interesting exception is the phoneticized utterance on the part of one of the black slave characters:

- Dunno whar dey is, ‘Missy Liza’.

This presages later developments, but for a long time the first examples above represented the norm.

Even with the advent of talking films, the level of artificiality did not drop and film language remained theatrically influenced. For example, in the case of ‘The Big Trail’ (1930), described as a silent film slowly being adapted to sound, although the actors were allowed to leave the stilted, theater-like acting to some extent, and although Marguerite Churchill slowly emerged from seeming the early silent screen heroine, John Wayne still came out with such hackneyed lines as:
No great trail was ever blazed without hardship ... and you gotta fight! That’s life ... and when you stop fightin, that’s death.

Even later, in ‘Robin Hood’ (1938) we hear an impeccably accented Errol Flynn chide Friar Tuck with a highly improbable “Not so close, my thunderous one!” Moving to contemporary times, Kevin Williamson, the creator of the successful American television series ‘Dawson’s Creek’, makes it clear that he does not strive for authentic dialog in his ‘fiction’. Indeed, his fifteen-year-old protagonists talk like thirty-somethings, and vice-versa.

But the first question to be tackled is who actually writes a film. The simple answer is that it is a team effort, making it difficult to identify a single author. The ‘authors’ include screenplay writers, producers, directors, cameramen, editors, actors and, in the translated versions, translator/adaptors, dubbing directors, dubbing actors, subtitlers, etc. A film script is an open text, written to be acted and synchronized with the visual. It is difficult to pin down a definitive version, as the script undergoes many transformations in passing through the various stages of production (deciding the subject, provisional script, dialog list, continuity script, transcription, translation, dubbing, subtitling, etc.). There is of course a mixture of spoken discourse and written language features which means there is hesitation and lack of hesitation, repetition and lack of repetition, overlapping conversations and sharply distinct dialog and in the former case, recourse to paralinguistic and extralinguistic elements. Table 1 shows how film dialog differs from purely written and purely spoken discourse in terms of the listed parameters referring to the various characteristics of language use.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LANGUAGE</th>
<th>WRITTEN</th>
<th>ORAL</th>
<th>FILM DIALOG</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Uniformity of turns, clauses, utterances</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tendency to monologism</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>+/-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extension of turns, clauses, utterances</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overlapping, fuzziness and other dialogical accidents</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning, coherence and cohesion</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paralinguistic elements</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morphosyntactic complexity</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>+/-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lexical density</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>+/-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presence of dialect</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+/-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tab. 1: Film Dialog Parameters (from Rossi, 2003)

To add further weight to the argument that ‘filmese’ is a real phenomenon, experiments carried out in Trieste (cf. Taylor, 2004, 2006) designed to compare the use of certain discourse markers typical of the spoken language (well, so, yes, right, OK, now) between film texts and spontaneous oral language taken from the Cobuild ‘Bank of English’ spoken corpus, showed considerable differences. Comparing corpora of approximately 1,000,000 words each the Figure 1 shows this clearly.

Similar experiments involving the use of tag questions and other features typical of spoken language use revealed less dramatic but still significant differences.
2 Genre

Genre analysis (Swales, 1990; Bhatia, 1993; Ventola & Mauranen, 1996) has resulted in some interesting insights into the classification of language use. At a macro level we can talk of literary language, the language of journalism, scientific discourse, etc. Such macrogenres generate sub-genres (novels, poetry, detective stories; tabloids, qualities, magazines; nuclear physics, medicine, biochemistry), which in turn lead to sub-sub-genres and on to ‘genrelets’ which are particular instantiations of a higher genre (e.g. a department meeting in the cardiology department of a hospital), described by Hatim as ‘social occasions enshrined in language’.

Of course the expression ‘film genre’ brings to mind such ‘text types’ as western, spy story, comedy, etc. but films too have their sub-genres and genrelets. And it is these genrelets that are of particular interest in the search for predictability. Emergency telephone calls, third form geography lessons or American football pep talks are examples of genres fairly advanced down the cline that leads from macrogenre to genrelet. In terms of predictability Fox imagines a genrelet which might be termed ‘people communicating on a station platform during a rail transport breakdown’. She explains that: “on these occasions (English) passengers suddenly seem to become aware of each other. Our actions are always the same and minutely predictable, almost as though they had been choreographed.” (Fox 2004: 142).

This manifests itself in the muttering of expressions such as “Huh, typical!”, “What is it this time?” or “Wrong kind of leaves, I suppose”, the latter with reference to a rather weak justification, much derided at the time, on the part of the railway authorities after a series of delays caused by falling leaves on the tracks.

3 Predictability

Any form of genre consists of a number of obligatory features, which distinguish that genre, plus any number of optional features (Halliday & Hasan 1989). Sub-genres such as the emergency phone call or an Indian food recipe (hyponyms of the macrogenres ‘phone-calls’ and ‘recipes’) display such obligatory features - “Emergency, which service please?” in the first case and lists of spices in the second. In genrelets such as different kinds of love scenes, phone calls, presentations, service encounters, etc. there is little room for creative language use. The intertextual nature of such speech events is illustrated by the same formulae being used over and over again, with the same cues and the same response mechanisms. In this
regard, Michael Hoey’s recent work (2004) on ‘priming’ offers interesting insights into language use. The main aspect of Hoey’s theory suggests that words and expressions are PRIMED to appear in particular environments. To give an extreme example, the expression “I love you too” might only really be expected in the environment of “I love you”. He also gives the example of the expression “In the winter months” which is primed to appear almost exclusively in a gardening context, particularly during the many television programs dedicated to this activity in Britain. Basically synonymous expressions such as “In winter” or “During the cold season” or even “When frost’s tentacles do wrap us…” are primed to appear elsewhere.

The language of film tends to accentuate such obligatoriness and transparency. Especially in stylized genres (traditional westerns, medieval dramas, quickly produced cop and sci-fi series, etc.) but even in more realistic genres, language use is that much more cued and crafted and thus more PREDICTABLE. Furthermore, in translation, all this becomes ever more apparent. From the early days of disastrous experiments in film translation such as the production of multiple versions of films with different teams of foreign actors, and the attempt to get American actors to play their parts in foreign languages, the strategies of dubbing and subtitling gradually became established. But the often stylized language of the original was frequently rendered all the more unspontaneous in its translated versions. Even today, taking as an example the very popular American series ‘Dawson’s Creek’, given the director’s stated intention of not aiming at authentic dialog, the dubbed version on Italian television follows suit … only more so. According to Zandegù (2005), who researched this series, the language can be given the label ‘zero orality’ referring to the reduction in variation at a stylistic, sociocultural and dialectal level.

The artificiality of the translated film version leads to higher levels of predictability, including the repeated use in Italian of terms that do not (or did not) appear in the ordinary spoken language, such as “Buon pomeriggio”, “Calmati figliolo” on the blueprint of “Take it easy son” or “Fottiti” as a way of bringing lip synchronization to the notorious English ‘four-letter word’. At times the predictability is so pronounced that an element of translation memory technique, technologically aided or otherwise, could prove useful. At least the predictability factor should be taken into account in order to save time and particularly to ensure consistency.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SCENE</th>
<th>BEGIN</th>
<th>END</th>
<th>DURATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Restaurant (ordering)</td>
<td>0.04.19</td>
<td>0.04.45</td>
<td>0.00.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public row (man - woman)</td>
<td>0.04.47</td>
<td>0.05.10</td>
<td>0.00.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restaurant (ordering)</td>
<td>0.06.00</td>
<td>0.06.15</td>
<td>0.00.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marriage proposal</td>
<td>0.06.25</td>
<td>0.08.40</td>
<td>0.02.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At the airport</td>
<td>0.09.04</td>
<td>0.09.55</td>
<td>0.00.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At the airport</td>
<td>0.10.00</td>
<td>0.11.05</td>
<td>0.01.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public row (husband - wife)</td>
<td>0.12.30</td>
<td>0.13.15</td>
<td>0.00.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Father and son</td>
<td>0.15.10</td>
<td>0.16.55</td>
<td>0.01.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mother and daughter</td>
<td>0.17.10</td>
<td>0.18.07</td>
<td>0.00.57</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tab. 2: scene types in American comedy movies (excerpt)
By way of investigating the extent of the predictability factor, various films were analyzed in terms of their genre structure in order to identify sub-genres and genrelets.

Table 2 shows the beginning of the long list of scenes comprising the film ‘Moonstruck’. As can already be seen, this type of American comedy movie consists of recognizable scene types which are repeated throughout the film. Films of a similar genre show similar characteristics.

The reverse procedure consists of choosing a scene type and checking how often these appear in similar or different genres. Table 3 shows occurrences of the scene type ‘on the phone’.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Languages</th>
<th>Ch.</th>
<th>Begin</th>
<th>End</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Almost famous</td>
<td>Eng/Ita</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.33.50</td>
<td>0.34.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Almost famous</td>
<td>Eng/Ita</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.34.50</td>
<td>0.36.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Almost famous</td>
<td>Eng/Ita</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0.39.30</td>
<td>0.40.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Almost famous</td>
<td>Eng/Ita</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>1.00.36</td>
<td>1.01.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Almost famous</td>
<td>Eng/Ita</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>1.04.10</td>
<td>1.05.31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Almost famous</td>
<td>Eng/Ita</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1.07.54</td>
<td>1.09.52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Almost famous</td>
<td>Eng/Ita</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>1.21.27</td>
<td>1.22.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Almost famous</td>
<td>Eng/Ita</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>1.39.04</td>
<td>1.40.37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Almost famous</td>
<td>Eng/Ita</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>1.46.35</td>
<td>1.47.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kramer vs. Kramer</td>
<td>Eng/Fra/Ger/Ita/Spa</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.05.15</td>
<td>0.05.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kramer vs. Kramer</td>
<td>Eng/Fra/Ger/Ita/Spa</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.07.52</td>
<td>0.08.17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tab. 3: Occurrences of the scene type ‘on the phone’

The phone conversations emerging from these investigations followed a pattern very similar to those resulting from the spoken language corpus, even though such material was fairly limited. For example in ‘Kramer versus Kramer, 1979: Benton’ we find the following exchanges with the typical utterances underlined:

(1)
Yeah, hi, Ted Kramer
Listen … OK?
Yeah, OK, you too, thanks a lot.

(2)
Hi Margaret, this is Ted. Is my wife there?
Yeah, yeah …
If she comes, tell her to come over or just give me a ring …yeah
If she comes, tell her to give me a ring
Thanks a lot

(3)
Yeah? Oh, wait a minute.
It’s for you, pick up 461
Who is it?
Ah, hi Billy. What’s up?
No …
Look I can’t tell you now, I’m busy.
We’ll talk about it later when I get home, right?

(4)
Hello,
Mr. Kramer’
Yes.
*Hold on please, Mr. Shaunessy.*
Ted?
Yeah, hi John. How are you? What’s happening?
Oh look, I’ve gotta tell you something.
Hello
Yeah, I’m still here

Predictably, the translation procedures adopted for these phone conversations produce typical exchanges in Italian. For example, in the cases of (1) and (3) above, the translations were as follows:

(1)
Yeah, hi, Ted Kramer
Listen … OK?
Yeah, OK, you too, thanks a lot.

*Sì, pronto, Ted Kramer*
*Senti … OK?*
*Ah, OK, anche tu, grazie tante.*

(3)
Yeah? Oh, wait a minute.
It’s for you, pick up 461
Who is it?
Ah, hi Billy. What’s up?
No …
Look I can’t tell you now, I’m busy.
We’ll talk about it later when I get home, right?

*Sì, un attimo*
*E’ per te, prendi la 461*
*Chi è?*
*Sì, ah, ciao Billy, che c’è?*
*No …*
*Senti, ora non posso parlare, ho da fare.*
*Ne parliamo stasera*

Other genres/sub-genres present in the films studied, and that were analyzed in their original and translated versions, included presentations; girl-boy rows (cf. When Harry met Sally, 1989: Reiner); marriage proposals; scenes at the airport, railway station, hairdressers, etc.; father and son, mother and daughter relationships; sackings, ‘chat up’ routines, and trailer monologues of the ‘Only one man can save the world’ type. Again it was possible to trace predictability patterns in both languages, even in those genres where the language
transfer involves some kind of semantic or pragmatic shift (e.g., bar protocols in English and Italian). Clearly the scope for original language use is constantly present but some basic blueprints can be recognized, especially in the more mainstream productions.

3.1 Less predictable genres

In contrast to the examples posited above, some genres, particularly where cultural mores are involved, prove much less easy to pin down. A case in point when discussing English-Italian film-making and translation is that concerning food. A comparison of attitudes to, and consequently frequency of mention of, and language connected to food was summed up in Mikes’s 1949 assertion that “On the Continent people have good food. In England they have good table manners” (Mikes 1949).

While English habits regarding food have changed considerably in the past fifty years, Fox still finds in her popular anthropology volume of 2004, that “the English disdain for matters concerning food is a reflection of the innate reluctance on the part of English people to take themselves (or anything else) seriously” (Fox 2004: 295).

On the new, but relatively restricted, phenomenon of ‘foodieness’, she reflects ironically that “One minute it’s sun-dried tomatoes with everything, the next minute these are passé, and it’s raspberry vinegar, or garlic mash, or ‘delicate layers of potato rosti wth goat-cheese filo parcels and horseradish sabayon’.” (Fox 2004: 300).

Even more so than the previously impoverished culinary vocabulary of the English, such concepts are difficult to translate into cultures that don’t regard these ingredients as in any way exotic. To take a typical scenario as an example, at Italian dinner parties the following comments, or variations thereupon, are very common.

Buonissimo!
Ma come riesci a fare questi fagiolini?
Da noi si usa solo aglio e olio.
Sono la fine del mondo!!

These expressions (not the words) are difficult to translate for the simple reason that English people don’t say them. The following exchange from ‘Intolerable Cruelty’ is another, albeit humorous, case in point:

Miles: Just bring him an iceberg lettuce and mealy tomato wedge smothered in French dressing
Waitress: And for you?
Miles: Ham sandwich on stale rye bread, lots of mayo, easy on the ham.

- Miles: A lui portiamo una lattuga con pochissimi pomodori, sale e olio di semi.
- Waitress: È per Lei?
- Miles: Un velo di prosciutto su pane ben raffermo soffocato dalla maionese.

In these cases, the Italian translation is often semantically inaccurate and at times an invention, for the same reason that foods are not described this way in Italian.

A tension therefore exists, when translating from English to Italian, between the temptation to translate literally and maintain the foreign flavor, and to tone everything down in a localization exercise. Thus, the pitfalls for the translator lie between the extremes of total disdain and novelty obsession, as neither position is taken up in Italian contexts. This is not a question of culture-bound terms – polenta, mushy peas – but of cultural mind sets.
A popular Italian television series ‘Il Commissario Montalbano’, based on the best-selling books by Andrea Camilleri, demonstrates the importance given to food in Italy. In the following scene, Montalbano’s colleague disturbs him while he is eating:

Mimi: Ma che stavi mangiando.
CM: No, no. Non ti preoccupare.
Mimi: E allora t’ho disturbato…
CM: E ti dico non ti preoccupare…

Although he claims otherwise, the Commissario is clearly annoyed. In this next instance he does not try to hide his annoyance and gives vent to a vulgar expression.

CM: Sto mangiando la pasta con broccoli, chi è che rompe…

It is difficult to imagine American cops with their doughnuts and polystyrene cups of coffee being so sensitive. The ‘pasta con broccoli’ figures in many episodes of this series, almost forming a leitmotif, while other typically Sicilian dishes are also frequently featured:

M- Calogero carissimo, senti io mi prendo un piatto di spaghetti col sugo di ricci, mi raccomando, come piace a me eh?
C- Ci penso io dottò.
C- Dunque oggi c’ho pe’ vossa un risotto a nevuro di siccia ch’è megghio’ e na cassata.
M- Per me va bene, per lei?
B- Anche per me va bene.
M- Aggiudicato.
C- Ah, per secondo carissimo dottore Montalbano ci sono delle spigole freschissime pescate stanotte oppure…

The frequency with which Italians drink coffee is also reflected in the far from usual frequency with which the term appears in the series.

No attempt has yet been made to dub ‘Il Commissario Montalbano’ but it has been exported to English-speaking countries in a subtitled version. But any translator is faced, when dealing with a text of this type, with a fundamental decision, whether to foreignize, localize or standardize. Here the predictability quotient is at its lowest – serious choices have to be made and adhered to. If foreignization is opted for, then the following decisions might be made.

- *Caffè* remains caffé – its meaning is known but is not always clear (what kind of coffee?)
- *Pasta con broccoli* is a leitmotif of the series and can be left as it is.
- The disturbance and seriousness factors are part of that mind set that some of the audience will associate with Sicily and others will not be aware of.
- *Spaghetti con sugo di ricci, risotto a nevuro di siccia, na cassata, spigole freschissime pescate stanotte*, can be left and simply understood as Italian dishes.

On the other hand, if the translator feels it necessary to localize his version for the target audience, he may opt for the following solutions:
• *Caffè* must be rendered more English, ironically through the use of explicit markers – cappuccino, espresso, latte, etc. – depending on which of these is considered the most universal.

• Elements of disturbance and seriousness may be changed or tempered.

• *Pasta con broccoli* may be changed to something more recognisably Italian such as ‘spaghetti bolognese’ or ‘lasagne’. It depends on whether it can be seen.

• *Spaghetti con sugo di ricci, risotto a nevuro di siccia, na cassata, spigole freschissime pescate stanotte*, can be changed to recognizable English/American dishes – ‘spaghetti with meatballs’, ‘sausages’, ‘ice cream’, ‘snapper’.

Finally, the no risk solution lies in standardization:

• *Caffè* = coffee

• Disturbance and seriousness elements translated literally, regardless of audience perplexity.

• *Pasta con broccoli* = pasta with broccoli

• *Spaghetti con sugo di ricci, risotto a nevuro di siccia, na cassata, spigole freschissime pescate stanotte* become simply ‘spaghetti’, ‘rice’, ‘cake’, ‘fish’.

4 Concluding remarks

Having examined a range of film texts of different genres and scenes representing different sub-genres and genrelets, the search for predictability has shown itself to be genre based. Certain scenarios and culturally neutral stock situations can be seen to display elements of textual predictability, whereas at the other extreme of culturally sensitive or original scenarios, predictability is no longer a statistically significant factor. There are no absolute values except in extreme cases such as the ‘emergency telephone call’, but rather the predictability phenomena can be seen as operating on a cline running from the easily predictable to the totally unpredictable. Along the first section of the cline it is suggested that the predictability factor can be an aid to film translators, even to the extent of bringing in translation memory technology, or at least the adoption of strategies allied to the concept of translation memory.

Briefly, where the text is highly predictable, there is a place in film translation (in the broadest sense), in subtitling but also in dubbing, for the judicious use of some kind of translation memory tool (e.g. Atril’s Dejà vu) which pick up frequently used expressions and suggest them to the translator as he or she works. Although this would require very careful editing it could save a lot of time and provide much needed consistency. Where texts are not very predictable, translation choices may lie between foreignization, localization and standardization. The choice will depend on such factors as the ‘prestige’ of the film or given audience tastes. Where texts are governed by cultural mores, predictability can be largely discounted, firstly in the patterns of the source language, and particularly in translation. Here the translator is on his/her own in gauging to what extent the audience is attuned to the mind set of the source text culture. However, the final consideration must be that practically all films (or TV series, or documentaries, or advertisements, or cartoons etc.) will contain stretches covered by the three basic conclusions outlined above. The special skill of the translator lies also in identifying these stretches and treating them accordingly.
References


Universal Design for digital television in Spain

Contents
1 Universal design as a strategy to achieve accessibility in digital TV
2 Accessibility to digital television contents
3 Accessibility to digital TV equipments
4 Trends and measures to facilitate digital TV accessibility in Spain
5 Conclusions
6 References

Abstract

Universal Design is an approach to the design of products, services and environments to be usable by as many people as possible regardless of age, ability or circumstance. This principle has to be followed in the development of the audiovisual sector and in the process of migration of television from analog to digital. Although the new digital television systems offer a wide range of opportunities for disabled people, they also represent new barriers that were not present in analog environments. In this article we analyze the current situation of accessibility services in digital television in Spain, the accessibility to digital TV equipments, and finally the development prospects set by the regulation.

1 Universal design as a strategy to achieve accessibility in digital TV

Digital TV migration started in Spain in 1997 with the digitalization of satellite platforms. It rapidly spread to the rest of audiovisual content distribution networks: Digital Terrestrial Television, Digital Cable and IPTV through ADSL. The new broadcasting technology optimizes signal transmission processes and entails a deep change in the industry’s technical structures and new user attitudes: contents tend to be available everywhere, any time and in different screens and devices. Although the new digital television systems offer a wide range of opportunities for disabled people, they also represent new barriers that were not present in analog environments.

Spanish Law 51/2003 on Equal Opportunities and Non Discrimination defines Universal Accessibility as the requirement to be met by all environments and systems, so that they are available to everybody. Asis Roig and his research group on Universal Accessibility1 (2006: 12) explain how this definition signals a new way of understanding disability with the focus on the adaptation of environments, so that they are practicable for all. Disability is considered as a complex series of circumstances that encumber social participation of disabled people. The nature of such obstacles is often social, given that they originate in the design of an environment (architectural, technological, cultural or social) exclusively conceived for a standard human being. Therefore, solutions are to be sought in an adequate construction of society.

1 Research group of the Institute Bartolomé de las Casas of the Universidad Carlos III de Madrid.
“Universal Accessibility is understood as the result of overcoming the medical / rehabilitation paradigm by incorporating the elements of the social model. (…) From the point of view of the social model, policies should aim at standardising society so that it meets the needs of all and enables full participation of disabled people in all sectors of community life”. (Asis 2006: 12)

In order to achieve this goal, we can apply the principles of “Universal Design” or “Design for All” as defined by Ron Mace in The Centre for Universal Design, North Carolina State University. Universal Design is an approach to the design of products, services and environments to be usable by as many people as possible, regardless of age, ability or circumstance. This principle should inspire all actions and initiatives of the audiovisual sector.

That is why we need to analyze how to make the new digital television accessible for all, as well as to identify the implications for audiovisual industry, consumer electronics’ manufacturers and broadcasters. Let us focus first on the accessibility to audiovisual contents and on the level of development achieved so far in Spain and then move on to cover accessibility to digital TV equipments, and finally to the development prospects set by the regulation.

2 Accessibility to digital television contents

2.1 Accessibility services

As defined by GT5 FTTVD\(^2\), the working group on digital television accessibility set up by the Spanish Government, digital television accessibility services are all techniques and procedures aimed at facilitating access for all to Digital TV. Subtitling, audio description and Sign Language interpretation are considered accessibility services to audiovisual contents. Accessibility services to facilitate navigation through graphic user interface of Digital television receivers are considered accessibility services to digital TV environment: usability of interactive services, text-to-speech converters, voice recognition systems and personalization applications. (FTTVD 2005: 71; CERMI 2006: 52)

Subtitling for the deaf and hard of hearing is an accessibility service that displays on screen a written text reproducing oral communication. The discursive elements which appear on the screen (letters, words, posters, etc.), and the sound track (songs, voice over, effects, etc.), allow people with a hearing impairment to understand the information provided audiovisually (Diaz Cintas 2003: 32). Pereira, specifies that subtitles should reproduce “not only what is said, but also how it is said (emphasis, tone of voice, accents, foreign languages, different noises, etc.) and who says it”. (Pereira 2005: 162)

Analog TV has traditionally been using subtitling through teletext, a technology that is still valid in the digital context. In the new digital TV platforms and DVDs we can also use DVB subtitling\(^3\) which offers greater graphic resolution and better performance (Utray 2005: 335).

\(^2\) Working Group 5 of the Technical Forum of Digital Television: Accessibility to Digital Television for People with disabilities.

\(^3\) DVB (Digital Video Broadcasting) is the European Standard used by Digital Television. DVB subtitles are defined in the DVB ETSI 300 743 v1.2.1 standard.
Audio description is the mode chosen to access audiovisual media for those who have sight problems (Orero 2005: 7). We find a definition of that service in the official Spanish Standard AENOR\textsuperscript{4} (2005: 4):

“Audio description is an assistive service consisting of a set of techniques and abilities, whose main objective is to make up for the lack of perception of the visual component in any audiovisual message, by providing suitable sound information which translates or explains it in such a way that the visually impaired can perceive the message as a harmonious work, as similarly as possible as the sighted”\textsuperscript{5}

It allows blind people or people with visual impairment to access television programs, audiovisual productions and other telecommunication means containing images, by providing a spoken account of the key visual elements. The description of elements like actions, costumes, gestures and changes of scene, among others, makes it possible for the blind or the visually impaired to fully follow the story. The narration describing these visual elements is carried out by specialized describers and is then mixed with the sound track in the spots between dialogs.

In Spain, analog television is broadcast with audio description through the second audio channel of the Nicam Dual system. This technique is based on the use of stereo channels to broadcast two different mono signals. The sound track in mono can be heard through the main channel, and the mix of the sound track and the audio description, through the optional channel. Digital environment does not need to resort to this technique, given that it can associate several audio signals to a video program without the restrictions of the Nicam Dual system.

Concerning Sign Language services, the Spanish Bill of the Audiovisual Law (\textit{Ley General del Audiovisual}) defines them as the interpretation of the message into Spanish Sign Language, permanently shown on screen (MITYC 2006: 52). This can be done by incorporating a window with the interpreter into the image.

Interactivity is a natural element of digital television and should, therefore, also be accessible. We consider as interactive services all menus and information on screen, whether they are resident applications of the receiver\textsuperscript{6} or services associated to television contents. These applications can be used to complement and enrich audiovisual contents as independent information services or as set-up and personalization options of the equipment.

In order to enable access of the visually impaired to these interactive screens, sound tracks must be added to the menus through a system that provides the user with an automatic verbal interpretation of the graphic elements (texts, icons, etc.). Voice synthesis systems that are already integrated to different computing terminals could also be integrated to DTV receivers, provided that they have sufficient capacity and that the applications enabling the use of this technology are available.

The integration of voice recognition applications in Digital TV receivers is necessary for users with physical disabilities or reduced movement capacity that are unable to operate the remote control. What is at stake here is to make it possible to use human voice as an interface with a machine capable of interpreting spoken information and of acting accordingly.

Finally we should be aware that applications and main menus must be friendly and easy to use and have the personalization options to adapt to the features of each user. Recent experience on the definition of accessibility in computing applications and in the Internet can be used as the basis for developing a code of good practices for usability on TV interactivity.

\textsuperscript{4} AENOR is the Spanish body for standardization
\textsuperscript{5} Translation by the author of this article.
\textsuperscript{6} Resident applications are navigation and set-up menus that receiver manufacturers provide with the equipment.
The recommendations of the consortium W3C on Web Accessibility (WAI-Web Accessibility Initiative) and AENOR Spanish standard for accessibility to computing application can be useful references for that matter. (AENOR 2003b)

2.2 The current situation of television accessibility in Spain

Subtitling for the deaf and hard of hearing in Spain is provided to a greater or lesser extent by all the main TV channels in the country. Today, around 30% of television broadcasting is made with subtitles through teletext, even though there is no regulation that commits broadcasters to provide this service.\(^7\)

In 1990, Televisión de Cataluña was the first to broadcast subtitled programs\(^8\) and ever since has been the pioneer and leader in number of subtitled hours. In 2003, it broadcast 4,721 hours of subtitled material through its channels, and more than 6,000 hours by 2005. RTVE launched its subtitling service for the deaf in 1991, with 25 hours that year, and progressively increased that number to more than 6,800 hours in 2005 through the following channels: TVE 1: 2,380; La 2: 3,052; TVEi: 1,443. (RPD 2005: 105; Utray et al. forthcoming).

It is only natural that state-owned television has taken the lead in this kind of services but, surprisingly, some of them in the Autonomous Regions, like TV de Galicia or TV Autonómica Canaria, did not start to broadcast subtitles until 2004 and others have not even started yet.

As far as commercial television is concerned, Telecinco started to broadcast subtitles in 1998 and has since become one of the most active channels. It currently broadcasts an average 2,400 hours per year of subtitled material. Antena 3 launched this service in 2000 and has already beaten its competitor with almost 3,000 hours in 2005. Antena 3 NEOX, one of its DTT channels, broadcast 70% of subtitled material in the first semester of 2006.

Pay TV channels as Cartoon Network, Disney Channel and Factoría de Ficción have been very active in the broadcasting of subtitles for the deaf. Cartoon Network started to subtitle cartoons in April 2000, and at present 35% of its programs is subtitled. Disney Channel started to subtitle in November 2003 and has publicly committed itself to subtitle more than 30 movies a month. The thematic channel Factoría de Ficción is considering subtitling its premières.\(^9\)

So far, the broadcasting industry has not really started to regularly produce and broadcast material with audio description, nor has it committed itself to do so. There are technical reasons that explain why the provision of this service is restrained. In the first place, the Nicam Dual system is not authorized throughout the whole of the Spanish territory. In addition, this resource is used to broadcast contents in original version and is therefore not available for audio description. Since 1995, Canal Sur, the state-owned channel of the Andalusia region, has regularly used a radio channel for audio description, but this method is not recommended due to the problems caused by the synchronization of television and radio transmission networks. Despite this, RTVE broadcast 224 hours of audio described contents with the Dual system in 2004, including the popular program Cine de Barrio.

Much the same can be said of Sign Language interpretation. Since the beginning of television broadcasting, we have seen very little of it, because the image of the interpreter takes a lot of room on screen and is not attractive for the rest of the audience. We find some

---

\(^{7}\) Estimates of Begoña Gómez Nieto in the Review Fiapas n° 100, Sept. 2004 P. 10. RPD indicate 20%.

\(^{8}\) "Spanish Centre for Subtitling. Preliminary study for its setting-up and viability report" (RPD 2005: 105)

\(^{9}\) Agreement passed in September 2004 between audiovisual organizations and broadcasters and the Ministry for Employment and Social Affairs.
instances in several channels of the Autonomous Regions or in RTVE with broadcasting the yearly debates on the State of the Nation with Sign Language interpretation as well as some other programs like *En Otras Palabras*.

As for interactive services, their development in Spain is quite embryonic and nothing has been done yet about accessibility. Processing and graphic cards capacity in the receivers makes it difficult to develop and incorporate new services. As Schmidt explains in his Guide to Creating Talking Menus (2003) the situation in the U.S. is similar: “...it is currently next to impossible for American cable or satellite services to offer audio-navigation services. The computers inside American STBs are simply too primitive to support this additional capability”. The Spanish satellite operator Digital + currently broadcasts an interactive service with information on the Spanish Organisation for the Blind (ONCE) and its lottery but, unfortunately, even this service is not accessible.

The main analog channels do provide information on accessible programs through teletext. Almost all channels have an information service addressed to the users of subtitles for the deaf, with help screens that explain how to run the service and get informed about updated broadcasting timetables that help organize the use of TV.

### 3 Accessibility to digital TV equipments

Manufacturers should consider accessibility as a user requirement that cannot be ignored and that can even mean a significant increase of their customer base. Equipment accessibility should also be promoted by regulators and by standardization organisations. In the UK, the Consumer Expert Group already informed the government in 2004 on the need to tackle Digital TV accessibility, and recommended to use a Universal Design strategy to make all equipments accessible (CEG 2004). Its 2006 report “Digital TV Equipment: Vulnerable Consumer Requirements” (CEG 2006) highlights that the mainstream market has not solved this problem and that action is required in order to ensure the access of people with disabilities to Digital TV systems: all equipments should provide a basic access service; all accessibility issues associated with menus, electronic program guides, remote controls and equipment connectivity should be resolved; a complete range of access services should be available through affordable equipment.

The installed base of digital TV receivers in Spain is formed by Digital Terrestrial Television (DTT) set top boxes that have been massively commercialized since 2005, and those from satellite and cable pay TV platforms. In the second case, we are dealing with vertical platforms, in which receivers are loaned to subscribers, but are owned by the digital platform. Users’ choice of the different models is restricted to the operator’s offer. With DTT open platform, users have to purchase receivers in the free market: manufacturers sell the equipment independently of distribution networks, TV channels and content providers. This has caused the emergence in the market of an array of receivers with different features, functionality and price (Perez-Ugena et al 2005: 203).

Receivers can be classified in two main categories: baseline receivers and interactive receivers. Baseline receivers are the lower cost equipment and have the simplest functionality. They must comply with the minimum requirements established by the standard

---

10 The Consumer Expert Group was appointed by the broadcasting Minister, Lord McIntosh, to advise Government on consumer issues relating to digital switchover

11 Digital TV vertical platforms manufacture the receivers and control the whole production, broadcasting and reception chain, as is the case, in Spain, of Digital+. Horizontal platforms, like Spain’s DTT open platform, operate with receivers from the free market and, in that case, content providers have to verify the interoperability of broadcasting.
for its commercialization. Interactive receivers offer the possibility to access to the interactive services delivered by broadcasters and must incorporate an operating system (OS) with a software API\textsuperscript{12} whose mission is to facilitate the development and execution of those applications. From the perspective of Universal Design, the aim should be to ensure that the specifications of baseline receivers include compliance with accessibility requirements. Nevertheless, we must keep in mind that certain accessibility services for disabled people will require specific equipment with more features and peripherals.

Pay TV platforms receivers used to have their own proprietary APIs and operative systems, but DTT horizontal platforms had to agree on an open API, so that both manufacturers and content providers can work on the same system without having to pay royalties. Europe, and particularly Spain, have established the MHP (Multimedia Home Platform) system, which is the open API specified by the DVB consortium. Interoperability of interactive receivers can only be achieved if they all use the same system. This way, broadcasters would be able to provide accessibility services that could be run in all interactive equipment. Unfortunately the majority of receivers commercialized in Spain are baseline receivers and do not integrate the MHP system because of the increased cost of the receivers.

In the United Kingdom they use a different API for DTT, called MHEG 5, which has less performances that MHP. With regard to accessibility applications for people with disability, they have chosen to manufacture a specific accessible receiver developed by NETGEM, with the requirements agreed upon with the RNIB\textsuperscript{13}, the BBC and other players in the British market. This receiver uses local mix audio description (Yong 2004: 13) and gives access to a spoken Electronic Programme Guide (EPG) through the telephone return channel. This kind of solution is not considered Universal Design because it requires specific equipment and is therefore not recommended in a start up stage.

### 3.1 Usability of Digital TV receivers

Manufacturers and content providers should increasingly enhance easy to use equipments and services. With ever more channels and services, digital television users must learn how to use the remote control in combination with screen menus when choosing channels or navigating through the information and the different options. Naturally, architectures that take into account the needs of people with physical, sensorial or learning disabilities also make it easier for the remaining consumers to use the devices. But although some requirements can have a negative impact on costs, the latter can be decreased if they are taken into consideration from the very beginning and applied to all products, and not only to few specialized high performance equipments. (Stallard 2003: 28).

Remote control is the key tool to access television and other electronic equipments in the homes. The design of the remote has to take into account basic rules for size, shape, labelling and clarity. This is particularly relevant for people with dexterity difficulties. People with visual disability appreciate that the keys of the remote control are different in shape and have tactile indicators to make their use easier, but they also agree that the core difficulty is to combine the remote control with the screen menus\textsuperscript{14}.

Another problem for usability is the growing number of remote controls in the homes and their complexity. A home equipped with a television, a video recorder or DVD, a sound

\textsuperscript{12} API (Applications Programming Interface). Programming application required to develop and run interactive services.

\textsuperscript{13} RNIB Royal National Institute of the Blind is the organization that represents people with visual disabilities in the United Kingdom.

\textsuperscript{14} Interview with Mercedes Hernández and Fernando García from the General Managing Direction of the ONCE (unrecorded).
system and a digital platform is faced with the challenge of having to use four remote control devices to have access to the different audiovisual contents, and often to combine two of them. This makes operation very difficult, not only for people with some kind of disability or for the elderly, but also for users in general. If we want to progress in this field, we need to promote agreements between manufacturers on universal remote controls. They should be easy to use with accessibility criteria and have the option to be programmed to operate with different equipments.

3.2 Speech technologies: synthesis and recognition

As noted above, assisted navigation with a voice synthesizer is a fundamental requirement for people with visual disabilities. Incorporating a voice synthesizer into the receivers to give sound to texts written in the interactive menus can be a viable solution for the next generation receivers, as shown in the models of the Profit Project “Digital TV for ALL.” In MHP environments, software synthesizers could be integrated in the receiver through download. To that end, applications should be carefully developed bearing in mind that sound will be added. For example, in a navigation menu or an EPG, there are many simultaneous data on screen and we have to decide how to translate them into sound and in what order they will be uttered to the user. Voice navigation entails a very different attitude in the user compared to graphic interfaces and can involve a different functional behavior.

The National Centre for Accessible Media, NCAM\textsuperscript{16}, has published a good practices code for the design of talking menus for digital receivers\textsuperscript{17} with a guide for developers and producers of this kind of service (Schmidt et al. 2003).

For people with physical disabilities who have difficulties to operate the remote control, we have to implement voice recognition applications in order to achieve an independent TV consumption. Voice recognition has already been successfully integrated in some mobile telephones and in electronic agendas (PDA). Specific remote controls with this kind of capacity could be a solution that does not involve any major alteration of the receiver.

High quality speech technologies require great amounts of computing and memory resources. Therefore, in the short term, a balance must be found between implementation costs and the quality of the expected functionalities and between what will be considered “sufficient” accessibility services and what will not.

3.3 Personalization of applications: user profiles

Many of the requirements highlighted by user associations entail a personalized set-up of the receiver. For example, people with hearing disabilities would appreciate that once subtitles have been selected, the receiver would keep this selection when changing channel or even in the following sessions. To that end, a slot of persistent storage has to be dedicated to the definition of user profiles, as in the case of parent control services or of personalized lists of channels. Therefore, it is likely and recommendable that the personalization of accessibility profiles is available in all receivers within its capacities and functions.

\textsuperscript{15} “Digital TV for ALL” is a PROFIT research project for the analysis of digital TV accessibility, supported by the Spanish Ministry of Industry, Tourism and Trade, through the National Program for Service Technologies of the Information Society – Strategic Action for e-inclusion with the participation of Formato Multimedia, SL., TVC Netmedia Audiovisual SL, ASIMELEC, and the Institute of Public Law of the University Rey Juan Carlos

\textsuperscript{16} The National Centre for Accessible Media is a research center for media accessibility http://ncam.wgbh.org/

\textsuperscript{17} A Developer’s Guide to Creating Talking Menus for Set-top Boxes and DVDs http://ncam.wgbh.org/resources/talkingmenus/
3.4 Recording equipment

VHS video and DVD recorders are present in most Spanish homes. The problem of these formats is that when recording, teletext information will not be recorded and subtitles will thus not be available. The old *Super VHS* video recorder, which belongs to the semi-professional range, could record the teletext, but was very expensive and is currently out of catalog. Specific equipment that record teletext subtitles, like the Telemole\(^{18}\), are still available (Stallard 2003: 38).

Recording equipment to be implemented in the future should have the capacity of recording associated data, and specially, accessibility services. This functionality is not only aimed at people with some kind of disability. It can be interesting for everybody, given that it can also record other interactive services and value added contents.

Personal Video Recorders (PVRs), which record on hard disk, are being introduced in the market with very good prospects. Television programs can be recorded in an intelligent way, by analyzing an EPG and comparing it with the user's profiles. PVRs are expected to revolutionize the way of watching TV. The DVB working group is currently specifying PVR’s technical aspects. Therefore, the accessibility requirements should be defined as soon as possible so that all digital video recorders and PVRs can record and reproduce accessibility services in compliance with Universal Design principles.

4 Trends and measures to facilitate digital TV accessibility in Spain

The regulation of the audiovisual industry in Spain has recently been incorporating legal texts with explicit measures on accessibility. The “Reform Plan for the Audiovisual Sector”\(^{19}\), includes an agenda for the implementation of accessibility services and for the establishment of a State Council for the Audiovisual Sector, which will ensure the enforcement of broadcasters’ obligations. Pursuant to the draft bill of the General Audiovisual Law (MICyT 2005), by 2015, a 100% of the State owned TV programs will be subtitled, and a 10% will provide audio description and Sign Language. It also establishes the percentages for Commercial TV broadcasting (Utray 2006: 251). But these initiatives are still under parliamentary debate.

Achieving accessible audiovisual communication means involves the whole production, distribution and exhibition chain of audiovisual products. In order to warranty homogeneity and interoperability, every accessibility service should have a code of good practices agreed upon by all stakeholders. AENOR, the Spanish body of standardization has already developed a standard for subtitling through teletext (AENOR 2003a) and another for audio description (AENOR 2005). As envisaged within the working group FTTVD (2005: 74) and as confirmed in a CERMI’s\(^{20}\) publication (2006: 48), similar standards are needed for every

\(^{18}\) [http://www.connevans.com/information/telemoleFAQ.pdf](http://www.connevans.com/information/telemoleFAQ.pdf)

\(^{19}\) The Government in its Council of Ministers of 06.24.2005 approved the “Reform Plan of the Audiovisual Sector” whose objectives are to boost a sustainable, profitable and independent audiovisual sector to ensure cultural, social and political pluralism and achieve a prompt, orderly and feasible transition from analog technology to digital terrestrial technology. This plan includes three bills – the “Public Service Law for State Owned Radio and Television”, the “General Audiovisual Law” and the “Law for the Establishment of a State Council of the Audiovisual Media”- as well as two Royal Decrees modifying the “National Technical Plan for Digital Television” and the “National Technical Plan for Private Television”

\(^{20}\) CERMI (Comité Español de Representante de Personas con Discapacidad) is the representative committee of the main associations of people with disabilities in Spain.
identified accessibility service. Therefore, there is a need to develop preliminary studies to define the specifications of the new services and to update existent standards.

Another government initiative to promote audiovisual accessibility in Spain is the creation of the Spanish Centre of Subtitling and Audio description (CESyA: Centro Español de Subtitulado y Audiodescripción). In November 2005, a Framework Agreement for the creation of the CESyA was signed by the Royal Board on Disability, the CERMI and the University Carlos III of Madrid. This public institution is mandated, among other things, to promote subtitling and audio description for disabled people and, in general, to encourage all mechanisms that favor accessibility in the Spanish audiovisual arena. It helps all audiovisual accessibility stakeholders converge and serves as a link for dialog. The associations that represent people with disabilities, the content production/distribution industry, the exhibitors/broadcasters, the consumer electronic industry and the regulator of the audiovisual sector can find in the CESyA a reference for the effective implementation of accessibility in audiovisual media.

One of the main objectives of the CESyA is to create and manage a database service with reviews of subtitled and audio described audiovisual works, which will be permanently updated and available to all stakeholders through the Internet. The aim of this activity is to gather and reference all subtitled and audio described productions in order to encourage the exchange of materials and to boost the subtitling market, audio description and other accessibility services (Ruiz et al. 2006).

Another priority field is to make the audiovisual industry aware of the concept of Universal Accessibility and thus achieve awareness in the population as a whole. The CESyA will also be the pioneer observatory of international research and standardization in subtitling and audio description. Training is also part of the objectives of the Centre and a follow up of national and international initiatives will be carried out, as well as collaboration in the definition of training programs in order to achieve standardization in the training of audiovisual accessibility professionals.

The creation of this center is a necessary step in order to make progress in the implementation of accessible audiovisual media in Spain and to achieve equal opportunities and rights for people with visual or hearing disabilities.

5 Conclusions

Digital television is a completely new technology that is being massively implemented in the homes in Europe and, in compliance with the applicable legislation, it should be considered and designed, from the very start, to be usable by all citizens. Unfortunately, this principle is not being met and we are once more failing to apply Universal Design from the beginning. This situation is particularly serious given the high capacity of interventionism of European governments in an industry that is as tightly regulated as DTT. If user associations and the regulation bodies of the sector do not rapidly react, we will again be forced to react to an environment that has been inadequately designed and that discriminates a category of users as the disabled people in breach of the mandates of democracy.

In Spain, some progress has been made in recent years in the public and the private sectors: the main commercial and state owned television channels already have departments in charge of subtitling services for the deaf, and legislators have started to consider accessibility to their legal texts. But there is still much work to be done to achieve the level of development reached by such countries like the USA, the UK or Canada, where there is a greater tradition in audiovisual accessibility services.

The incorporation of interactivity to broadcasting carried out by digital television must be carefully studied because it constitutes a barrier that was not present in the analog
environment. It is a great challenge for both broadcasters and receivers’ manufacturers. Applying the principles of Universal Design in this field and building an easy to use interactivity is imperative, not only for people with sensorial disabilities, but also for a much larger group of citizens that have difficulties when using these new services.

The creation in Spain of an institution like the CESyA, a center for the exchange of subtitled and audio described material, which was already a claim in the EU (Stallard 2003: 38), should place our country in the forefront of the promotion of audiovisual accessibility. Social awareness in this field can contribute to the construction of a more egalitarian and democratic society that is aware of the diversity of its citizens.

6 References

Asis Roig, Rafael et al. (2006): “Guía básica sobre las principales pautas a seguir en la preparación y ejecución de prácticas, normativas y decisiones dirigidas a la satisfacción del principio de Accesibilidad Universal”. Madrid: Universidad Carlos III de Madrid.


Using Multimedia Materials in the Teaching of Scientific and Technical Translation

Abstract

Information technology has changed the professional environment of scientific and technical translators, who must understand the meaning of texts relying on non-textual information, new formats and channels of information, before translating them appropriately. To meet these new challenges, translation teachers must place special emphasis on the importance of pictorial, graphic and acoustic information in texts, and must adopt a more dynamic approach towards audiovisual translation (AVT).

In this paper, we argue for the inclusion of multimedia texts as objects of study in AVT. In particular, we present the results of a research project aimed at designing teaching materials for audiovisual, scientific and technical translation. The materials developed increase students awareness of the potential benefits of audiovisual resources for all users, including those with disabilities (accessibility), in the acquisition of field knowledge and terminology. Students also learn to take into account the constraints imposed on translation by visual and acoustic material in ever-changing formats. In line with other traditional forms of AVT, multimedia translation requires creativity, a deep understanding of intercultural aspects, and the selection of relevant information.

1 New perspectives in audiovisual translation: new formats and channels of information

In the same way as information technology has changed the competences of scientific and technical translators, it has also widened our perception of Audiovisual Translation (AVT), which is no longer limited to subtitling, dubbing and voice-over. Nowadays, AVT includes

---

1 This research is part of the project PUERTO TERM: knowledge representation and the generation of terminological resources within the domain of Coastal Engineering, BFF2003-04720, funded by the Spanish Ministry of Education.
new formats and new channels of information, since, as Neves and Remael (forthcoming) state, “AVT is mingling with multimedia translation and localization, channelling our access to information and entertainment that are today, more than ever linked”.

Consequently, we argue for the inclusion of multimedia material in the translation classroom as a valuable means for students to become familiar with emerging forms of translation which highlight the knowledge of the subject field and its conventions, combined with some knowledge of audiovisual formats. The impact of the multimedia scenario has led to the appearance of the field of audiovisual localization as a theme for forthcoming conferences (i.e. Languages and the Media 2006).

This study has been carried out within a R&D project financed by the Spanish Ministry of Education aimed at the generation of terminological resources within the domain of Coastal Engineering. The methodology and results of this project are also useful for the design of teaching materials in the context of Scientific, Technical Translation (Localization), and Audiovisual Translation at university level (Tercedor and Abadía 2005; López et al forthcoming). Our students are 3rd and 4th year students working from English to Spanish and from Spanish to English in the BA in Translation and Interpreting of the University of Granada2.

Our pedagogical approach is social constructivism and collaborative learning (Kiraly 2000, González Davies 2004). As opposed to the traditional translation classroom where knowledge would pass from the teacher to the students, in the collaborative classroom, the teacher acts as facilitator in the learning process, and the classroom is not separated from the real world. The translation brief is carried out under real-world conditions: there is a client and an expert in the subject field, and students work in groups and rotate their roles.

The first aim of this paper is to argue for the inclusion of multimedia contents as objects of study in AVT. We propose that AVT should be extended to entail more than just film translation for subtitling or dubbing. Our second aim is to design multimedia teaching materials that will enable students to:

• Assess potential internationalization and localization problems of a multimedia text in multiple subject fields
• Become acquainted with the tools available to manipulate multimedia objects and their use
• Increase their awareness of, and sensitivity to, complex translational problems in multimedia scenarios
• Strengthen their skills to work in teams and cooperate with others
• Become aware of accessibility as a new requirement for web and multimedia contents

These multimedia materials can be used in two different ways in the scientific and technical translation classroom: (a) as objects of translation (in localization, dubbing or subtitling) or (b) as instructional resources when translating a scientific written text.

---

2 These teaching materials have been proposed in an innovation action called Localization of multimedia texts: creation of teaching resources in the scientific and technical classroom.
2 Theoretical and methodological framework: dynamic images and text, knowledge representation and creative translations

The interaction of image and words in audiovisual material facilitates the comprehension and learning process, knowledge representation and the translation process, as shown in the following section.

2.1 The role and functions of multimedia objects in knowledge representation

An important issue regarding knowledge representation is the need to include information in other formats different from the most common verbal codification, in order to enhance textual comprehension. Despite its significant role in the transfer of information, the use of multimedia materials, especially pictorial elements, is still relatively infrequent, and occurs mostly in areas such as knowledge and science popularization or in educational contexts. Some language technologists argue that multimedia increases costs due to the complexity in producing pictorial interfaces. However, images are a means of information representation and transfer which promote the reader's understanding of how a scientific system works (Mayer and Gallini 1990). The contiguity principle (Mayer and Anderson 1992) proposes the extended use of graphic information, especially of dynamic resources (different formats of video and animation) and illustrations that promote interpretation processes in educational multimedia environments since the effectiveness of multimedia instruction increases when words and pictures are presented contiguously (rather than isolated from one another) in time or space.

Pictorial elements help to retain information in the working memory, to store it in the long-term memory and to recall conceptual relations for further categorization and problem-solving processes (Parrish 1999). This is particularly relevant when both systems, verbal and pictorial, are presented as an interrelated whole. The principle of contiguity derives from the dual-coding theory (Paivio 1971, 1990), according to which information clusters are stored in the long-term memory both in the form of verbal propositions and of mental images. Paivio assumes the existence of two different information-processing systems which involve a dual codification of knowledge: verbal and visual. Such a dual system is linked by means of the visual superiority effect to a visual memory module which contributes to a higher retention rate in comparison to lexical memory. As a result, categorization and the sub-processes involved (retention, storing, recall and eventually understanding) are easier when information appears in a doubly encoded interface containing linguistic and graphic representations.

Most research on dynamic images have used educational movies and have concluded that animations, involving movement and audio have very positive effects in the learning process, mainly when they are aimed at the representation of essential characteristics of a concept or its complex procedural nature (Anglin et al 2004; Faber et al 2005).

Levin (1981) and Mayer and Gallini (1990) identified five prose learning functions in text-embedded images (Tab. 1). They can also be applied to multimedia resources containing dynamic elements and audio.

The decoration function is associated to images which are not relevant to the text but make it more attractive. Image 1 represents the concept WAVE but it does not add anything new to what it is verbally conveyed, except for an adornment. On the contrary, representational images are normally intended to convey the significant elements in the text. In this regard, Image 2 shows the most important concepts in the ANATOMY OF A WAVE and their interrelations, highlighting their verbal description. The organizational role contributes to create internal coherence and to build up an integrated structure.
Image 3 represents the concept HYDROLOGIC CYCLE and describes the different stages which make up the whole process creating a coherent unit jointly with the verbal explanation of the water cycle and its progression. Interpretative images enhance the clarification of passages and concepts difficult to understand. Image 4 shows the concept DEEP WATER WAVE SPEED by means of the representation of its mathematical traits in the form of symbols and the water depth in the form of iconic elements. The combined use of iconic and non-iconic pictorial elements reflects its conceptual complexity. The transformational function present in Image 5 is linked to special pictorial elements acting as a mnemonic technique. The representation of the different types of BREAKERS (surging, plunging, collapsing and spilling) is an aid to recall the information which depicts each type and the differences between them.

2.2 A process-oriented Frame Semantics’ approach to knowledge representation

Considering that the coastal engineering domain is clearly dynamic, knowledge representation entails becoming aware of the actions and the participants described in specialized texts. Faber et al (2005), in line with Barsalou (2003), claim that any representation of specialized knowledge must be dynamic and process-oriented with goal-derived categories that provide mappings from roles in action sequences to instantiations in the environment. These conceptual mappings will only occur in the minds of our students, if we conveniently exploit
audiovisual material in the classroom. More specifically, we have to ask our students to manipulate the material (Asher 1982)\(^3\), to connect images to words, and to relate conceptual categories to their previous knowledge or some sort of general event, following a Frame Semantics perspective (Fillmore 1985).

The *frame* notion can be a means for grasping the meaning of the text and establishing links between concepts and specialized terms because a *frame* (Fillmore 1976) is a system of concepts interrelated in such a way that one concept evokes the entire system. Semantic networks are divided into domains, the domains into frames, and the frames into interrelated concepts. Therefore, we provide students with a conceptual frame representing the main processes involved in coastal engineering: the Coastal Engineering Event (Faber *et al.* 2005).

### 2.3 Visualization and creativity

Images and multimedia objects facilitate not only the learning process, but also the translation process. According to Kussmaul (2005) visualizations may lead to creative translations, in other words, translations that show changes when compared with the source text, thereby bringing in something that is novel.

The new formats of scientific translation (that include more than ever audiovisual material in line with the notion of *infotainment*) have widened the scope both of scientific and audiovisual translation. Translators are now faced with new constraints (and possibilities) as well as with translation problems that demand increasingly creative solutions. And we believe that creativity is aroused in a collaborative classroom (Kiraly 2000) with authentic materials that combine images and texts.

Therefore, we ask students to describe and compare in the target language the visual material provided in order to facilitate the *visualization* process, the activation of words belonging to the *frame*, and the linking of verbal and visual information in long-term memory. They record this verbal description in the target language using Windows Movie Maker or the record mode of an MP3 player. In this way, they will have a register of their first impressions, and of what they consider to be the prototypical elements of the scene. These informal *Thinking Aloud Protocols* will allow students and researchers to better understand the mental processes involved in the comprehension of audiovisual material and in translation.

### 3 Working with accessible multimedia contents in the translation classroom

The shift from static materials to multimedia contents is becoming commonplace in all fields of knowledge and text genres. Translating multimedia materials can be quite a challenge since length and duration restrictions apply to tasks such as script translation for captions/subtitling and dubbing purposes. However, there is a new context of work for translators in multimedia scenarios: working with accessibility in mind. Some translation scholars (Orero 2005; Neves 2004 *inter alia*) have defended the inclusion of accessibility in translation studies as a response to the ‘Design for all’ program of the UE. In such a context, e-accessibility is defined as “the integration of all users into the Information Society, i.e. older people, people with disabilities and also people placed in impaired environments”.

Furthermore, multimedia is understood as the combination of text, graphics, video, animation, and sound. Therefore a given piece of multimedia content should be presented in

---

3 Asher (1982: 64) claims that optimal learning takes place when students construct a new reality through the direct manipulation of people, places and things.
such a way that it complies with the access needs of each media type represented. Since a multi-modal presentation of information can be easier to grasp, multimedia can be useful for many groups of users.

Consequently, we believe that accessibility can be fostered in different tasks in the translation classroom at various levels. We argue for the enhancement of accessibility in the translation classroom, both to give response to a social need and to bring students closer to a commonplace professional environment.

3.1 Accessibility and the W3 Consortium

Internet is an inexhaustible source not only of didactic and entertainment texts, but also of freeware and shareware programs to manipulate these texts. In the context of translating for the Web, according to the W3 Consortium, web accessibility means that people with disabilities can perceive, understand, navigate, and interact with the Web, and that they can contribute to the Web.

Nevertheless, accessibility is not only about providing information to people with disabilities. The new multimedia formats suggest that information is suited to a variety of users, as regards level of expertise. In such a context, translating with accessibility in mind implies providing alternative formats, and knowing how to respond to the various information needs as regards to the level of literacy/expertise. Therefore, web accessibility also benefits other users, including those with low literacy.

One of the aspects dealt with in web translation is the provision of text equivalents for images. Discrete text equivalents –when rendered by players or assistive technologies to the screen, as speech, or on a dynamic Braille display– allow users to make use of the multimedia object, even if they cannot make use of all of its content. For instance, providing a text equivalent of an image that is part of a link will enable someone with blindness to decide whether to follow the link or not, as stated in a W3C recommendation (see Section 3.2.).

Following the Guideline 1.1 of the WCAG 2.0, we base our work on the basic rule of providing text alternatives for all non-textual content, providing text for multimedia material, and for audio-only and video-only material.

3.2 Film Translation: a pedagogical tool for learning the recommendations of the W3 Consortium

In the context of audiovisual scenarios, and according to the W3 Consortium, accessibility problems include the lack of captions, transcripts or audio descriptions in digital videos. Two special equivalents that promote accessibility are captions and auditory descriptions. A caption is a text transcript of spoken words and non-spoken sound effects that provides the same information as a presentation’s audio stream and is synchronized with the video track of the presentation. Captions benefit people who are deaf, hard of hearing, or who have auditory learning disabilities. They also benefit anyone in a setting where audio tracks would cause disturbance, where ambient noise in the audio track or listening environment prevents them from hearing the audio track, or when they have difficulties in understanding spoken language.

Just as developers are working to enhance the accessibility of multimedia for all users, translators are faced with the new challenge of adapting or providing captions, transcripts and audio descriptions within the multimedia formats they work with.

The recommendations of the W3 Consortium include enhancing accessibility for text, audio and images, since multimedia can combine all of these elements. We propose a progressive introduction of accessibility features in the translation classroom, from text equivalents for images, to definitions of specialized terms for the non expert, or the provision
of captions in videos. With this in mind, we try to exploit our material in such a way that students are able to carry out other translation-related tasks such as summarizing translations to fit in voice-over tasks, building up multilingual multimedia glossaries from a video or doing subtitles for accessibility purposes.

4 Materials and activities to integrate AVT in the teaching of scientific and technical translation

Multimedia materials can be used in two different ways in the teaching of scientific and technical translation. They can appear as objects of translation (in localization, dubbing or subtitling) or as instructional resources when translating a scientific written text.

Illustrations, especially those which fulfil at least one the functions explained in section 2.1., are particularly useful for instructional purposes and contribute to the sub-processes involved in the learning process, which is facilitated by the inclusion of these types of illustrations as multimedia materials in educational contexts.

In this section, we will use different multimedia texts available at a mouse-click, and will show how they can be manipulated and exploited in the scientific and technical classroom. The following set of activities contains different multimedia elements which are supported on the contiguity principle and highlight the five functions described by Levin (1981). The activities include a series of multimedia elements which focus on terminology, and are aimed at the translation of html, subtitling, audiodescription and voiceover.

a. Pre-translation activities:
   • Transcripting an audio script for knowledge acquisition
   • Making a list of key terms from transcript with the aid of a Corpus tool such as WordSmith Tools
   • Distinguishing between focalized and topicalized information
   • Identifying the functions of images in relation to text (Paivio 1971; 1990);
   • Summarizing the information for different purposes
   • Gap-fill and multiple-choice activities to deepen terminological/phraseological knowledge in the subject field (Half-baked software 1997-2006, http://hotpot.uvic.ca)

b. Translating multimedia
   Translating html documents: a gate to multimedia
   • Translating the complexity of web including text, images, forms, sounds and such
   • Knowing how to assess different text types in the same page
   • Becoming acquainted with the multiple formats in a web document
   • Becoming aware of the importance of hypertext writing for different users in a way that all text hyperlinks are written so that they make sense when read out of context
   • Providing text alternatives for images in an accessible multimedia environment
c. Subtitling and audiodescription
  - Making specialized films accessible by assessing the audience
  - Assessing the needs of the hard of hearing in the AVT classroom. Subtitles for the hard of hearing
  - Assessing the needs of different age groups. Introducing subtitles for children in documentaries

d. Voiceover
  - Adapting transcripts to fit the shortened/extended audio duration of the target language
  - Translation of scripts/transcripts for voiceover purposes
  - Recording voiceover

In the following sections, we will develop some of these activities in more detail and will present a summary chart where activities are ordered according to difficulty.

4.1 Pre-translation activities and self-evaluation

The main objective is to introduce students to the terminology of the subject fields being translated, HYDROLOGY AND COASTAL ENGINEERING, and to the methodology proposed in this type of multimedia translation through simple activities which involve pictorial and audio elements. The self-evaluation feature helps students check the score achieved on their own, so that they can assess the knowledge acquired in the pre-translation stage. Every activity has been designed using HotPotatoes v6 (Half-baked software 1997-2006, http://hotpot.uvic.ca) and they complement each other in providing background knowledge prior to the translation stage.

4.1.1 Visualization activity to increase environmental concern

**ACTIVITY: WATER CAMPAIGN I**

The following video has been chosen by the Andalusian regional government to illustrate a campaign to save water in domestic use. View the video campana_h2o.mpeg and answer the following questions:

![Multiple choice](Fig. 1: “Multiple choice” Water Campaign Activity I)
4.1.2 Activity to get familiar with TYPES OF WAVES

ACTIVITY: TYPES OF WAVES I
In this activity, students hear a scientific narration, and must fill in the missing words in a written version with gaps (Fig. 3). Such words are actually terms belonging to the subject field (WAVE TYPOLOGY). This exercise can be presented in the form of a dictation or as a different passage to be completed according to the information offered in the audio.

![Figure 2: “Gap-fill” activity 1](image)

Next, we propose a multiple-choice exercise. Students are intended to answer the questions by choosing one of the three possible answers according to what is said in the audio, which lasts 2 minutes. They have three minutes in total to complete the exercise.

![Figure 3: “Multiple-choice” activity 2](image)

The last pre-translation task to get familiar with WAVE TYPOLOGY consists of a matching exercise in which, according to the audio, students must choose one of the items proposed to complete a syntactically and semantically correct sentence. This exercise is also timed since one of the objectives in the pre-translation stage is to help students acquire some knowledge on the field but under stress conditions in order to simulate a real translation process in which translators must normally learn the basics of a scientific subject to understand what they are supposed to translate.
4.2 Translating html documents: a gate to multimedia

4th year students enrolled in an optional e-learning course in Localization and Audiovisual Translation were faced with an assignment consisting in translating several web pages for a corporate site. No particular indications with regard to specific tools or formats were given. Of the 82 students enrolled, 52 translated the pages using beginners’ tools that protect the code (Catscradle), only one used a CAT tool (Tag Editor) and 6 used an editor such as Textpad or Notepad.

When asked about the reasons that led them to make that choice, most of them agreed that the tools were chosen on the basis of usability, pointing at things like “you don’t have to worry about tags”.

This data is of course neither conclusive nor exhaustive but gives us an idea of the areas of improvement that have to be the focus of AVT teaching. Translating html documents in the translation classroom is a task that requires from students a shift from the procedures of other formats:

- Understanding the complexity of web contents defined as the information in a Web page or Web application, including text, images, forms, sounds, and the like (W3 Consortium)
- Knowing how to assess different text types in the same page
- Becoming acquainted with the multiple formats in a web document;
- Becoming aware of the importance of hypertext writing for different users in a way that all text hyperlinks are written so that they make sense when read out of context

4.3 Audio transcription and script translation

Once students have finished the pre-translation stage and thus acquired the basics of WAVE TYPOLOGY they must transcribe the audio in the html files (contained in Flash animations) in the form of a script from which they should produce the Spanish translation.

The script should be adequate to the textual conventions commonly used in the Spanish written language and to the accessibility requirements proposed by the W3C, according to which a web page or multimedia resource must include a textual description for every audio or pictorial element (W3C 2000), so that it facilitates the access of prospective users with impaired vision or hearing. Despite the activities proposed, the possibilities of using multimedia materials in the audiovisual translation classroom are endless. For example, the translated script could be narrated again by using recording software such as Windows Movie Maker in order to produce a voice-over product.
ACTIVITY: TYPES OF WAVES II

Fig. 5: Audio transcription interface

4.4 Audio transcription and subtitling: interaction of images and text

ACTIVITY: WATER CAMPAIGN II

In this activity, students will transcribe the audio material of the video presented in 4.1.1. (WATER CAMPAIGN). They can assess their transcription with the following self-evaluation activity:

Fig. 6: Water Campaign Activity II

Then, they will subtitle the video in English using Subtitle Workshop. To that end, they have to take into account the interaction between images and text, and the time and space constraints imposed on their target text.
**SOURCE TEXT**

El agua está en todo lo que quieres  
Cuidando el agua cuidas lo que más quieres  
Y ganamos agua para un año  
Junta de Andalucía  
Consejería de Medio Ambiente

**TARGET TEXT (with Subtitle Workshop)**

00:00:00:00 00:00:00:00 00:00:00:00 00:00:00:00 00:00:00:00 00:00:00:00

[Water dripping]

Caring for water, you are caring for what you love
And we will be saving water for a whole year

**Tab. 2: Subtitling with Subtitle Workshop**

Then, they will subtitle the video in English using Subtitle Workshop. To that end, they have to take into account the interaction between images and text, and the time and space constraints imposed on their target text by Spain’s standard conventions with regard to closed captions.

**Fig. 7: Screenshot of subtitling task in Subtitle Workshop**

---

4 Subtitle Workshop is freeware and students can make use of colors—a common feature in subtitling for the hard of hearing. Modifying dialogs in a way that they are shortened is a very useful task to develop translation strategies for other types of AVT such as videogames localization or dubbing.
4.5 Summary of tasks carried out in the scientific and technical classroom

Finally, we propose a chart with the progressive tasks our students are enrolled with, the technical tools needed and the competence they develop.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CARRIED OUT WITH STUDENTS IN:</th>
<th>TASKS</th>
<th>TECHNICAL TOOLS</th>
<th>COMPETENCES DEVELOPED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All years</td>
<td>Transcribing the video</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scientific translation (3rd and 4th years)</td>
<td>Extracting keywords from the transcript</td>
<td>Corpus</td>
<td>Learning to identify key information.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical translation (3rd and 4th years)</td>
<td></td>
<td>WordSmith Tools</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scientific translation (3rd and 4th years)</td>
<td>Compiling a bilingual glossary at different levels of expertise</td>
<td>Multiterm</td>
<td>Focusing on the pragmatics of terminology management.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical translation (3rd and 4th years)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scientific translation (3rd and 4th years)</td>
<td>Provide audio description describing essential visual elements for video content</td>
<td></td>
<td>Describing strategies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical translation (3rd and 4th years)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AVT (4th year)</td>
<td>Interlinguistic Subtitling/captioning</td>
<td>Fab Subtitler, winCaps, Subtitler Workshop</td>
<td>Following technical and format constraints</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AVT (4th year)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Following accessibility guidelines: Synchronized transcripts of dialog and important sound effects. Captions provide access to multimedia for people who are deaf or hard of hearing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AVT (4th year)</td>
<td>Dubbing/voice-over</td>
<td>Windows movie maker</td>
<td>Adapting script to fit extended audio in the target language.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AVT (4th year)</td>
<td>Combination of captions/audiodescription</td>
<td></td>
<td>Consider the importance of the timing of media contents when planning access features. For example, a &quot;talking head&quot; video may need only a stand-alone transcript of the audio, but a documentary including graphics and other important visuals may require captions in order to maintain the link between visuals and narration.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tab. 3: Summary of translation tasks

5 Conclusions

In this paper we have shown that it is possible to exploit multimedia documents in the scientific and technical translation classroom, since recent changes and advances in Information Technology have enhanced the role of multimedia in AVT. Our proposal of activities considers multimedia contents from two points of view:
1. as pedagogical resources that will enable students to become familiar with the subject field, and to build a sound foundation for knowledge representation
2. as objects of translation meeting the requirements of accessibility. The translation of audiovisual documents activates the link between images and text, enables visualization, and triggers creativity.

Therefore, when introducing audiovisual material in the scientific and technical classroom, we provide our students with valuable tools to meet the new challenges of the translation market, increasingly influenced by new audiovisual scenarios.

6 References

Internet sources


Juan Francisco López Vera (Barcelona)

Translating Audio description Scripts: The Way Forward? - Tentative First Stage Project Results

Contents
1 What is Audio Description?
2 Audio description: Origins and legal framework
3 Cost of the implementation of AD
4 Audio description and time
5 The new audio describer
6 Hypothesis and practical test
7 Results
8 Conclusion
9 References

Abstract
The article presents the results of a test aiming at translating/adapting audio description scripts as a faster and more financially viable way. It will also discuss and analyze the possibility of rendering the audiovisual production process less complex.

1 What is Audio Description?

Audio description transforms visual information to words, translates the visual into spoken language, completing in this way the sounds and dialogs of films. AD has a dual function. On the one hand, it fills in that part of the audiovisual sign system of film that the blind have no access to: visual images. On the other hand, it complements the ‘whole’ with the explanation of sounds that are understandable only through their relationship with these images. Like subtitling for the hard of hearing (HoH), AD includes inter-semiotic transfer processes that go beyond linguistic or cultural definitions of traditional translation concepts. The effectiveness of audio description depends on the way in which all these different signs are connected to and among each other.

Audio description is the descriptive technique of inserting audio explanations and descriptions of the settings, characters, and actions taking place in a variety of audiovisual media, when information about these visual elements is not offered in the regular audio presentation. Or, in other words, audio description is "the art to speak in images" as Navarrete, a describer who for many years has worked for ONCE, the Spanish National Organization of the Blind described AD in 1997 (Navarrete 1997). Although the Spanish National Organization of the Blind registered the name “sistema Audesc” (Audesc System) to designate audio description, and subsequently promoted this technique with the aforementioned remark, we can find the most up to date and complete definition of audio

---

1 I would like to express my gratitude to Gonzalo Abril, Anna Matamala, Paula Mariani, Lourdes Melcion, Pilar Orero and Ana Pereira for performing the tests used in this work.
2 Organización Nacional de Ciegos de España.
description in the official Spanish National Standard UNE, published by AENOR (2005: 4), as the norm “Audio Description for People with Visual Impairment: Requirements, for AD and Development of Audioguides”:

“Audio description is an assistive service consisting of a set of techniques and abilities, whose main objective is to compensate for the lack of perception of the visual component in any audiovisual message, by providing suitable sound information which translates or explains, in such a way that the visually impaired perceive the message as a harmonious work and is as similar as possible to the way is perceived by the sighted people.”

Audio description preferably blends in when there are gaps in the dialog. Ideally, audio descriptions should not interfere with important narrative pieces of information, mood-setting music and sound-effects, although at times AD will have to be given priority over the musical score. AD should only overlap with dialog or song lyrics if these are not relevant to the plot though. Never should AD interfere with major dialog exchanges, but minor conversational features that support dialog may have to be sacrificed.

The golden rule is “what you see is what you say”. Dealing with inter-semiotic processes, of course audio descriptions visualize people, objects and events, however it is also crucial to try to convey the mood and the emotional impact of a scene. At all events though, the audience should be able to form their own opinions and draw their own conclusions. Therefore, it is very important not to edit or to interpret or to explain what is being described, but always describe only the most significant and essential features of the story line or the action. A good audio description will use vocabulary and syntactic constructions according both to the target audience and to the peculiarities of the described media material, and will try to convey, at least part if not all of the visual signs of the films. The language used for the descriptions must be precise and, at the same time, significative rather than abstract. Audio description should suggest rather than explain.

As to the question of “what is to be described”, the describer must give an answer to the five classic wh-questions in narrative creation:

- WHERE: locations and settings, including dimensions and scene or location changes.
- WHEN: time of day, light/dark, if relevant.
- WHO: Characters (depending on film/scene: dress, physical attributes, age, facial expressions, body language and ethnic background if relevant).
- WHAT: on-screen action sounds or effects that cannot easily be identified, subtitles or other text on screen, opening titles and/or end credits.
- HOW: action development.

AD history is short. It started around the 1970s in American theatres. In most European countries, AD has also been present for some decades as a practice within disability associations, such as the English Royal National Institute for the Blind (RNIB) or the Spanish Organization of the Blind (ONCE). As an assistive service, audio description should be understood as an integrative factor in our whole society and therefore its implementation should be universal in character. That is the reason why legislation in this area plays a crucial role.

3 “Servicio de apoyo a la comunicación que consiste en el conjunto de técnicas y habilidades aplicadas, con objeto de compensar la carencia de captación de la parte visual contenida en cualquier tipo de mensaje, suministrando una adecuada información sonora que la traduce o explica, de manera que el posible receptor discapacitado visual perciba dicho mensaje como un todo armónico y de la forma más parecida a como lo percibe una persona que ve.”
In the past decades we have seen a structural transformation of the European population: The aged population in Europe is growing fast and is predicted to grow steadily each year. Media and broadcasting have tried to adapt to these changes and audio description (AD) is a good example of this trend. AD is not only attractive for those who are visually impaired, be it by birth, aging or as a result of a loss of their visual capacity during the course of their lives, but also to those who are unable to see a film due to a temporary problem situation. This means that we do not face a homogeneous public: some of the target viewers will have visual memory, some will not, some will be able to distinguish shadows, others will not. It is, therefore, impossible to create an AD adapted to all the different needs of this heterogeneous audience.

2 Audio description: Origins and legal framework

Audio description is a reality in the U.S. which is the country with a largest production of media programs for TV and cinema, etc. Audio description originates in the US, Canada and UK. In all of these countries AD began with live and open special play performances, moving to recorded AD for films to be sent internally to members of associations. This trend became soon public and professional: AD entered digital television (DTV) and commercial DVDs.

With the Telecommunication Act of 1996, the US Congress instructed the Federal Communications Commission (FCC) to require video program distributors (cable operators, broadcasters, satellite distributors and other multi-channel video programming distributors) to phase in closed captioning into their television programs. In 1997, the Federal Communications Commission implemented rules to provide a transition schedule for video program distributors to follow when providing more captioned programming. The rules require that distributors provide an increasing amount of captioned programs according to a set schedule. Captioning has promoted the development of audio description.

Audio description – which in some countries is not commercially available yet – will become a legal requirement for European media broadcasting once the European “Media for All” directives are enforced in all European countries. Media accessibility – closed captioning and audio description – is yet to become a reality, but with the future shift from analog to digital TV, it will obviously be a new market trend. A new industry will thus be created to cater for the new accessibility needs.

When or how these European directives will be implemented is not defined yet. It may be by sanctioning laws – as those in the U.S or UK – or by incentive or reward, like granting tax deduction schemes to broadcasters, or it may come in the form of a prerequisite for a digital license. It may be introduced progressively as DTV technology becomes increasingly available, which will play a major role in society and will open up services to all citizens. Access to the many services offered by DTV will have to be accessible to all citizens at many levels. AD can experience greater flexibility and higher quality in the new technology. For many years universal media accessibility has already become a major topic in many European directives and actions, such as the “Television without Frontiers” directive.

This directive was adopted on October 3rd, 1989 by the Council and amended in June 1997 by the European Parliament and the Council Directive 97/36/EC. It is the European legal version of the US Telecommunication Act of 1996. Since that date, i.e. for almost a decade, much work has been done in this respect and CENELEC is now the institution in charge of Media Accessibility in Europe.

4 Communications Act 2003
5 http://www.cenelec.org/Cenelec/CENELEC+in+action/Horizontal+areas/ICT/e-Accessibility+and+TV+for+All.htm
After the Athens Conference in 2003, the European Union drew up some general guidelines for those countries which had not yet developed a national plan of accessibility.

In Spain, the First Accessibility Plan “Design for all” 2004-2012, was adopted on June 3rd, 2003, the European Year of People with Disabilities, and the interest of lawmakers and the profession of audio describers was so excited about it, there was already a fixed norm on how to audio-describe. The aforementioned Standard UNE 153020 of 2005, published by the Spanish Association for Standardization and Certification AENOR, was passed on 26th January 2005. A working group of Representatives of the National Association for the Blind (ONCE), broadcasters, representatives of companies and universities was created and coordinated by the Spanish Ministry of Labor.

The main beneficiaries of the law are companies and professionals making audiovisual material accessible for those with sight impairments, but it also serves as a reference for the creation of AD scripts. In November 2005, the Framework Agreement for the creation of the Spanish Center for Subtitling and Audio description (CESyA) was signed by the Real Patronato sobre Discapacidad, the CERMI (the Spanish Confederation of representatives of the disabled) and the University, Carlos III of Madrid. One of the aims of this public-institution is to promote SDHH subtitles and AD for disabled people and, in general, to encourage all mechanisms that favor accessibility in the Spanish audiovisual scene (Orero and Utray: 2005).

To provide a broader picture to the reader it may be interesting to mention that TV broadcasting of closed commercial audio description (that is to say, only for those who want to listen) began on the Andalusian TV channel, Canal Sur, on February 22nd, 1995. It was broadcast until the end of 1996 and some 76 films were aired. This was the first experience with AD in Spain, but up to now, audio described programs on Spanish TV have been rather irregularly presented.

In the UK and the US, the number of audio described hours required by the regulator is considerably below that required for subtitling. And, the forthcoming regulation in Spain will not change this trend. According to the White Paper of the Spanish Ley General del Audiovisual (Audiovisual General Law), the state owned channels will have to audio describe just 10% of the programs in 2015, whereas 100% of the aired programs must be subtitled in the same year.

Whatever the system used in any European country, once DTV has become a common service (in Spain DTV is officially operating since November 30, 2005), media accessibility will be a reality, and two important issues will influence its development: cost and time. It must be mentioned though that the industry will not be able to comply with all these laws and norms because there are not enough experts and professionals available to implement them. This raises a new question: who will be doing the audio descriptions?

3 Cost of the implementation of AD

The economic and operative implications of media accessibility do not follow traditional economic parameters. Cost in media production has already reached its limits: the use and abuse of advertisements as a way to pay for private broadcasting is taxing on the viewer. In

---

6 i.e. the Real Council of Disabilities, an autonomous organization of the General State Administration dependent on the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs which among other functions promotes the prevention of deficiencies, and promotes rehabilitation and social inclusion as well as equal opportunities.

7 CERMI (Spanish Confederation of representatives of the disabled) is the representative umbrella organization for all the Spanish Associations of People with disabilities.
Spain\(^8\), less and less people are watching films on TV because of the many ads shown along with a film: a 90-minute film may last as long as three hours. Public broadcasting – although it is paid by subscription in some countries like the UK – is also facing a financial crisis with its reduction in programs and in human resources, which has lead to a decrease in production\(^9\). DTV will bring a larger diversification of TV stations and services and will definitely affect and even more diversify the financial world of media production.

With this outlook the question arises of how media are going to be made accessible in the light of extra production costs for both audio-description and closed captioning? Issues related to this question were discussed at an international conference organized at the Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona\(^10\) in June 2005.

Another important issue is the question who will be responsible for, or how the extra funding necessary to make media accessible can be raised. As it is, the audiovisual market is working with a very tight budget and there increasing concerns about the additional work that this will cause to people who are already working above normal working hours. Moreover, the limited number of potential users does not seem to make accessibility profitable in economic terms. In traditional financial terms the possible revenue that may be gained by the number of people using the new services is not significant. Therefore, no gain (in audience or commercials) is to be expected to justify the expenditure required to make all media programs fully accessible.

In the case of audio description, the estimated average cost per hour is, according to different sources, around € 800, plus the cost of the transmission bandwidth for an audio channel. An audio-described production for the Spanish state-owned TV channel RTVE is about 1,750 euros - a considerable sum of money, especially considering the objective of only having 10% of the programs audio described.

The audiovisual industry must therefore face both the marginal costs and the technical and operative complexity involved in accessibility. Otherwise governments will have to think of possible ways of incentives or rewards, e.g. tax reductions or exemption for companies who fulfill the required number of hours of accessible broadcasting, or awarding digital licences on the condition of accessible programs.

### 4 Audio description and time

While the situation in other European countries may be different, in Spain time in media production and broadcast is a luxury good enjoyed by only few and selected groups. Programs are bought, produced (translated, subtitled, dubbed, etc.) and broadcast in a very short period of time. Also, how can the actual media production process be slowed down to accommodate a new step in the production process, i.e. accessibility?

Confronted with these two questions, the thought arose to make audio descriptions in countries whose first language is not English and have a high degree of imports of English-speaking media programs such as films. The fact that Spain is a “dubbing country” should not be ignored, however, because it has a direct implication on both the type of media accessibility and the professionals who will make the media accessible.

---

\(^8\) As Eduardo García Matilla, president of the Corporación Multimedia, stated in the plenary session of the International Conference 1º Jornada sobre TV de servicio, which took place in Barcelona June 2\(^{nd}\) 2005 and was organized by the Generalitat de Catalunya and the Corporació Catalana de Ràdio i Televisió.

\(^9\) The BBC personnel strike in June 2005 is a direct consequence.

\(^10\) Media for All International Conference http://www.fti.uab.es/transmedia which took place in Barcelona 6, 7 & 8\(^{th}\) June 2005.
5 The new audio describer

Who can become an audio describer? In most European countries (such as Belgium, France, Germany, and Spain) and because Audio Description is usually done internally and at a social level, people who do AD are generally volunteers. Some describers have received training, but some perform AD services because they have relatives with impairments or because they have some interest in amateur theater.

The skills needed for a person to audio describe are stated by The Audio Description Association in conjunction with The Open College Network West and North Yorkshire (provided in their promotional leaflet, May 2000) in the UK:

- The ability to summarize information accurately and objectively
- A good command of the language
- A clear and pleasant speaking voice
- Good sight and hearing (whether aided or unaided)
- The ability to work as part of a team
- The commitment to access for disabled people, and the provision of quality audio description for blind and partially sighted people.

However, these skills are listed in the UK, a country with little import of media products in other languages than English. In other countries where there is a large import of audiovisual programs, as in Spain, much of the accessible work will have to be done by a translator or a person with foreign language transfer skills. It is interesting to note that a possible profile for describers is a person who translates and describes. When considering the multiple and complex combinations of possible describer profiles in Spain, we should have in mind four variables, derived from the basic concept of the describer as the person who creates the AD script:

- The describer can also be the subtitler
- The describer can also be the translator
- The describer can also be the adjuster
- The describer can also be a SDH subtitler, that is, an intralinguistic subtitler.

These possibilities could also be combined with what traditionally has been an integral part of a describer’s profile (at least in the US and the UK), the narration of the script.

A describer has to work with two main media market characteristics: time and budget restrictions. Projects normally need to be accomplished under time pressure and adjusted to a fixed budget. This can easily be achieved if the same person –translator or subtitler- would also create the audio description. Furthermore, the fact that he/she is already acquainted with the plot, characters, register, cultural references, etc will facilitate the work of the description. If it was possible to find one person with the different professional skills above, the final benefit will go to the client, since he/she will not only receive the final product faster but at the same time a product with a higher quality and consistency between the different versions.

6 Hypothesis and practical test

The following is a report of an ongoing research. The hypothesis of this work is based on Veronika Hyk’s (2005) and Bernd Benecke’s (2004a) question “Can audio description be translated into other languages?”

In the process of subtitling and dubbing today, the translator gets the preliminary script, sometimes the continuity to work from there when rendering the different versions.
It seems feasible that in the future the translator could also work from the script for audio-description. With the sale of the film, the distributor would sell the AD script, too.

In this paper, we present the results of an experiment which tested the hypothesis of translating or adapting audio description scripts as a faster and more financially viable way to create audio described films. Adapting the audio description from a script instead of creating an AD script from scratch from the already dubbed version seems a viable alternative.

Two professional subtitlers, two dubbing translators, a university professor and a dubbing director and adjuster formed a team. It is important to note that although all of them are professionally related with the audiovisual field, none of them had previous experience in AD creation.

We proceeded from the availability of AD scripts produced in either the US or UK. Each translator worked with an electronic version of the transcription of the English AD, the English audio described DVD, and the Spanish dubbed version on DVD of the following films:

- *Iris*, by Richard Eyre (91 min, 2001), AD by Di Langford.
- *The Shipping News*, by Lasse Hallstrom (111 min, 2001), AD by Di Langford.
- *Brief Encounter*, by David Lean (86 min, 1945), AD by Di Langford.

The tasks were divided as follows. Each researcher had to create four AD scripts of the first ten minutes of each film, following two different procedures:

According to the first procedure, the Spanish AD corresponding to *39 steps* and *Iris* were to be created from the original version of the film, without having previously seen the English AD script. However, the participants were advised to watch the whole film in order to have a better understanding of the context. After that, they had to adapt the Spanish AD to the dubbed version of the film, and finally read the adapted script. These three phases had to be timed by the participants in order to calculate the total duration of the process.

According to the second procedure, the Spanish AD corresponding to the films *The Shipping News* and *The Man Who Knew Too Much* were to be created by translating the English AD script. This is the key difference between the first and the second procedure. Besides, at this stage, the adjuster did not participate, since his role was to contribute to a subsequent stage. In this case, the participants were also advised to watch the whole film. The translated AD was also to be adapted to the Spanish dubbed version and finally to be read. As in the first procedure, the total duration of the process had to be calculated by adding up the duration of the three phases.

The aim of these two first stages was to compare the total duration of the different procedures of AD generation and to evaluate the creative process. Since, as previously said, the participants had no previous experience, the duration of these procedures needs to be taken with caution, i.e. the more experienced the describer or translator, the less time she/he will need to create or translate the AD.

In a third stage, only the two subtitlers were involved. They firstly had to create the Spanish HoH subtitles of the first ten minutes from the film ‘Brief Encounter’. Based on that, they created and read the Spanish AD script. As before, the total duration of these three parts was timed. Subtitling was the only choice here because some regional TV channel in Spain.

---

11 Thanks are due to Joan Greening from RNIB and Dr Andrew Salway from the University of Surrey, who generously supplied the five AD scripts.
had already proposed to its pool of free-lance subtitlers to carry out the ADs for a minimum extra charge.

In the fourth stage, a sixth researcher, the dubbing director and adjuster, were asked to adapt the two translated AD scripts (second stage) and to calculate the time spent both on adapting and reading the Spanish AD scripts.

One of the aims of this project was to find out which profile for a commercial audio describer fits better into the future audiovisual Spanish market. This explains the variety of backgrounds of the participants. Every expert involved in this research project had to render the task from her/his professional point of view and evaluate the procedure and the results accordingly.

The results presented below were analyzed from the points of view of the translator for the translation and the adjuster for the creation.

7 Results

The project entails five stages, with the first one almost completed. Based on the provisional data of the first stage, two tentative results could be drawn:

- If we consider the average time spent in creating and adapting the first 10 minutes of audio description corresponding to the first stage, the calculation shows that for a 90-minute film, the creation of the AD from scratch and from the original version would take nearly ten hours and a half, pending the final recording by a professional voice-talent.
- For the creation of a new AD script on the basis of translating the original into English, we would have to spend a bit more than ten hours.

Therefore at this point, awaiting more comprehensive information, it is reasonable to suggest that translating the already available AD script is slightly less time-consuming than creating a new one from the film in its original version. It is true that this result might have been influenced by the fact that participants already had experience in translating but not in audio describing. However, just half of them had previous experience in adjusting. Nevertheless, it has to be underlined that it is precisely at the beginning of a film, i.e. in the first ten to fifteen minutes, that there is always more to be described, since the plot, the setting and the characters have to be introduced for the first time.

- The length of the film is not a deciding factor of the time spent in creating the AD, both new and translated. More important is the filmic structure (for instance, flashbacks), action and dialog speed, number of gaps in the dialogs and so on.

As mentioned before, this is an ongoing research. Final results and conclusions are to come and will be published as soon as they are available.

8 Conclusion

This research was carried out to test the following assertions made by Veronica Hyks in Translating Today (2005:7): “As much as it would seem to make sense to make audio description scripts available to others, to save time, translating and reworking can sometimes take as long if not longer than starting from scratch. Audio describers and translators may well find themselves working side by side in the not so distant future.”
The question remains what would be the results if the same person did both? After all, translators are better trained to address cultural references and to adapt them to the target audience. Moreover, an original AD gives the appropriate cultural background and accordingly is more informative than the AD for the same film done from scratch. In this way, translators could avoid a significant loss of necessary cultural references and, if required e.g. by time constraints they can decide and distinguish together what is important in the original audio description and what can be left out, what must be kept and what can be sacrificed. Translators could take advantage of the original AD, adapt it and reformulate it in the time given (between dialog gaps) and in the appropriate linguistic register. It could also be argued that the translation of an original AD script could be more flexible and thus more creative than for example the translation of the DVD subtitles which are generated from a rigid master/genesis file which today is the generally accepted method of translating subtitles.

Another point to be considered is that the creation of both from the original version of the film and translating the original AD is faster than waiting until the dubbed version is ready and then start with the AD in the target language. Obviously, the two first options could only be carried out by a professional with foreign language skills.

In short, the original AD could be the basis for a more accurate, probably faster, and thus more economical version in the target language.

This research is only one of the many projects underway at university level in the hope of making accessibility to the media an easier way for social integration. To reach this goal, the translation of audio description scripts should be considered not only as the way forward, but also as a possible step forward.

9 References


Sabine Braun (Surrey)

Multimedia communication technologies and their impact on interpreting

Contents
1 Introduction
2 Interpreter-mediated communication and new technologies
3 New forms of interlingual interpreting – an overview
4 Implications for research
5 A case study: adaptation
6 Conclusion
7 References

Abstract

In line with the aim of the MuTra conference to address "the multiple (multilingual, multimedia, multimodal and polysemiotic) dimensions of modern translation scenarios" and to raise questions as to the impact of new technologies on the form, content, structure and modes of translated products (Gerzymisch-Arbogast: 2007: 7), this paper will investigate the impact of multimedia communication technologies on interpreting. The use of these technologies has led to new forms of interpreting in which interpreting takes place from a distance, aided by technical mediation. After reviewing the major new and emerging forms, I will outline a set of research questions that need to be addressed and, by way of example, discuss the results of research on interpreter adaptation in videoconference interpreting.

1 Introduction

Traditionally, interpreting – both interpreting spoken language as well as sign language – has been associated with synchronous communicative interaction in which all participants (i.e. interlocutors as well as interpreters) share the same physical environment. However, the ongoing spread of information and communication technologies along with growing multilingualism and efforts of social inclusion (access to the media for all) has led to changes in communication practices, which have also had repercussions on the practice of interpreting at the beginning of the 21st century. The following technological developments are of particular relevance here.

Firstly, teleconferencing technologies, linking communicative partners at two or more locations, have created new opportunities for real-time interaction without the need for physical co-presence (distance communication). On the one hand, audioconferencing technologies have become more versatile than their old-fashioned precursor, the telephone, enabling participants at more than two locations – and even mobile participants with changing locations – to interact in spoken mode. On the other hand, live chat via the Internet has provided a tool for synchronous interaction in written mode. But what has given a boost to the spread of teleconferencing technologies is that they have become multimedial and can therefore better support the different modes of communication. Thus, teleconferencing today can rely on audio and video delivery channels (videoconferencing) to support the spoken
verbal mode as well as the visual mode, and on document sharing and whiteboarding facilities to support the written verbal and/or an additional graphical mode.

Secondly, information and communication technologies have also been exploited to make communicative events more multidimensional. International conferences, for example, are often accompanied by 'virtual strands' (e.g. by live chat sessions or web discussion forums), and Annual General Meetings are sometimes broadcast live on the Internet (webcasting) – both with the aim to reach those who cannot participate in the main event itself. Similarly, TV talk shows are sometimes 'continued' on the Internet in live chats with the expert talk show guests. Many politicians, among them the German chancellor, use the new technologies to add another dimension to their political discourse, by making pre-recorded audio or video clips (so-called podcasts) available at their websites to reach the public more 'directly'.

The spread of new technologies has not replaced face-to-face communication. Rather, it has created additional communication opportunities, and this is in line with the communication needs in increasingly complex international and interdisciplinary projects requiring frequent, regular, fast and cheap communication contacts between the parties involved. It furthermore coincides with an unprecedented mobility of labor and migration movements, with the EU enlargement and the EU's language policy, all of which have promoted multilingualism (despite the use of English as a lingua franca in many communicative situations).

These interwoven lines of development have had a twofold impact on interlingual interpreting (including sign language interpreting): On the one hand, interpreting support is required in distance communication such as bilingual teleconferences. This has already been practiced in the form of telephone interpreting, but due to the emergence of new teleconferencing technologies, the requirements for interpreting have diversified. On the other hand, the new technologies themselves have come to be used to make interpreters available from a distance: it is not infrequent for interpreting agencies today to promise interpreting services 'at the push of a button' through the use of audio or video links between a remote interpreter and those in need of the service. This form of interpreting has, for example, is being used in medical and court room contexts.

Apart from this, the spread of audiovisual communication media has also created a need for intermodal interpreting in order to provide access to these media for members of society with disabilities. The increase in live broadcasting on TV and on the web, for instance, has created a need for live subtitling of audiovisual contents for the deaf and hard-of-hearing, i.e. a 'transfer' of spoken language and sound into written subtitles. Theaters and museums increasingly acknowledge that blind and partially sighted people can access visual contents through live audio description provided by 'visual interpreters' who 'translate' images into verbal language.

All of the developments outlined above have resulted in some relatively new forms of interpreting and have created additional and/or novel tasks for interpreters. This raises questions with regard to interpreting techniques and strategies, training and quality standards, but first and foremost it calls for research into the new forms of interpreting to create a better understanding of the conditions (and constraints) that apply in each case. It also raises the question of the interpreters' adaptation and adaptability, since continuously changing working conditions make it increasingly difficult for interpreters to work under the same or very similar conditions for a long period of time. In the forms of what I have called intermodal interpreting we even find cases in which the traditionally separate activities of translating and interpreting intermingle (cf. also Gambier 2003).

In this paper I will focus on recent forms of interlingual interpreting. In section 2 I will discuss the types of communication which are relevant for interpreting 'at a distance' and the different motivations which are driving the demand for new forms of interpreting. In section
3. I will review (prototypical) new forms of interpreting which have emerged or are currently emerging in practice, paying particular attention to the challenges for the interpreter. This will lead me to outlining a set of research questions which can be identified from observing current and emerging practice (section 4). In addressing one key area, interpreter adaptation, I will conclude this paper by reporting the results of a case study on interpreting in videoconference conversations, which focussed on adaptation processes (section 5).

2 Interpreter-mediated communication and new technologies

Many of the new forms of interpreting are characterized by the geographical separation of some or all of those who participate in the interpreted communicative event. To describe these forms effectively and to gain a better understanding of the challenges for the interpreter, it is first of all necessary to define relevant types of communication and participant roles. Furthermore, the different motivations for using communication technologies in connection with interpreting need to be considered since they have an impact on the working conditions of interpreters.

With regard to participant roles, I will distinguish between primary participants and interpreters. Primary participants are all those who produce the source text (ST) and/or receive the target text (TT). As for relevant types of communication, interpreter mediation can take place in interpersonal and mass communication:

Interpersonal communication is characterized by a direct relationship between the participants. While traditionally face-to-face communication, recent technological developments have provided a variety of solutions for its technical mediation over distances, as outlined in section 1. Interpersonal communication can be either dyadic or (more or less) monologic, with the corresponding forms of interpreting being bilateral interpreting (usually involving one language pair) and conference interpreting (usually involving a number of language pairs) respectively.

In dyadic communication, such as a conversation between two people or a small-group discussion, the primary participants are the interlocutors who interact with each other and continuously find themselves in alternate roles (switching between speaker/ST producer and listener/TT recipient). In bilingual dyadic communication the interpreter normally works in both language directions and in consecutive or (whispered) simultaneous mode. In monologic communication the primary participants are the speakers and their audience. This concerns conference situations, formalized meetings or debates (e.g. in international institutions) with a multilingual team of interpreters, usually working into their A-language (mother tongue or first language) and most frequently in simultaneous mode (in a booth).

In the traditional face-to-face setting, both forms of interpersonal communication are characterized by interactivity and by the availability of non-verbal and visual clues. While interactivity is obvious in dyadic communication, monologic face-to-face communication is also interactive to some degree, as speakers are able to monitor the reactions, receive feedback or take questions from the audience. By the same token, the interpreters usually share the same physical space as the primary participants (even when working in an interpreting booth) and are able to receive visual information from the primary participants, including non-verbal clues from the speakers as well as reactions and feedback from the listeners/audience.

In technically mediated interpersonal communication, there are no established practices for the integration of an interpreter as yet (with the exception of telephone interpreting). Whatever way it is done, it is likely that the interpreter's access to visual information about the primary participants is technically restricted in one way or another (e.g. the lack of visual clues in telephone interpreting). This has been one major point of criticism of some of the
more recent forms of interpreting. I will return to this in section 3. It should be noted though that technical restrictions do not necessarily result in restricted communication, as was suggested e.g. by Short et al. (1976). The interesting question is in fact whether and to what extent their individual communicative competence enables primary participants as well as interpreters to adapt to new communicative situations.

Mass communication mainly refers to broadcast communication, where the audience is 'anonymous'. In contrast to interpersonal communication, mass communication has involved technical mediation for many decades through radio and TV. Irrespective of the nature of a broadcast event (a monologic event such as a speech or a dyadic event such as a talk show or a press conference), broadcast communication is unidirectional in the sense that the (remote and 'invisible') audience cannot interact with the onsite participants in the same way as a speaker can interact with a co-present audience or as the interlocutors of a debate can interact with each other. With regard to interpreter mediation and participant roles, both the on-site participants and the remote audience are primary participants insofar as they either produce the ST or receive the TT.

Spoken-language interpreting for TV has established itself as a separate form of interpreting (cf. Kurz 1997). The interpreters usually work in a booth or 'off-room' (often without direct view of the speakers) and in simultaneous mode. Moreover, sign-language interpreting has traditionally played an important role on TV. As live broadcasting is becoming technically easier and networking among TV stations worldwide is becoming more frequent (e.g. caused by broadcast network monopolies), the proportion of live footage on TV both in the country's language and in foreign languages is increasing. In addition, broadcasting technology is spilling out into the web (webcasting). Broadcast communication is therefore likely to become more relevant for the interpreting profession and has already boosted new forms of interlingual interpreting (interpreting in webcasts) and intermodal interpreting (especially live subtitling for the deaf and hard-of-hearing (cf. Eugeni 2007).

So far, I have looked at various types of technically mediated communication and at their impact on interpreting. The increasing use of distance communication technologies by the primary participants is, however, only one reason for the emergence of new forms of interpreting. A fundamentally different motivation is underlying the use of (the same) communication technologies to link an interpreter from a remote site to a group of primary participants who share the same physical space. When discussing the use of communication technologies in connection with interpreting, we, therefore, have to make a basic but crucial distinction between:

1. interpreting in communicative events in which the primary participants themselves are distributed over different locations (i.e. interpreting in a teleconference, TV broadcast, webcast),
2. interpreting in communicative events in which the primary participants are together on site and only the interpreter works from a different location (i.e. remote interpreting).

This distinction cuts across the different types of interpreter-mediated communication (mass, interpersonal, dyadic and monologic communication). In the first category, the various forms of teleconferencing, for example, are primarily – but not exclusively – used for dyadic interpersonal communication (e.g. small-group discussions); by contrast, broadcast technologies are associated with unidirectional communication (e.g. speeches or press conferences). The second category, remote interpreting, is required for both forms of interpersonal communication. The following section provides an overview of the major new forms of interpreting which have emerged in practice.
3 New forms of interlingual interpreting – an overview

Interpreting in a teleconference
Teleconferencing includes all types of synchronous, real-time interpersonal communication with the primary participants at different locations, i.e. audioconference, videoconference and chat. The most basic form of an audioconference is a telephone conversation, and indeed the most well-known form of interpreting in a teleconference situation is telephone interpreting. Here an interpreter is integrated into a telephone conversation, usually working from a third location and working in consecutive mode (cf. Oviatt & Cohen 1992, Wadensjö 1999). Telephone interpreting is mostly used to support dyadic communication between interlocutors at two sites (only). While more complex audioconferences involving more than two interlocutor sites are frequent in professional monolingual communication, Wadensjö’s (1999) analysis of the complexities of turn-taking in telephone interpreting makes it clear that a bilingual (let alone multilingual) interpreter-mediated audioconference with more than two sites is more difficult to manage.

Interpreting in a videoconference can be seen as an extension of telephone interpreting. In the simplest form of a videoconference, a so-called peer-to-peer videoconference, two sites are linked via sound and video channels (using satellite links, the ISDN telephone network or more recently the web), allowing for (relatively natural) synchronous interaction among a small, distributed group of interlocutors. As was pointed out in section 2, there is no standard practice for interpreter integration here as yet. In my own research into interpreting in bilingual videoconference conversations (German<>English and German<>French), an interpreter was integrated into an ISDN-based peer-to-peer videoconference from a third location, using videoconference equipment that gave the interpreter access to the sound and video images from both interlocutor sites and enabled him/her to switch the language direction as appropriate. The conversations were found to run more smoothly when the interpreter worked in simultaneous mode than in consecutive mode. Whilst there were problems with the sound quality and with a delay in the transmission of sound and images, the interpreters stressed the usefulness of visual clues, and the interpreting task on the whole was positively received (cf. Braun 2004, 2007 and section 5).

Apart from the use of videoconference technology for dyadic communication, it has also been used to enable monologic communication over a distance, e.g. conferences with distributed speakers and audiences or with individual remote speakers (cf. Daly 1985 and Kurz 2000 respectively). According to Kurz (2000: 101), simultaneous interpreting between the on-site German-speaking and remote English-speaking primary participants of the conference on which she reports did not present any major problems as long as the sound quality was sufficient and the contributions by remote speakers were of a relatively short duration. However, she also points to a number of avoidable technical problems. In one case, for instance, no technical trial run was carried out with the interpreters, and the organizers forgot to provide an additional sound channel between the main conference room and the remote site, so that the English interpretation of the German contributions made in the conference room could not be received by English-speaking remote participants.

Due to being perceived as more natural in comparison to audioconferencing, videoconference technology seems, in principle, better suited for interpreter-mediated communication involving more than two primary participant sites than audioconferencing. However, research has to date only focused on peer-to-peer videoconferences.

Yet other requirements for interpreting have been created in multilingual chat sessions, which are, for example, used in the European Commission to enable EU citizens to ‘talk’ to EU politicians (European Commission 2003). In a chat between the public and an expert, for instance, the interpreters would be at the expert’s location. The written contributions from the public can be interpreted by way of sight translation, or they can be read out and interpreted.
(simultaneously), whereas the spoken expert's answers are interpreted and typed (manually or with the help of speech recognition software). Whatever the practical realization, the crucial point is that chat interpreting is difficult, because in contrast to the other teleconference interpreting settings the interpreters are deprived of all visual and paralinguistic clues from the remote contributors. Therefore, the remote interlocutors remain a largely anonymous group of primary participants for the interpreter, in spite of the fact that chat is a form of interpersonal dyadic communication. They also form a potentially more heterogeneous group than the interlocutors in other types of dyadic communication. This further complicates the situation for the interpreter.

### Interpreting in a webcast

The use of webcasting technology to deliver communicative events live to an audience via the Internet is a more recent development. Webcasting follows the same principle as live radio and TV broadcasting: audio or audio and video are recorded at the speaker's site and immediately sent out to the audience. Interpreting in a webcast shares some features with interpreting in a videoconference, but many more with TV interpreting. The speaker and the interpreter are in the same location. This enables the interpreter to work from a booth or 'off-room' and interpret simultaneously. Ideally the interpreter will be able to see the speaker (at least on a monitor). The major challenge of this scenario is that the audience is not only remote (as in videoconference interpreting) and invisible (as telephone and chat interpreting), but also 'passive' since webcast communication/interpreting is a form of unidirectional communication. In other words, the interpreter has no access to the audience at all and is therefore deprived of perceiving any reaction or feedback. This is further exacerbated by the fact the audience is potentially larger and more heterogeneous than in most other forms of interpreting and less predictable than even the audience of a TV program.

In an effort to introduce some interactivity into webcast communication, the EU has started to combine live webcasting and live chat. This is, for example, used by EU officials to explain a call for tender to interested members of the public. The explanation is delivered via webcast and is interpreted. Members of the audience can then ask questions via a chat line. The (written) questions are interpreted for the EU officials and subsequently answered by the officials, again via the webcast connection (European Commission 2004).

### Remote interpreting

I will now turn to the second of the two categories of interpreting in connection with technical mediation outlined at the end of section 2. Audio- and videoconferencing technologies are used to enable what has come to be called 'remote interpreting'. The primary participants are all at the same site, while the interpreter is at a separate location and is linked to the primary participants via audio or audio and video connection.

International institutions have been interested in remote conference interpreting via video link for some 20 years. A major driving force for experimenting with remote interpreting in EU institutions, for example, has been the EU enlargement and the anticipated (or temporary) shortfall of interpreting booths in the EU meeting rooms (cf. Mouzourakis 2003). A number of studies was carried out to explore the conditions of interpreting in this setting (cf. Böcker & Anderson 1993, Moser-Mercer 2003, 2005, Mouzourakis 1996, 2003, 2006). In principle, the interpreters worked from a separate room and used monitors to view the primary

---

1 There may, of course, also be a combination of a co-present audience and a remote Internet-based audience.

2 These forms have also been called telephone interpreting and video(conference) interpreting respectively. However, in this paper the terms telephone interpreting and video(conference) interpreting are reserved for the two forms of interpreting in a teleconference described above.
participants (overview of the meeting room, detailed view of the speaker or a combination of both).

According to Mouzourakis (2006: 52) the studies of remote conference interpreting, which were conducted in a variety of technical conditions, revealed "a number of physiological (sore eyes, back and neck pain, headaches, nausea) and psychological complaints (loss of concentration and motivation, feeling of alienation)". In her comparative study, Moser-Mercer (2003) furthermore observed an earlier onset of fatigue in remote interpreting compared to traditional conference interpreting. Mouzourakis (2006: 52) concludes that it would be "difficult to attribute [these problems] solely to a particular technical setup or even to the working conditions provided by a particular organization". Rather, they seem to be caused by the condition of remoteness.

More recently there has been a growing need for remote bilateral interpreting, especially in the area of public service interpreting (or community interpreting). In an early study of remote bilateral interpreting in medical encounters, Hornberger et al. (1996) compared remote simultaneous interpreting using an audio connection with onsite consecutive interpreting. In the remote condition the doctor and patients were equipped with microphones and headsets, and the interpreters worked from a separate room to interpret simultaneously. The remote mode was preferred by the primary participants. The interpreters, while preferring to work on site, stated that they thought the primary participants would benefit from the simultaneous mode. The interpreters' performance in the remote simultaneous mode was found to be more complete and accurate than the performance in the onsite consecutive mode.

Results from other, smaller surveys of remote interpreting using audio connections (cf. Fagan et al. 2003, Jones et al. 2003, Kuo & Fagan 1999, Lee et al. 2002) and video connections (cf. Jones et al. 2003, Paras et al. 2002) – all in medical encounters – are difficult to compare because of a great variance in the conditions under which they were conducted. In a review of these studies, Azarmina & Wallace (2005: 144) conclude, perhaps somewhat optimistically, that "the findings of the selected studies suggest that remote interpretation is at least as acceptable as physically present interpretation to patients, doctors and (to a lesser extent) interpreters themselves" and that "[r]emote interpretation appears to be associated with levels of accuracy at least as good as those found in physically present interpretation". Informal reports by interpreters also exist from the use of remote interpreting (both video and audio) in other settings, e.g. at the police, in court rooms and in pharmacies. Furthermore, video links have been used to provide sign-language interpreting at a distance. The general claim seems to be that remote bilateral interpreting is feasible on the whole. However, with an increasing demand for this form of interpreting, there is a need for further research into the various settings.

4 Implications for research

New and emerging forms of bilingual or multilingual communication in which interpreting takes place under the conditions of technical mediation may currently or perhaps even in the future only represent a relatively small share of the interpreting market. However, they are perceived as particularly difficult forms of interpreting, and as yet there are no established standard practices for most of them. Research will help to gain a better understanding of the difficulties involved and will therefore support the shaping of future working conditions of interpreters from an interpreter's perspective rather than leaving the decisions solely to the

---

3 In contrast to the study by Hornberger et al, for example, most other studies involving audio connections used the telephone (the telephone receiver was passed on between doctor and patient), and consequently the interpretation was consecutive.
institutions that have an interest in remote interpreting services. Moreover, research into new forms of interpreting is likely to reveal additional insights into the conditions and processes of interpreting in general. In this section I will describe some of the major questions that need to be addressed.

A whole set of questions arises from one of the most prominent characteristics of these forms: the suspension of physical co-presence of some or all participants. Remoteness has wide-ranging implications, which researchers have only begun to investigate. Three dimensions can be distinguished here:

Firstly, the remoteness of the interpreters and how it affects their performance has been analyzed in remote conference interpreting scenarios (cf. section 3) but needs to be explored further and needs to include other forms of interpreting. In videoconference interpreting, for example, the remoteness was also found to affect the work of the interpreters, but unlike the results from remote conference interpreting, it did not lead to a loss of motivation (cf. Braun 2004). By the same token, the more favorable reception that remote bilateral interpreting has so far received in comparison to remote conference interpreting also suggests differences in the impact of remoteness in the various settings.

Secondly, not much is known about the impact of the physical/geographical separation of the primary participants (from each other, where relevant, and from the interpreter) on their communicative behavior and about possible knock-on effects on the interpreter's task and performance (cf. Braun 2004). This question is particularly relevant for bilateral interpreting (in a teleconference, but also remote bilateral interpreting), since a bilateral interpreter is traditionally a member of the group of communicators and is highly 'visible' for the primary participants.

Thirdly, the remoteness and invisibility of the audience in broadcast/webcast scenarios has to date only been analyzed from the perspective of TV interpreting (cf. Elsagir 2000). As web-based broadcast technologies are beginning to emerge, the impact that a potentially wider, more heterogeneous and less predictable web audience as well as the easier distribution and reusability of webcasts in comparison to TV programs will have on interpreting performance are research questions for the future.

A related area of research is that of communication management in the new forms of interpreting. Some questions of communication management, in particular turn-taking, have been addressed by Wadensjö (1999) and Braun (2004) for telephone and videoconference interpreting respectively. In a wider sense, research is, for example, required into the impact of the roles, status and geographical/physical distribution of primary participants and interpreters on communication management under the conditions of technically mediated interpreting. Another aspect that requires examination is the impact of technical issues such as control over equipment (e.g. control over camera movement in video-based interpreting) and possibilities of intervention by the interpreter (before and during an interpreting assignment) on communication management. A closely related question concerns the new and/or additional communication management skills required from the interpreters. Finally, the impact of (effective) communication management on the quality of the interpreting service in the new forms of interpreting should be investigated.

Yet another relevant area of research, which has not received much attention in connection with the new forms of interpreting, is the vast area of socio-cultural implications of these forms of interpreting. On the one hand, the increasing use of English as a lingua franca and the generally increased mobility of labor have created a situation in which people who use the same language may no longer share the same or a similar cultural background. The effects of this on interpreting under the various conditions of technical mediation have yet to be explored. On the other hand, the reactions of primary participants from different cultural and social backgrounds, different age groups, of people with medical conditions or under stress (in a medical or court room or police context) to the new forms of interpreting are
largely unknown (but cf. Lee et al. 2002) and could potentially have important implications on the usability of these forms of interpreting. At the same time, the cultural and social backgrounds of speakers and their related linguistic behavior (e.g. strong regional dialects) may affect the performance of interpreters. This raises questions with regard to the feasibility of remote interpreting especially in public service interpreting, where primary participants are often less used to speaking 'in public' and to working with interpreters.

One aspect of communication that has recently received increasing attention in discourse analysis and related fields is the contribution of different modes of communication to discourse comprehension and production (cf. e.g. Kress & van Leuwen 2001). This area of research is potentially relevant for both intermodal and interlingual interpreting. I will, however, continue to focus on interlingual interpreting here. Interlingual interpreting is known to rely heavily on non-verbal clues such as mimic, gesture, posture (cf. Bühler 1985, Poyatos 1997) and on the interpreters' general visual perception of the communicative situation. One major problem of the technical mediation of communication is that it imposes constraints on the perception of non-verbal clues and general visual perception. Not unexpectedly therefore telephone interpreting and remote interpreting via an audio link are regarded to be among the most difficult forms of interpreting. Having said that, even videoconference interpreting and video-based remote interpreting were found to be more difficult than face-to-face interpreting. Interesting clues come from research into visual perception in monolingual video-mediated communication here, which has revealed that the video channel, even when providing high quality video images, supports the perception of visual clues less efficiently than face-to-face communication (Finn et al. 1997, Whittacker 1995). Moser-Mercer (2005), reflecting upon the role of visual perception in remote interpreting, concludes that a better understanding of the functions of visual information and of the interpreters' needs in its perception is required.

The current diversification of the forms of interpreting requires interpreters to adapt to new working conditions faster these days than perhaps ever before. In a fast-changing world it is not possible to work under the same or very similar conditions for a long period of time. Therefore, one final research area to be mentioned here (although more could certainly be added) concerns the adaptation of interpreters to new forms of interpreting. In Braun (2004, 2007), I have shown that interpreters who worked in bilingual videoconference conversations were able to develop adapted strategies to cope with the novel tasks in the videoconference setting. By way of example, the main results of this research will be outlined in the final section of this paper. Further research into the interpreters' potential to adapt to new forms of interpreting will provide much more than short-term answers to questions of what is feasible and what is not. If adaptation processes can be modelled appropriately, this can provide long-term arguments to feed into the ongoing and future debates about interpreters' working conditions and workplaces as well as a useful starting point for interpreter training.

5 A case study: adaptation

In this section I will briefly outline a case study on interpreter adaptation in bilingual videoconference conversations. The starting point of this research was the assumption that interpreting is a process of discourse comprehension and production under specific conditions (Kohn & Kalina 1996), characterized by the immediacy of the 'transfer' (cf. Kade 1968) and therefore requiring a number of specific linguistic and cognitive skills (including memorization and retrieval skills, cf. Gile 1991) as well as specific comprehension and production strategies (cf. Kalina 1998). The investigation of adaptation processes was furthermore based on the hypothesis that the interpreters' ability to monitor their ST comprehension and TT production and to act upon the results of their monitoring processes
plays a crucial role in the optimization of their performance and in the development of adapted strategies (cf. Braun 2004).

Adaptation is understood here as the interpreters' ability to select strategies which they consider to be appropriate for the situation; this involves 'novel' strategies which develop in connection with a new interpreting task and which have not occurred before because the need did not arise; it also involves strategies which are known from other scenarios, and which may be applied very frequently in a particular scenario.

The study relied on a small corpus of recordings and transcripts of a) 11 simultaneously interpreted bilingual VC sessions (English<>German and French<>German) of an average length of 30 minutes and b) retrospective think-aloud protocols with the interpreters and some of the interlocutors. The VC sessions consisted of role play peer-to-peer and small group conversations of two types. Half of them were job interviews where the interviewers came from Human Resources departments of various companies, and the candidates were freelance language trainers who were asked to apply for a job as language trainer. The other half were information-gathering sessions in which German university students talked to informants from foreign universities in preparation for their term abroad.

For the videoconference connections, PC-based ISDN videoconference systems were used. The systems worked on the basis of the H.320 standard for audio and video encoding (G.722 and H.261 respectively; a frequency rate of 7 kHz was used for audio transmission; a bandwidth of 128 and 384 kBit/s for video transmission). The primary participants used commercially available systems. The interpreters worked from a dedicated PC-based videoconference interpreting station which allowed them to see and hear both interlocutor sites at all times and to switch the language direction as appropriate. The interlocutors saw each other but did not see the interpreter.

The interpreters were trained (conference) interpreters who – with one exception – had many years of experience of all forms of interpreting. One interpreter per session was used. Two major difficulties reported by the interpreters related to the sound quality and a feeling of reduced social presence, which made it more difficult to relate to the interlocutors and led to an earlier onset of fatigue. Other difficulties for the interpreters arose from the interlocutors' communicative behavior: the interlocutors also had problems relating to their remote counterparts, and as a result of this their utterances were sometimes incoherent. This had knock-on effects on the interpreters' performance. Finally, a data transmission delay (approx. 0.5 seconds) caused a number of interaction problems (for a discussion of these, cf. Braun, Kohn & Mikasa 1999, Braun 2004). The interpreters were often required to adopt the role of a moderator, which posed a number of ethical and other problems.

In spite of these problems, however, the interpreters believed that interpreting in this setting was in principle feasible, especially if the sound quality could be improved. The overall positive impression can largely be traced back to the interpreters' ability to adapt to the interpreting conditions in the videoconference setting. Two of the interpreters were involved in a whole series of videoconference sessions over several months. What is particularly interesting in their performance is that the adaptation proceeded in stages, along with a shift in the type of strategies that were mainly used. Broadly speaking the following three qualitatively different stages could be distinguished. To a lesser extent this could also be observed in the performance of those interpreters who participated in one videoconference only.

The first stage was one of problem discovery and awareness raising. The interpreters realized that familiar interpreting strategies sometimes failed in the videoconference situation. This was mainly due to listening comprehension problems created by problems with the sound quality and the above-described knock-on effects of the interlocutor's problems with the production of coherent (ST) utterances. Furthermore, problems with conversation management due to the transmission delay and the interpreter's time lag caused disruption in
the early phases of many videoconferences. At this stage, performance reduction and the use of *ad hoc and local problem-solving strategies* predominated:

Listening comprehension problems were often spontaneously dealt with by generalizing in the TT, activating additional background knowledge to cope with the situation. Furthermore, the interpreters increased their time lag to exploit additional ST segments for comprehension. This strategy is familiar from other difficult interpreting situations. However, in the dyadic communication scenario of the videoconferences the effectiveness of this strategy was limited. In combination with the transmission delay in the videoconference, the interpreter's time lag frequently created long pauses between turns. This sometimes provoked overlapping speech, e.g., when an interlocutor who was waiting for a reply became uncertain and started to restate his/her question or added something to a previously completed turn just as the interpretation of the reply from the remote site arrived. The treatment of the ensuing turn-taking problems is another example of initial attempts at adaptation which were of only limited success: many attempts to *repair* turn-taking problems which had already occurred led to new turn-taking problems because of the transmission delay and the ensuing asynchronous perception of utterances at the producer's site and the receiver's site.

From this, a second stage can be distinguished which was characterized by an intense reflection on how to deal with the problems encountered (manifest in the retrospective think-aloud protocols) and by experimenting with 'new' strategies (manifest in the VC sessions themselves). As a result, more *global problem-solving strategies* were used. While this stage constituted an important milestone in the adaptation process, these strategies still mainly served to *repair* problems which had already occurred. Whilst they did not necessarily cause disruption, they often created less elegant solutions:

It was, for example, not infrequent for the interpreters to choose the second-best solution in the TT in order to save resources for ST comprehension. Some other aspects of TT production (accentuation and fluency) were also generally neglected in favor of focusing on ST comprehension. Once the problems with an increased time lag became clear, the interpreters tried instead to reduce the simultaneity of ST comprehension and TT production in a more systematic way, using short pauses in the ST to deliver TT segments. This in turn required condensation in the TT, which usually worked well. On the negative side, however, the reduced simultaneity led to a number of pauses in the TT which (falsely) indicated the completion of the interpreter's turn. Any attempt by a listener to take the floor in such situations yet again created overlapping speech with all its rather drastic consequences in the videoconference setting. After repeated difficulties with repairing turn-taking problems one interpreter adopted a policy of strict 'non-interference' in the interlocutors' turn-taking problems. However, this was not helpful for the interlocutors because they were usually not able to solve interactional problems themselves.

A breakthrough in the adaptation process was achieved with the introduction of *global avoidance and preventive strategies*, fine-tuned to the situation. Thus, the third stage was the stage where adapted strategies began to emerge. At this stage there was a stronger tendency of decision-making as to what information to omit or at least to withhold until it was possible to assess whether or not it was important in a particular context. Moreover, the reduction of simultaneity of ST comprehension and TT production was further refined: the interpreters started to use fillers and their intonation to signal turn continuation and to prevent listeners from taking the floor during short pauses in the TT. Alternatively, the places selected for pauses in the TT were places where it was clear from the syntactic structure that the TT would continue. In general, signalling the status of the conversation came to play a key role in the coordination of the conversation: As a result of prevailing interactional problems, for

---

4 A (partial) solution might have been for the interlocutors to actually see the interpreter. However, this was not an option in our technical setup.
example, the interpreters decided to finally adopt a very active and consistent role in conversation management. It seems that the increased cognitive workload which this implied was offset by a better overall flow of the conversation, fewer comprehension problems through overlapping speech and, consequently also fewer production problems.

On the whole the findings with regard to adaptation in this interpreting scenario create (moderate) optimism with regard to new and emerging tasks for interpreters. It became clear that two types of adaptation played a significant role. A spontaneous reduction of some aspects of their performance (e.g. TT presentation) helped the interpreters to cope spontaneously with difficult situations and to focus attention on aspects of the performance which were considered more important at (ST comprehension). The repeated encounter of the same or similar problem led them to develop and/or activate adapted strategies, i.e. to resort to other, more elegant ways of adapting. However, when performance reduction remains the predominant pattern, this inevitably leads to a loss of quality.

This, in turn, raises the question to what extent the quality of interpreting in its new forms can differ from that of traditional interpreting. On the one hand, new forms of technically mediated communication and interpreting do not necessarily replace face-to-face communication. Rather, they serve to meet additional communication needs, as pointed out in section 1. With this in mind it would seem fruitful to consider and investigate the various new forms of interpreting as forms of communication in their own right. On the other hand, the users of interpreting services are usually not aware of the difficulties arising in these new forms of interpreting and/or are not normally willing to accept lower quality arising from difficulties with a new interpreting situation. Awareness of these points among interpreters contributes to the fact that new forms of interpreting are greeted with a certain amount of scepticism in the interpreting profession.

It would be unrealistic, however, to believe that industrial, governmental or other institutions will abandon their intentions to use what they perceive to be the most appropriate type of communication technologies to pursue their communicative goals. Globally operating institutions in particular are increasingly pushing towards the use of information and communication technologies, and this also sets the pace for the work of future interpreters.

What would be useful is a definition of working conditions for the emerging forms of interpreting. The AIIC has defined minimum standards for new forms of conference interpreting (cf. AIIC 2000). However, working environments change fast, and may be ahead of defined standards. In such cases it will be a question of individual negotiation between an interpreter and a client of what is feasible in a particular scenario to avoid false expectations and frustration. Awareness of potential problems, i.e. a basic familiarity with the new forms of interpreting and their 'pitfalls', will be of enormous help in the negotiation process. This is where training of future generations of interpreters comes in. Apart from that, what is always required from practicing interpreters is a degree of adaptation or, to use a catchphrase of the 21st century, some kind of ‘life-long learning’.

After all, as long as the conditions are right, new working scenarios may bring more flexibility for interpreters, e.g. the choice of travelling or working from home. Riccardi (2000) argues that remote interpreting could also lead to an interpreter's isolation. However, if new technologies could be used to help interpreters to stay out of crisis regions, their use should certainly be considered. In the end it may be disputed whether or not the new communication technologies as such bring advantages for an interpreter; familiarity with them certainly does.
6 Conclusion

In this paper I have discussed various recent forms of bilingual or multilingual communication in which interpreting takes place under the conditions of technical mediation. Based on the assumption that interpreting is cognitively complex process of discourse comprehension and production which needs to rely on specific strategies and techniques, I have outlined potential and known challenges for interpreting in the different scenarios and have defined a set of research questions which need to be addressed. These concern the condition of remoteness, questions of communication management and socio-cultural implications as well as the effectiveness of the different modes of communication in audio/video-mediated communication and interpreter adaptation. In addressing one of these questions, the final chapter reported on findings of interpreter adaptation in bilingual videoconference conversations.

7 References


Pilar Orero (Barcelona)

Voice-over: A Case of Hyper-reality

Contents
1 Hyper-reality
2 Voice-over and its association to non-fiction genres
3 The different traits in portraying the feeling of reality
4 The delay effect
5 The voice which replaces the original voice
6 The accent of the voice
7 The visible translator
8 The format of the material
9 Conclusions
10 References

Abstract
“Le simulacre n'est jamais ce qui cache la verité C'est la verite qui cache qu'il n'y en pas... Le Simulacre est vrai.” (Baudrillard 1981: 1).
Voice-over is an audiovisual translation modality usually associated with non-fiction genres (Kilborn 1993: 648, Díaz Cintas and Orero 2006: 477). This association has been established by taking into account two issues: that voice-over is the preferred translation modality for audiovisual genres, such as documentaries and news (Franco 2000: 235, Espasa 2004; David 2004), and that translation plays a role in the construction of reality (Franco 2001). Both issues will be discussed in this article, first by studying the concept of simulacrum and hyper-reality and second by looking at formal features of voice-over in translation regarding its non-fictional association, and asking how hyper-reality is achieved to create the feeling of a non-fictional product.

1 Hyper-reality
The concepts of “hyper-reality” and “simulacrum” were introduced by McLuhan’s direct heir, the French sociologist Jean Baudrillard (Merrin 2001: 95, Barker 2006: 3). They are useful tools for both analysis and description in the field of Audiovisual Translation Studies because they can help in the understanding of the reception of audiovisual media and its translation in answer to the question of why voice-over is associated with the non-fictional genres and how the creation of reality is achieved.

Simulacrum is not a new concept. It has been known in Western civilization from ancient times and has been studied in areas such as theology, philosophy and aesthetics in cultures which centered on the image and the power it portrays. William Merrin (2001: 88) describes this power: it “possesses a remarkable hold over the hearts and minds of humanity – as having the capacity to assume for us the force of that which it represents, threatening in the process the very distinction of original and image”. In Western societies this power, as Baudrillard (1998a: 34) wrote, has long been recognized as a threat to the real since we, through audiovisual media or any media such as books, photography, and the constructed image “live in denial of the real” and consume reality as a sign. With audiovisual media, the effect (McLuhan 1994: 41) is that of a vast process of simulation where coded significalory
elements are combined to create a “neo-reality” (Baudrillard (1998a: 126) which takes all the attributions and strength of reality. Baudrillard even goes further, saying that reality is abolished “in favor of this neo-reality of the model” (ibid). Voice-over, which is part of the media in the sense that it is a mode of audiovisual translation, has long been associated with the real and I suggest it is –borrowing from Baudrillard (1994b: 2) - “substituting signs of the real for the real”. Voice-over has been successful in assuming the position of the real as Merrin (2001: 98) puts it “eclipsing it today by its excess of truth, by its minute ‘hyperrealization’ of the real. This hyper-reality is, therefore, not unreal but quite the opposite: it is an “excessive semio-realization of the real”, which is more real than the real.In Translation Studies, which - from a linguistic perspective - achieves the same effect of “reconstructed reality”, Darwish (2006: 54) examines aspects of translation-mediated news in the Arab TV station Aljazeera. While in his work the focus is on the language, this article focuses on the formal features of the translation modality voice-over.

2 Voice-over and its association to non-fiction genres

From early academic work on Audiovisual Translation and Media Studies, voice-over has been described as offering an “exact” and “faithful” rendering of the original source text. Luyken (1991: 80) defined voice-over as:

The faithful translation of original speech, approximately synchronous delivery, used only in the context of monologs such as an interview response or a series of responses from a single interviewee. The original sound is either reduced entirely or to a low level of audibility. A common practice is to allow the subsequently reduced … so that the translated speech takes over… alternatively if the translation is recorded as part of the original production, it may follow the original speech exactly.

It is true that voice-over is used in TV news or documentaries in order to portray the feeling of authenticity of the discourse contents (Luyken 1991: 80) and that is portrayed by the voice of the speaker (Pönnö 1995: 304), the accent or regional variation (Fawcett 1983), the language (Darwish 2006: 58), or the TV format. As Franco explains (2001: 290):

... the type of delivery we hear in voice-over translation is an important strategic way of reassuring viewers that what they are being told in their own language is what is being said in the original language, although it is known that what they will be listening to is in fact only a representation of the original discourse.

For authors such as Kilborn (1993: 648) this transfer mode is “particularly well suited as a method for the rendering of speeches by foreign politicians”, so much that “many in the audience would now deem it wholly inappropriate if any other mode were used”.

3 The different traits in portraying the feeling of reality

Some of the formal features which have been traditionally quoted in Translation Studies to define voice-over (as seen in the previous section) have only been hinted at, without any further analysis. In fact, there is still much room for an in-depth study of voice-over, its function, its formal features and the translation of content. Given the fact that voice-over is the modality most commonly used for translating politician’s speeches and to inform about international news, the lack of attention it has received is surprising from the perspective of Audiovisual Translation, and Translation Studies in general. Darwish (2006: 54) comments
“Despite the crucial role in news making, however, translation in the news has thus occupied a very small area of research into translation and communication studies in general. Translation-mediated news production is generally acutely under-researched and particularly not researched at all in Arabic television.” Given the length and scope of this article only some of the most salient formal features of voice-over will be analyzed and it is hoped that some interest will be generated to lead to further study.

4 The delay effect

Voice-over’s most characteristic feature is, as Chaume (2003: 21) explains “the short delay in the translation and the availability of the original soundtrack”. And it is precisely this: hearing a few seconds of the original recording – the voice of the speaker in his original language – that creates the feeling of reality (Daly 1985; Ávila 1997). Darwish 2003 & 2006, Abusalem 2006 and Darwish and Orero (2006) have looked at the many complex interventions performed in the voice-over of translated texts, which are read on top of the original recording. They have established that reporting translated scripts is far from a literal translation exercise and “rather approximate and relative. It is subject to various factors that will influence the translation and that affect its level of accuracy such as: translator’s ideology, dominance, power, political debates, and political gains are all factors of critical importance.” (Abusalem 2006: 33). Hence, given the wide availability of voice-over translation and its use for matters of international politics and security, some academic research should be done in this area. While the content of the translation delivered by voice-over has not been researched so far, Darwish (2006), Abusalem (2006), and Darwish and Orero (2006) have started to look into the interventions and procedures used when translating news with voice-over.

5 The voice which replaces the original voice

This phenomenon has received hardly any attention (Díaz Cintas 1997, Orero 2005) and has been mentioned only in passing by Daly (1985) and Ávila (1997). Though some authors have commented on the accent of the voice who records the translation, no work has been carried out on the actual features of the voice: male/female, pitch, accent etc. There may be a certain degree of interest in matching voices for reading the translated text. If the person speaking is a middle-aged man, the voice-actor usually matches the genre and the age. Some agencies such as IMS (Independent Media Support Group plc) are known for trying to match voices according to the expectation of the target audience:

Our multilingual production team selected highly experienced artists who were able to convey the tone the film demanded in an appropriate manner to each language. Understanding of the cultural differences is hugely important. For example, for the French version we chose a woman’s voice, whereas a male voice was more appropriate for the Turkish video1.

This indicates that the voice – with its many qualifiers - may be one more important element to create the feeling of hyper-reality and generate what has been called the “constructed reality”, which is then reported as non-fiction genre or news as observed by Sigal (1986 quoted in Darwish 2006: 55) “News is not what happens, but what someone says has happened or will happen”.

---

6 The accent of the voice

Linked with the quality of voice and with a higher – marginally academic - attention in the studies on Audiovisual Translation are Fawcett’s (1983: 187) and Pönöö’s (1995: 304) observations. They question the adequacy of “a documentary on African tribal life with voice-overs in impeccable “Oxford” English” and comment on the use of accents when delivering the voice-over.

It would be interesting to look at other countries and find out if voice-over is delivered by a voice-talent –as is the case of documentaries – or by a journalist or by the translators (Abusalem 2006; Ali 2006). In Spain and Catalonia voice-over translations are read by voice-talents or journalists who are native Catalan or Castilian speakers, hence producing the paradox of wanting to give the impression of authenticity while at the same time the perfect delivery in Catalan or Spanish will show that the person who speaks in a foreign language is not the same as the one who is doing the locution.

There is an interesting case in Spanish TV in the program Redes on La 2. In each program there is an interview with an international scientific personality. The director and presenter Eduard Punset does the interview in English, and the material is then sent to be translated. Once the translation is done, and editing is in order (Kelly 2006: 5), Eduard Punset himself voices in Spanish. The overall effect is that most people think that Punset translates his own questions, and in some occasions people even believe that the interview is live, and that there is simultaneous interpretation. This technique is also used at Aljazeera and has been observed in recent interviews with Russian President Vladimir Putin and the Turkish Prime Minister - a very illustrative example of Merrin’s explanation of Braudillard’s hyperreality concept (2001: 198) which is “not unreal but quite the opposite: an excessive semi-realization of the real” which is in fact more real than the real.

The ability to speak in English and translate himself simultaneously confers upon Punset the attribute of a media demigod.

In a recent publication Zinovi Zinick (2006: 14), a writer who lends his voice to the BBC, writes “you create an image of ethnic origin by simulating in English the idiosyncrasies of the other's original tongue.” This is especially interesting because one has to be English to have the stereotyped accent of someone French: such as the TV character René played by Gorden Kaye who impersonated a French accent to portray a French barman in the famous BBC TV series ’Allo, ’Allo (1985) or the infamous character of Manuel played by Andrew Sachs in Fawlty Towers (1975).

The use of the translator’s voice may also be used as a disclaimer. According to Darwish (2006: 63) journalists, not translators do most translations, although interpreters and translators are also expected to do voiceovers. He also mentions (2006: 58) that this is responsible for the quality of the translations since “given the poor translation skills of most journalists and translators (as attested by the numerous examples of erroneous translations) and the lack of structured methodologies in news translation that ensure accuracy, fairness, truthfulness, objectivity [emphasis in original] and neutrality of reported news and transferred information through translated documentaries, major violations of these principles are inevitable.”

The accent of the voice may also imply that an indirect translation has been performed (Abusalem 2006: 26; Darwish 2006: 63), i.e. that a non-native speaker of English has translated the text and then delivered it: which again makes us fall into the hyperreality trap. Indirect translation for voice-over is a common practice in the UK and the Arabic speaking TV stations (Abusalem 2006 and Darwish 2006). I was often called to translate into English when there was no written text and the translation had to be done from the screen or from the tape, as for example in the BBC Radio Programme “The History of Football” where I had to translate Kubala and Di Stefano.
Abusalem (2006: 26) links the level of accuracy in translation to native speaker quality: “the translated script … may affect the level of accuracy and validity of the content being translated.” Darwish (2006: 58) accentuates the fact that *translation-journalists* and news presenters work as translators delivering bad quality translations. He provides numerous examples for the phenomenon which “is a serious problem that is increasingly causing misrepresentations, misunderstandings and communication breakdown across nations and cultures in globalized news media.”

7 The visible translator

Proceeding from the Punset example above we can also look at the issue of transparency (Allouba 1992), or, in Venuti’s (1995) terminology, the ‘invisible translator’. While translators across countries and modalities are usually invisible – which proves what a good job they do – there are interesting examples for the complete opposite as in the following case of Bin Laden and his voice-over, where the translator is not only acknowledged but signalled, when the following item appeared on the screen:

“The BBC’s security correspondent Gordon Corera assesses what motivated the latest audio tape attributed to Osama Bin Laden, and looks for other clues in the message”.  

In second 17, the following insert appeared: “VOICE OF TRANSLATOR”. The news presenter was BBC’s Security Correspondent Gordon Corera, but a foreign voice delivered the translation as voice-over, which could be heard in the background. It was believed to be Bin Laden’s voice, at least that was the feeling given with the few seconds of delay. Whether it was Bin Laden or not is impossible to assess by the original soundtrack, which is quite muffled. The translation delivered in the two languages, as described by Luyken et al. (1991: 80) “contributes to the sense of authenticity in the translation and prevents a degree of mistrust from developing.”

It is suggested as a topic for further research to investigate why voice-over offers to the audience this “reality or authenticity” feeling even though we know – as is documented in the work of Eliana Franco (2001a: 290) - that “the type of delivery we hear in voice-over translation is an important strategic way of reassuring viewers that what they are being told in their own language is what is being said in the original language, although it is known that what they will be listening to is in fact only a representation of the original discourse”.

---

2 BBC Newsnight and BBC News 24 Hours, 23 April 2006, 20: 12 GMT 21: 12 UK
3 http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/middle_east/4937232.stm
As such the impression of what is called “reality TV”, matches exactly the concept of “hyper-reality” mentioned above: “This news item is a media simulacrum which is taken for real life” (Barker 2006: 3).

Returning to the insert of Bin Laden speaking “VOICE OF TRANSLATOR”, it needs to be emphasized that such insert has not been used for any other political personality or footage in all the archives of the BBC news online videos, which raises the question of why the translator’s presence was so openly acknowledged here. While in some countries such as Spain and Catalonia, translators and their associations lobby for the recognition of authorship of their translations, in other countries such as in the Middle East, and more particularly in Iraq, translators prefer to go unnoticed due to the risk involved in rendering such translations. Examples are given on the webpages by Campagna and Sabra (2004), Human Rights Watch (2006) or in the Daily Times (2004), e.g.: “I expect to be killed at any moment. But I have to work to live” or “I’m supporting my husband. We have to feed and clothe our baby”. In Iraq alone, “nine fixers, translators and drivers have been killed in 2004, while at least a dozen others have been threatened, attacked or injured” (Witchel 2004: 6, cited in Venter 2005: 48).


> You want your new translator to understand that he has to play by American rules while he's on the payroll. This is why you want an Arab speaking soldier or Department of Defense civilian to explain this touchy stuff in his native language, to avoid any misunderstanding or unintended insults. There are also religious and ethnic differences in Iraq that could make things dangerous for an Iraqi translator going into the wrong neighborhood. So you have to find out if your applicant can deal with that.

A possible answer is that - given the many fatwa issued in recent years to writers and journalists (which in itself is news content) - the profession has decided to play it safe. When a news item is considered to be a “sensitive” issue translators wish to detach themselves from the content in order not to be held responsible for the translation content (and in the above example for voicing Bin Laden words), although in fact they are only doing their job as professionals as the journalists do also.

### 8 The format of the material

Different formats lend themselves particularly well to the feeling of hyper-reality, such as video-conferencing. By filming a video-conference, the overall sensation is that it is taking place in real time. In the above example of Eduard Punset we have the presenter sitting down in the studio and the interviewee who is clearly not there in person, is projected on a wall.

---

4 StrategyPage gives you rapid access to military news. We report these events as history, not headlines, and provide concise, comprehensive and easy-to-understand descriptions of the troops, their equipment and why wars the world over are being fought.
But to heighten the feeling of reality, an insert is added with the words ‘Videoconferencia desde EEUU (Cornell University)’.

In this case, the format of video conferencing and its simulated reality is enhanced by the use of the insert on the screen. The feeling is that of reality and immediacy: the interview is taking place in real time, even though as already mentioned earlier, we find Punset interpreting himself simultaneously.

9 Conclusions

One of the most salient features of voice-over is that of being associated with non-fiction genres and portraying the feeling of authenticity and faithfulness of the content of translation. As we have seen, voice-over is one more feature to make audiovisual media a construct of reality, which in some extreme cases seems to be more real than reality.
After analyzing the concept of simulacrum and hyperreality, we have imported it to the area of Audiovisual Translation Studies in order to understand and explain how voice-over helps to portray the feeling of reality, and why it has been traditionally associated with it. The study has only discussed European media. It will be much more interesting to understand and learn about the different variants on voice-over from other cultures such as in the Arab countries, Japan, China or India.

10 References


http://www.jostrans.org/issue02/issue02toc.htm


